



**Meeting Minutes**

**Printed : 3/1/2019 4:27 PM MST**

**February 25, 2019 Regular Board Meeting**

**02/25/2019 09:00 AM**

1535 W. Jefferson

Room # 122

Phoenix, AZ 85007

---

## **Arizona State Board of Education**

### **Agenda**

#### **NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, February 25, 2019, at 9:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122**, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007. A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, to consider records exempt by law from public inspection, including the receipt and discussion of information that is required to be maintained as confidential by state or federal law.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 13th day of February, 2019.

Arizona State Board of Education

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams", written over a horizontal line.

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

9:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PRAYER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND ROLL CALL

## **Attendees**

---

### **Voting Members**

Calvin Baker, Board Member  
Dr. Rita Cheng, Board Member - by phone  
Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President - by phone  
Patricia Welborn, Board Member - by phone, entered meeting at 9:12 a.m.  
Jill Broussard, Board Member - by phone  
Christine Burton, Board Member  
Michele Kaye, Board Member  
Janice Mak, Board Member  
Lucas Narducci, President  
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Armando Ruiz, Board Member

---

## **1. BUSINESS REPORTS**

### **A. President's Report**

No report given.

### **B. Superintendent's Report**

Superintendent Hoffman provided updates on the Department's activities, the Empowerment Scholarship Account implementation, and the information technology system.

1. Update on Department Activities
2. Update on Empowerment Scholarship Account Implementation
3. Update on the Department's Information Technology system

### **C. Executive Director's Report**

1. Update on Board staff activities

Executive Director Williams reminded Board members about the upcoming Read Across America event at Starlight Park Elementary.

## **2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Gabriel Bassford, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

## **3. CONSENT AGENDA**

Member Broussard requested to pull item 3B due to a conflict of interest.

Member Burton requested to pull item 3J for discussion.

A motion was made to approve agenda items 3A and 3C-3I.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. Approval of Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds
- B. Approval of the Small School District Capital Transportation Adjustment

It is recommended the Board approve the attached Small School Districts to receive the indicated 2019 state aid and budget capacity due to the Capital Transportation Adjustment for Small School Districts pursuant to 15-963. School Finance unit staff has reviewed all requests and verified that this multiple District request does meet state requirements.

Motion passed 10-0

Member Broussard recused herself from this item due to a conflict of interest.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Recuse  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- C. Approval of the Release of Computer Science Professional Development Program Fund for Eligible Districts
- D. Approval of the Statewide Family Engagement Center Memorandum of Understanding
- E. Approval of the Preschool Development Grant Birth through Five

- F. Approval of the revised Migrant Education Program Funding Formula
- G. Approval of Alliant International University an an alternative educator preparation program provider for elementary and secondary education
- H. Approval of the Student Teaching Intern Written Supervision Plan for Scottsdale Community College
- I. Update on semi-annual progress of Simon Consulting, L.L.C., as receiver for Murphy Elementary School District
- J. REVISED - Approval of the hearing officer's recommendations to deny the appeal for certification for reasons that did not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct of Melita Prins, Case No. 2018-002 - REVISED

A motion was made to table this item until the March board meeting.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
 Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
 Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
 Patricia Welborn - Yes  
 Jill Broussard - Yes  
 Christine Burton - Yes  
 Michele Kaye - Yes  
 Janice Mak - Yes  
 Lucas Narducci - Yes  
 Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
 Armando Ruiz - Yes

#### **4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Amanda Glass, representing the Arizona Center for Disability Law, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Julie Bartanen, representing Special Education Advisory Panel, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

#### **5. GENERAL SESSION**

- A. STUDY SESSION: Presentation and discussion on the 9-12 Accountability System for the 2018-2019 school year

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time.

Wendy Davey, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Sean Rickert, representing the ATAC group, presented information the Board.

Matt Strom, representing the ATAC group, presented information the Board.

Janice Palmer, representing the ATAC group, presented information the Board.

Kelly Powell, representing the ATAC group, presented information the Board.

