



Meeting Minutes

Printed : 9/26/2019 2:08 PM MST

September 23, 2019 Regular Board Meeting

09/23/2019 10:00 AM

1535 W. Jefferson

Room # 122

Phoenix, AZ 85007

Arizona State Board of Education
Arizona State Board for Vocational and
Technological Education

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education, the Arizona State Board for Vocational and Technological Education and to the general public that the Boards will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, September 23, 2019, at 10:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007.** A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Boards reserve the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Boards may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Boards may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 12th day of September, 2019.

Arizona State Board of Education

By: 

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PRAYER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Voting Members

Calvin Baker, Board Member
Dr. Rita Cheng, Board Member by phone
Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President
Patricia Welborn, Board Member
Jill Broussard, Board Member entered meeting at 10:07 a.m.
Christine Burton, Board Member
Michele Kaye, Board Member
Janice Mak, Board Member
Lucas Narducci, President by phone
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Armando Ruiz, Board Member

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

President Narducci informed the Board that he did not have updates to report.

1. Update on Board Activities

B. Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Hoffman recognized the following teachers: Lynnea Bahm, Kim Thomas, Melissa Wendell, Pandora Linnartz, and Christine Mendoza. The Superintendent concluded by highlight the Suicide Prevention Awareness proclamation.

1. Recognition of the Arizona teachers that were named 2019 Presidential Awardees for Excellence in Math and Science Teaching

a. Presidential Award for Excellence in Mathematics Teaching, Finalists for 2019: Lynnea Bahm and Kimberely Thomas and Melissa Wendell

b. Presidential Award for Excellence in Secondary Science Teaching Finalists for 2019: Pandora Linnartz and Christine Mendoza

2. Proclamation about Suicide Prevention Awareness

C. Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Williams provided updates on Board staff activities and on Educator Discipline Improvements.

1. Update on Board Staff Activities

2. Update on Educator Discipline Improvements - Statutory and Board Actions

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Amulya Bhaskara, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Linda Williamson, representing Moms Demand Action, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Braden Biggs, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

3. CONSENT AGENDA

Member Burton pulled item 3A for discussion.

Member Welborn pulled item 3B for discussion.

A motion was made to approve items 3C - 3G from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of Athletic Coaching Training

It is recommended that the Board approve the National Federation of State High School Associations seminars or modules of study in the areas described in Board rule R7-2-614(H) (b) to meet the requirements for the Athletic Coaching certificate.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

B. Approval of additional allocations to Local Adult Education Providers

It is recommended that the Board approve the additional allocation funding contract between the State Board of Education, acting for and on behalf of the Department of Education, and approved Local Providers of Adult Education as listed in the attached Supporting Document, *Chart of Additional Allocations to Local Providers & Additional Information*. Additional allocation funding contract amount not to exceed \$20,000.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- C. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans
- D. Approval of the University of Phoenix Educational Leadership educator preparation program leading to educator certification
- E. Approval of modifications to the structure of the K-3 Literacy Ad Hoc Committee
- F. UPDATED - Approval of appointments to the Professional Practices Advisory Committee
- G. Approval of delegate appointment to the National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE)

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

5. GENERAL SESSION

- A. UPDATED - Presentation and discussion regarding accountability cut scores for the 2018-2019 school year

Wendy Davy, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

- B. Presentation and discussion of progress towards implementation of the Board-adopted Five Year Statewide Assessment Plan

Audra Ahumada, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to update Board Policy No. 002 Assessment Values

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

It is recommended the Board update Board Policy No. 002 Assessment Values as presented.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

D. UPDATED - Presentation and discussion of the Arizona English Learner (EL) Frameworks

The Board recessed at 11:24 a.m. and reconvened at 11:35 a.m.

Kate Wright, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Dr. Molly Faulkner-Bond, representing WestEd, presented information to the Board.

Jennifer Blitz, representing WestEd, presented information to the Board.

E. UPDATED - Presentation and discussion on accountability work including component scoring, district letter grades and the 2019-2020 Accountability System

Wendy Davy, representing Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

F. Presentation, discussion, and possible action to open rulemaking procedures for proposed amendments to Board rule A.A.C. R7-2-604 regarding Educator Preparation Program Definitions

It is recommended that the Board approve initiating rulemaking procedures regarding proposed amendments to Board rule R7-2-604, Educator Preparation Program Definitions.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

G. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Title 7, Article 13, Conduct

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking procedures A.A.C. Title 7, Article 13, Conduct.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- H. Update on rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Title 7, Articles 10 and 11, School District Procurement

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time

- I. Update on rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-306, English Language Learner Programs

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time.

- J. Update on rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-321 regarding the State Seal of Arts Proficiency Program

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time.

Deputy Director Baden informed the Board that comments were received from five students from the Arizona School for the Arts in support of the seal.

6. Arizona State Board of Education convening/acting as the Arizona State Board for Vocational and Technological Education for Items 6A and 6B

The Arizona State Board of Education convened as the Vocational and Technological Education Board for agenda item 6A and 6B only.

