



Arizona State Board of Education
Arizona State Board for Vocational and Technological Education

AMENDED Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education, the Arizona State Board for Vocational and Technological Education and to the general public that the Boards will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, April 29th, 2019, at 9:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007.** A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Boards reserve the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Boards may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2), the Boards may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, to consider records exempt by law from public inspection, including the receipt and discussion of information that is required to be maintained as confidential by state or federal law.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Boards may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3) and (4), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public for discussion or consultation for legal advice with the Board's attorneys and/or for discussion or consultation with the Board's attorneys in order to consider its position and instruct its attorneys in pending or contemplated litigation or in settlement discussions conducted in order to avoid or resolve litigation.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 25 day of April, 2019.

Arizona State Board of Education

By: 

Alicia Williams
Executive Director
(602) 542-5057

9:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PRAYER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Calvin Baker, Board Member
Dr. Rita Cheng, Board Member
Patricia Welborn, Board Member
Christine Burton, Board Member
Michele Kaye, Board Member by phone at 10:05 a.m.
Janice Mak, Board Member
Lucas Narducci, President
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

President Narducci informed the Board that he did not have updates to report.

B. Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Hoffman provided the an update on Department activities and recognized Teacher Appreciation Week by acknowledging the 2019 Arizona Arts/Music/Dance/Theater Teachers of the Year.

1. Update on Department Activities

C. Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Williams provided updates on Board staff activities.

1. Update on Board staff activities

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made to approve items 3A-3K from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

A. Approval of Teacher Compensation Monies for Fiscal Year 2019-2020

B. Approval of the Grand Canyon University Special Education educator preparation program leading to educator certification.

C. Approval of the Rio Salado College Special Education educator preparation program leading to educator certification.

D. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver

- E. Approval of the Release of Computer Science Professional Development Program Fund for Eligible Districts
- F. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base
- G. Approval of the list of assessments, programs/curriculum, curricular/extracurricular activities, and college and/or career readiness plan items for rule R7-2-319, State Seal of Personal Finance
- H. Approval of the list of programs, activities, and written reflection content items for rule R7-2-320, State Seal of Civic Literacy Program
- I. Approval of the hearing officer's recommendations to deny the appeal for certification for reasons that do not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct for the following:
 - 1. Stephen Neal, Case No. 2018-001
 - 2. Davlin Edwards, Case No. 2018-003
- J. Approval of the appointment of Vince Yanez to the K-3 Literacy Ad Hoc Committee
- K. Update on semi-annual progress of Simon Consulting, L.L.C., as receiver for Cedar Unified School District No. 25

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Executive Director Williams noted that all comments made electronically were provided to State Board members prior to the Board meeting

Dr. Mark Joraanstad, representing the Arizona School Administrators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Jessica Wani, representing the herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

5. GENERAL SESSION

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to adopt the 5-year Assessment Plan

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

Audra Ahumada, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended the Board adopt the 5-Year Assessment Plan and direct staff and the Arizona Department of Education to begin executing the plan.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to extend and modify the statewide assessment in English language arts and mathematics, currently referred to as AzMERIT

Pending JLBC review, it is recommended the Board extend and modify the statewide assessment contract in English language arts and mathematics as outlined.

Motion made by: Kathy Hoffman

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the request for proposals for Menu of Assessments to decline to make awards in grades 3-8 and close the solicitation. Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, to consider records exempt by law from public inspection, including the receipt and discussion of information that is required to be maintained as confidential by state or federal law.

It is recommended the Board decline to make awards for the request for proposals for the Menu of Assessments in grades three through eight and close the solicitation.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

- D. Presentation and discussion regarding updates to the technical guidance, policies and procedures regarding the high school Menu of Assessments in the 2019-2020 school year
- Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.
- E. Update on rulemaking procedures for R7-2-615 regarding a Computer Science Endorsement
- Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.
- F. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on R7-2-617 regarding the School Counselor Certificate

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking on R7-2-617 regarding the School Counselor Certificate.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

- G. AMENDED - EXECUTIVE SESSION: Discussion and consultation for legal advice with the Board's attorneys regarding Equality Arizona v. Hoffman, No. CV-19-00192-TUC-LAB (D.

Ariz.), in order to consider its position and instruct its attorneys in pending litigation. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3) and (4), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public for discussion or consultation for legal advice with the Board's attorneys and/or for discussion or consultation with the Board's attorneys in order to consider its position and instruct its attorneys in pending or contemplated litigation or in settlement discussions conducted in order to avoid or resolve litigation.

