



Meeting Minutes

Printed : 9/16/2019 12:02 PM MST

August 26, 2019 Regular Board Meeting

08/26/2019 10:00 AM

1535 W. Jefferson

Room # 122

Phoenix, AZ 85007

Arizona State Board of Education

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, August 26, 2019, at 10:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122**, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007. A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2) and (A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection and for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on the agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 15th day of August, 2019.

Arizona State Board of Education

By:

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams", written over a horizontal line.

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PRAYER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Voting Members

Calvin Baker, Board Member by phone
Dr. Rita Cheng, Board Member
Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President
Patricia Welborn, Board Member
Jill Broussard, Board Member
Christine Burton, Board Member
Michele Kaye, Board Member
Janice Mak, Board Member by phone at 10:10 a.m.
Lucas Narducci, President
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Armando Ruiz, Board Member

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

1. Summary of the Board's Retreat

Vice President Corr provided a summary of the Board's retreat.

B. Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Hoffman provided updates on Department activities, she also highlighted Department staff.

1. Updates
2. ADE Staff Member Recognition
3. Educator Recognition

C. Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Williams provided an updated regarding Arizona Online Instruction Applications.

1. Arizona Online Instruction Application Window for the 2020-2021 School Year

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Steven Ugol, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Angie Russo, representing Purple for Parents, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Piper Searfoss, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Catherine A. Barrett, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and her statement was read by Angie Russo

Representative Kelly Townsend, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Karye Perez, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Scott Weinberg, representing Purple for Parents, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Forest Moriarty, representing Purple for Parents, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Steve Weinberg, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but was not present to address the Board

Bethanne Hathcock, representing Purple for Parents, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

3. CONSENT AGENDA

Member Baker pulled item 3A for discussion.

Member Welborn pulled item 3I for discussion.

A motion was made to approve items 3B - 3H, and 3J-3O from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of Industry Credentials for College and Career Ready Index

It is recommended that the Board approve the new industry certifications and credentials to be added to the College and Career Ready Index list of approved credentials.

Motion passed 10-1.

Motion made by: Kathy Hoffman

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - No
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- B. Approval of the Governor's Industry Credential Incentive Fund List of Approved Credentials for 2018-2019 and 2019-2020 Cohort Graduates
- C. Approval of Structured English Immersion (SEI) Course Provider
- D. Approval of the Arizona Department of Education's acceptance of the Salt River Project (SRP) Community Outreach Grant
- E. Approval of the Release of Early Literacy Grant Funds for eligible schools
- F. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds
- G. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver
- H. Approval of the Special Education Advisory Panel's (SEAP) proposed new member
- I. Approval of 21st Century Community Learning Center Cycle 15 competitive grant awards

Member Welborn pulled item due to a Conflict of Interest.

It is recommended that the Board approve the contracts between the State Board of Education and the Lead Education Agencies awarded the 21st CCLC funding as described.

Motion passed 10-0

Motion made by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Recuse
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- J. Approval of the expenditure of the Fiscal Year 2019 Consolidated Appropriations Act, 2019 - National School Lunch Equipment Assistance Grant funds
- K. Approval of the hearing officer's recommendations to dismiss the appeal for certification for reasons that do not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct for David McNeil, Case No. 2019-006
- L. Denial of Teach Away as an alternative educator preparation program for elementary and secondary education
- M. Update on semi-annual progress of Simon Consulting, L.L.C., as receiver for Murphy Elementary School District
- N. Consideration to determine that Bowie Unified School District No. 14 is in compliance with the Uniform System of Financial Records, and that previously withheld monies that resulted from the determination of noncompliance be returned to the district in the current year
- O. Approval to modify the structure of the Accountability Technical Advisory Committee (ATAC) and appoint Maja Aleksic to ATAC

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Catherine Foley (Rusty), representing Arizona Citizens for the Arts, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Becky Vogel, representing Round Table Action Committee, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Dr. Mark Joraanstad, representing ASA, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Jessica Catlett, representing Moms Demand Action, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Geoff Esposito, representing AZ SCA, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Onida Perkell, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

5. GENERAL SESSION

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the proposed timeline and early admission criteria for the School Safety Program new FY 2020 competitive application

Callie Kozlak, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board approve the Arizona Department of Education's proposed plan to allocate the additional funding for FY 2020.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- B. Presentation and discussion regarding the timeline for the release of 2018-2019 A-F Letter Grades

Wendy Davy, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action for the Infant Toddler Developmental Guidelines to be opened for public comment

Dr. Heather Cruz, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board approve the opening of the 2019 Infant Toddler Developmental Guidelines for public comment until September 30, 2019.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures on R7-2-306, English Language Learner Programs

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking procedures on R7-2-306 English Language Learner Programs.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- E. Presentation, discussion, and possible action to open rulemaking procedures for proposed rule R7-2- 321 regarding the State Seal of Arts Proficiency Program

It is recommended that the Board open rulemaking procedures on R7-2-321, State Seal of Arts Proficiency Program.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- F. Update on rulemaking procedures on Article 10 and Article 11, School District Procurement

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time

- G. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the FY21 State Board of Education budget

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the State Board of Education approve the FY21 budget request as presented.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- H. EXECUTIVE SESSION - Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection. Approval of Recommended Vendor for Multi-State Alternate Assessment (MSAA)

Member Burton made a motion, seconded by Dr. Corr, to move into to Executive Session. Motion passed.