The Board recessed at 11:20 a.m. and reconvened at 11:31 a.m.

Dr. Cheng and Dr. Corr exited meeting at 11:20 a.m.

- B. Update on rulemaking regarding R7-2-319 State Seal of Personal Finance Proficiency Program

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

- C. Update on rulemaking regarding R7-2-320 State Seal of Civics Literacy Program

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on Arizona Administrative Code Title 7, Chapter 2, Article 13 regarding Unprofessional and Immoral Conduct

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking procedures on Arizona Administrative Code Title 7, Chapter 2, Article 13 regarding Unprofessional and Immoral Conduct.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- E. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures for R7-2-604.03 Alternative Educator Preparation Program Approval Process

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking procedures for R7-2-604.03 Alternative Educator Preparation Program Approval Process.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- F. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

- G. Presentation, discussion and possible action to consider the recommendations from the Evaluation Committee for State-Approved Assessment(s) to Award the Arizona High School Equivalency Diploma. Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, to consider records exempt by law from public inspection, including the receipt and discussion of information that is required to be maintained as confidential by state or federal law.

Member Kaye made a motion, seconded by Member Ruiz to move into executive session.

Motion passed 9-0.

It is recommended that the Arizona State Board of Education approve recommendations from the ADE RFP Evaluation Committee for state-approved assessment(s) to award the Arizona High School Equivalency Diploma.

Motion passed 8-0.

Member Welborn exited the meeting at 12:30 p.m.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present  
Patricia Welborn - Not Present  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- H. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve vendors regarding the request for proposals for the Menu of Assessments. Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, to consider records exempt by law from public inspection, including the receipt and discussion of information that is required to be maintained as confidential by state or federal law.

Motion to approve the third-party evaluators for vendors 1 and 3, take no further action and table the awarding of vendors until further notice.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

## **6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

## **7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

A motion was made to approve all items on the consent agenda.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Jordan Akin, Case no. C-2018-269

- a. Jordan Akin, Case no. C-2018-269 - Supporting Documents
2. Donald Dickinson, Case no. C-2018-729
  - a. Donald Dickinson, Case no. C-2018-729 - Supporting Documents
- B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by Juan Zazueta, C-2018-575
  1. Juan Zazueta, C-2018-575 - Supporting Documents

## **8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Ernesto Madrid, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Bill Holder, representing Sonya Williams-Rowe, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Edumundo Robaina, representing Rebekah Mecham, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

## **9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to issue a letter of censure on the teaching certificate(s) of Rebekah Mecham, Case no. C-2018-122

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to issue a letter of censure on the teaching certificate of Rebekah Mecham, but to add the condition that Ms. Mecham must take a classroom management course and furnish proof of completion to Board staff within 13 months from the date that the motion is approved by the Board.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Kathy Hoffman

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Rebekah Mecham, Case no. C-2018-122 - Supporting Documents
- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory



Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Sonya Williams-Rowe, Case no. C-2016-188, for a period of 2 years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Sonya Williams-Rowe for a period of two years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Sonya Williams-Rowe, Case no. C-2016-188 - Supporting Documents

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification(s) of Ernesto Madrid, Case no. C-2018-602R, for a period of 3 years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to deny the application for certification of Ernesto Madrid, and that he be prohibited from reapplying for certification for a period of three-years.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Ernesto Madrid, Case no. C-2018-602R - Supporting Documents

**10. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Motion for Rehearing regarding educator Ramon Ramirez, Case no C-2018-150**

A motion was made to deny Mr. Ramirez's motion for rehearing, and the Board thereby affirmed its December 17, 2018 decision.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Kathy Hoffman

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Ramon Ramirez, Case no C-2018-150 - Supporting Documents

**11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**

Executive Director Williams asked the Board to begin thinking of potential meeting dates for the Board Retreat in August.

Member Mak shared the news that Common Sense Media opened a regional office in Arizona and they produce education programs for students in K-8.

Superintendent Hoffman asked that the Board consider holding Board meetings in Tucson and Flagstaff.

Meeting adjourned at 1:08 p.m.