Member Kaye joined the meeting at 10:05 a.m.

The Board convened into Executive Session and exited Executive Session at 10:22 a.m.

A motion was made to approve the Settlement Agreement negotiation with the Plaintiffs in Equality Arizona v. Hoffman, which requires the Board to initiate rulemaking proceedings to repeal Arizona Administrative Code Rule R7-2-303(A)(3)(b)(v)

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Kathy Hoffman

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

- H. AMENDED - Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures for R7-2-303 Sex Education

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking procedures for R7-2-303 Sex Education.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

6. Arizona State Board of Education convening/action as the Arizona State Board for Vocational Technological Education for Item 6A only

The Board convened as the Arizona State Board for Vocational Technological Education.

Cathie Raymond, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

A motion was made to approve the Transition Plan for Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21st Century Act (Perkins V).

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

- A. Approval of the Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21st Century Act (Perkins V) Transition Plan

7. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

8. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve agenda items 8A1-8A5.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

- A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Chet Hinrichs, Case no. C-2017-608
 - a. Chet Hinrichs, Case no. C-2017-608 - Supporting Documents
2. Preston Lasley, Case no. C-2018-462
 - a. Preston Lasley, Case no. C-2018-462 - Supporting Documents
3. Walter Looney, Case no. C-2017-379
 - a. Walter Looney, Case no. C-2017-379 - Supporting Documents
4. Richard Milligan, Case no. C-2017-844
 - a. Richard Milligan, Case no. C-2017-844 - Supporting Documents
5. Mitchell Sibley, Case no. C-2017-634
 - a. Mitchell Sibley, Case no. C-2017-634 - Supporting Documents

9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

David Derkickson, representing Dorothy Lucas, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

10. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

A motion was made to agenda item 10A1-10A5.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

1. Chukwuma Amaechi, Case no. C-2018-675
 - a. Chukwuma Amaechi, Case no. C-2018-675 - Supporting Documents
 2. Michelle Begay, Case no. C-2017-424
 - a. Michelle Begay, Case no. C-2017-424 - Supporting Documents
 3. Analisa Devila, Case no. C-2019-065
 - a. Analisa Devila, Case no. C-2019-065 - Supporting Documents
 4. Dorothy Lucas, Case no. C-2017-820
 - a. Dorothy Lucas, Case no. C-2017-820 - Supporting Documents
 5. Brittany Messina, Case no. C-2018-533R
 - a. Brittany Messina, Case no. C-2018-533R - Supporting Documents
- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Robert Dana, Case no. C-2018-231, for a period of 3 years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Robert Dana for a period of three-years, with the condition that Mr. Dana also take Board-approved ethics course concerning boundary issues between students and teachers before reinstatement, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

1. Robert Dana, Case no. C-2018-231 - Supporting Documents
- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Heather Haynie, Case no. C-2018-123, for a period of 3 years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Heather Haynie for a period of three-years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

1. Heather Haynie Case no. C-2018-123 - Supporting Documents

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of William Mestas, Case no. C-2017-672

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of William Mestas, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

1. William Mestas, Case no. C-2017-672 - Supporting Documents

- E. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Edmundo Salcido, Case no. C-2017-131

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Edmundo Salcido, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes

1. Edmundo Salcido, Case no. C-2017-131 - Supporting Documents

- F. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to approve the application for certification(s) of Holly Youvella, Case no. C-2018-081R

Kathleen Harrington, representing the Attorney General's Office, presented information

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to approve the application for certification of Holly Youvella with the condition that Ms. Youvella attend Alcoholics Anonymous meetings during the periods in which she's certified, and furnish proof of attendance to Board staff.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - No

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - No

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - No

Michele Kaye - No

Janice Mak - No

Lucas Narducci - No

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Motion failed 4-6.

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law of the PPAC and deny the application of Holly Youvella for a period of three years with a condition that prior to reapplication she submit documentation to Board staff of ongoing and continued restitution as well as regular participation in Alcoholics Anonymous.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

1. Holly Youvella, Case no. C-2018-081R - Supporting Documents

11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

President Narducci announced that all future meetings will begin at 10:00 a.m.

Meeting adjourned 11:05 a.m.

Chairperson

Secretary