The Board met in Executive Session at 11:54 a.m. and reconvened at 12:10 p.m.

It is recommended that the Board approve ADE and the MSAA State's recommendation for the selected vendor for the MSAA as presented.

The Board recessed at 12:12 p.m. and reconvened at 12:37 p.m.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 7A1-7, 7B, 7C, and 7D1-3.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Not Present
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Angela Brechler, Case no. C-2017-573
 - a. Angela Brechler, Case no. C-2017-573 - Supporting Documents
2. Hank Diaz, Case no. C-2019-229
 - a. Hank Diaz, Case no C-2019-229 - Supporting Document
3. Jennell Donaldson, Case no. C-2019-114
 - a. Jennell Donaldson, Case no. C-2019-114 - Supporting Documents
4. Ryan Prassas, Case no. C-2018-213
 - a. Ryan Prassas, Case no. C-2018-213 - Supporting Documents
5. Rosario Vargas, Case no. C-2018-471
 - a. Rosario Vargas, Case no. C-2018-471 - Supporting Documents
6. Carson Miller, Case no. C-2018-404
 - a. Carson Miller, Case no. C2018-404 - Supporting documents
7. Mary Sievert, Case no. C-2019-218
 - a. Mary Sievert, Case no. C-2019-218 - Supporting Documents

B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:

1. Brittany Zamora, Case no. C-2018-189
 - a. Brittany Zamora, Case no. C-2018-189 - Supporting Documents

C. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-534.04(C)

1. Michelina Aichele, Case no. C-2018-643
 - a. Michelina Aichelle, Case no. C-2018-643 - Supporting Documents

D. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1307(A), held by:

1. Travis S. Russell, Case no. C-2019-343
 - a. Travis S. Russell, Case no. C-2019-343- Supporting Documents

2. Michelle Ramirez, Case no. C-2017-607
 - a. Michelle Ramirez, Case no. C-2017-607-Supporting Documents
3. Ryan Reidhead, Case no. C-2018-417
 - a. Ryan Reidhead, Case no. C-2018-417-Supporting Documents

8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Larry Cohen, representing Jennifer Bos, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 9A1-8.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Not Present

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Ernesto Arvayo-Ortiz, Case no. C-2017-361
 - a. Ernesto Arvayo-Ortiz, Case no. C-2017-361 - Supporting Documents
2. Rosemary Marron, Case no. C-2018-815
 - a. Rosemary Marron, Case no. C-2018-815-Supporting Documents
3. Veronica Carmell Morales, Case no. C-2017-594
 - a. Veronica Carmell Morales, Case no. C-2017-594-Supporting Documents
4. Thomas O'Shea, Case no. C-2018-127
 - a. Thomas O'Shea, Case no. C-2018-127-Supporting Documents
5. Stephen Perry, Case no. C-2019-039R
 - a. Stephen Perry, Case no. C-2019-039R- Supporting Documents

6. Bradley Jamison, Case no. C-2018-362

a. Bradley Jamison, Case no. C-2018-362-Supporting Documents

7. George Cruz, Case no. C-2019-322R

a. George Cruz, Case no. C-2019-322R - Supporting Documents

8. Ashlynn Thompson, Case no. C-2018-548

a. Ashlynn Thompson, Case no. C-2018-548 - Supporting Documents

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Elizabeth Henrikson , Case no. C-2018-270, for a period of one year

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC and suspend the teaching certificate of Elizabeth Henrikson, for a period of one year, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Armando Ruiz

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Not Present

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Elizabeth Henrikson, Case no. C-2018-270 - Supporting Documents

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Jennifer Bos, Case no. C-2017-243

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Finding of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC, and revoke the teaching certificates(s) of Jennifer Bos, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Not Present

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Jennifer Bos, Case no. C-2017-243 - Supporting Documents

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Tina Johnson, Case no. C-2017-391, for a period of 1 year

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC and suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Tina Johnson for a period of one year, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Not Present
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Tina Johnson, Case no. C-2017-391-Supporting Documents

- E. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Chastity Johnston, Case no. C-2017-027

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Chastity Johnston , and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Not Present
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Chastity Johnston, Case no. C-2017-027-Supporting Documents

- F. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to Suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Vernica Kirkland, Case no. C-2019-134, for a two years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to suspend the teaching certificate of Vernica Kirkland, for a period of two years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Armando Ruiz

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Not Present
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Vernica Kirkland, Case no. C-2019-134 - Supporting Documents

- G. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification of Rocky Loveless, Case no. C-2018-722R, for a period of 5 years and revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Rocky Loveless, Case no C-2018-722)

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to deny the application for certification for Rocky Loveless, for a period of five years and revoke the teaching certificate of Rocky Loveless, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Not Present
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Rocky Loveless, Case no. C-2018-722R & C-2018-722 - Supporting Documents

- H. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification(s) of Nicole Hayes, Case no. C-2018-187R, for a period of five years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC and deny the application for certification of Nicole Hayes, for a period of five years and that all states and territories be notified.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Not Present

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Nicole Hayes, Case no. C-2018-187R - Supporting Documents

10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Executive Director presented information to the Board regarding Study Session with WestEd.

Meeting adjourned at 12:55 p.m.