- A. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion and possible action to open for public comment the Perkins V State Plan Narrative

Cathie Raymond, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board approve opening the Perkins V State Plan narrative for public comment for at least 30 days beginning September 30, 2019.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open for public comment the Perkins V State Determined Levels of Performance

It is recommended that the Board approve opening the Perkins V State Plan State Determined Levels of Performance for public comment for 60 days beginning on September 30, 2019.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

7. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

8. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 8A1-8A9, 8B1-8B5, 8C1-8C5.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Caryn Blaszcak, Case no. C-2017-676
 - a. Caryn Blaszcak, Case no. C-2017-676 - Supporting Documents
2. Paul Bohardt, Case no. C-2018-556
 - a. Paul Bohardt, Case no. C-2018-556 - Supporting Documents
3. Bianca Navarro, Case no. C-2019-533
 - a. Bianca Navarro, Case no. C-2019-533 - Supporting Documents
4. Richard Crain, Case no. C-2019-327
 - a. Richard Crain, Case no. C-2019-327 - Supporting Documents
5. Kolby Granville, Case no. C-2018-106
 - a. Kolby Granville, Case no. C-2018-106 - Supporting Documents
6. Eric James, Case no. C-2019-047
 - a. Eric James, Case no. C-2019-047 - Supporting Documents
7. Jeffery Locey, Case no. C-2018-463
 - a. Jeffery Locey, Case no. C-2018-463 - Supporting Documents

8. Daniel Lockett, Case no. C-2016-118
 - a. Daniel Lockett, Case no. C-2016-118 - Supporting Documents
9. Devin Ramsey, Case no. C-2018-436
 - a. Devin Ramsey, Case no. C-2018-436 - Supporting Documents
- B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:
 1. Gerald Holley, Case no. C-2019-461
 - a. Gerald Holley, Case no. C-2019-461 - Supporting Documents
 2. Kevin Chamberlain, Case no. C-2019-490
 - a. Kevin Chamberlain, Case no. C-2019-490 - Supportive Documents
 3. Robert Kelsey, Case no. C-2018-057
 - a. Robert Kelsey, Case no. C-2018-057 - Supporting Documents
 4. Larry Nicholls, Case no. C-2019-307
 - a. Larry Nicholls, Case no. C-2019-307 - Supporting Documents
 5. Jermaine Waddy, Case no. C-2019-689-2
 - a. Jermaine Waddy, Case no. C-2019-689-2 - Supporting Documents
- C. Approval of the reciprocal discipline of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. 15.534.04 held by:
 1. Douglas DeWoody, Case no. C-2017-802
 - a. Douglas DeWoody, Case no. C-2017-802 - Supporting documents
 2. Patrick Granger, Case no. C-2019-422
 - a. Patrick Granger, Case no. C-2019-422-Supporting Documents
 3. Chris J. Holub, Case no. C-2019-421
 - a. Chris J. Holub, Case no. C-2019-421 - Supporting Documents
 4. Nicole Lyn Minerrose (Chapman), Case no. C-2019-407
 - a. Nicole Lyn Minerrose (Chapman), Case no. C-2019-407 - Supporting Documents
 5. Cory Ryan, Case no. C-2019-408
 - a. Cory Ryan, Case no. C-2019-408 - Supporting Documents

9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

James Gustafson, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but was not present and did not address the Board.

Bill Holder, representing Julie Humble, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

10. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

Member Broussard pulled item 10A3 for discussion.

A motion was made to approve items 10A1, 10A2, and 10A4.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Jon W. Alfred, Case no. C-2019-297-R
 - a. Jon W. Alfred, Case no. C-2019-297-R- Supporting Documents
2. James Gustafson, Case no. C-2019-350-R
 - a. James Gustafson, Case no. C-2019-350-R- Supporting Documents
3. Julie Humble, Case no. C-2018-129

It is recommended that the State Board of Education deny the Negotiated Settlement Agreement and that Board Staff work on schedule Ms. Humble for a PPAC hearing.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- a. Julie Humble, Case no. C-2018-129- Supporting Documents
4. Andrea Williams, Case no. C-2018-642
 - a. Andrea Williams, Case no. C-2018-642 - Supporting Documents

B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee for:

1. Richard Bonet, Case no. C-2018-337

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Richard Bonet , and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Richard Bonet, Case no. C-2018-337 - Supporting Documents

2. Michael O'Boyle, Case no. C-2018-230

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Michael O'Boyle , and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Michael O'Boyle, Case no. C-2018-230 - Supporting Documents

3. Debra Schmidt, Case no. C-2017-045

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Debra Schmidt , and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Debra Schmidt, Case no. C-2017-045 - Supporting Documents

4. Angela Sanders, Case no. C-2018-790

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Angela Sanders, for a period of two years, and completion of an alcohol prevention course approved by Board Staff, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Angela Sanders, Case no. C-2018-790 - Supporting Documents

11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Vice-president Corr reminded everyone that Board would hold a Study Session meeting after lunch, which would be presented by the Arizona Department of Education. He also informed the Board that the Executive Committee session would be postponed until the October Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 1:10 p.m.