



Meeting Minutes

Printed : 12/23/2019 8:34 AM MST

December 13, 2019 Regular Board Meeting

12/13/2019 10:00 AM

1535 W. Jefferson

Room # 122

Phoenix, AZ 85007

Arizona State Board of Education

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Friday, December 13, 2019, at 10:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007.** A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 29th day of November, 2019.

Arizona State Board of Education

By:

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams", written over a horizontal line.

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PRAYER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Calvin Baker, Board Member
Patricia Welborn, Board Member
Jill Broussard, Board Member
Christine Burton, Board Member
Michele Kaye, Board Member
Lucas Narducci, President
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction. by phone
Armando Ruiz, Board Member, by phone
Janice Mak, Board Member, by phone, entered meeting at 1:00 p.m.

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

1. Appointment of the Nominating Committee pursuant to R7-2-101(A)(5) to prepare a slate of candidates for elected officers for presentation to the Arizona State Board of Education

President Narducci appointed Member Burton, Member Kaye, and Member Ruiz to the Nominating Committee and directed the committee members to prepare a slate of candidates ahead of the January 27, 2020 Board meeting where the Board will vote on leadership at that meeting.

B. Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Hoffman reviewed her recent visits to schools in Graham County, Greenlee County, and the San Carlos Apache Tribe. Superintendent Hoffman introduced student advisors from the newly formed Student Advisory Council. Blanca Breton, a student from Douglas High School, Sophia Rosa, a student from Colonel Smith Middle School, and Tyler Puttayama, a student from Washington School, presented information from the Student Advisory Council.

1. Department of Education Updates
2. ADE Staff Recognition

C. Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Williams provided updates on the discipline database development, legislative session for educator discipline, and stakeholder meetings on educator discipline. Executive Director Williams provided a reminder of the location for the January Board meeting in Yuma, AZ, on the Arizona Western College campus.

1. Update on Educator Discipline
2. Update on the January 2020 State Board of Education meeting location

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Steven Ugol, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Superintendent Dr. Deborah Dennison, representing San Carlos Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Stacey Morley, representing Stand for Children, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

Member Welborn recused herself from voting on item 3C for conflict of interest.

Member Kaye and Member Welborn recused themselves from voting on item 3E for conflict of interest.

A motion was made to approve items 3A, 3B, 3D, and 3F-3J from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Not Present

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. Approval of the Prescott College Counseling educator preparation program leading to educator certification
- B. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver
- C. Approval of 21st Century Community Learning Center Cycle 15 Title IV B Additional Grant Awards

It is recommended that the Board approve the award contracts between the State Board of Education and the awarded Local Education Agencies 21st CCLC funding listed in Table A and as described in these materials.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Recuse

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Not Present

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- D. UPDATED - Approval of the EL Framework for Research-Based Language Instructional Programs - UPDATED
- E. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds

It is recommended that the Board approve the attached list of approved Move On When Reading LEA literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds, as listed in this item.

Motion passed 6-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard
Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Recuse
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Recuse
Janice Mak - Not Present
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- F. Approval of Career and Technical Education (CTE) Industry Credential Updates
- G. Approval of the Arizona Department of Education School Finance FY20 Capital Small School Transportation Adjustments
- H. Approval of the hearing officer's recommendation to deny the appeal for certification for reasons that do not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct for Taylor Raymond, Case No. 007
- I. Approval of appointments to the Certification Advisory Committee
- J. Approval of Teach Away as an elementary and secondary Alternative Educator Preparation Program

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Mari Jo Mulligan, representing Thunderbolt Middle School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Superintendent Diana Asseier, representing Lake Havasu Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Robert Carlisle, representing Mesa Public Schools, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Emily Niu, representing Salt River High School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Elizabeth Cole, representing Opportunities for Youth, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Ricardo Duran, representing Opportunities for Youth, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Alyssa Kay Lemons, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and

addressed the Board.

Patricia Christie, representing Rhodes Junior High School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Deputy Superintendent Andi Furlis, representing Mesa Public Schools, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

5. GENERAL SESSION

A. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion and approval of the FY 2020 School Safety Program Grant Awards - UPDATED

Callie Kozlak, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Member Kaye recused herself from voting on the entirety of this item - school counselors, social workers, and social resource officers - for conflict of interest.

Member Welborn recused herself from voting on social workers and school resource officers for conflict of interest.

Member Baker recused himself from voting on school counselors for conflict of interest.

A motion was made to approve the FY 2020 School Safety Program grant awards as presented for school counselors by Member Broussard, seconded by Member Burton. Motion passed 6-0.

A motion was made to approve the FY 2020 School Safety Program grant awards as presented for social workers by Member Broussard, seconded by Member Burton. Motion passed 6-0.

A motion was made to approve the FY 2020 School Safety Program grant awards as presented for school resource officers by member Burton, seconded by Member Broussard. Motion passed 6-0.

B. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding 2018-2019 A-F Accountability Appeals - UPDATED

Executive Director presented information to the Board.

Member Kaye recused herself from voting on Appeals #26, #56, #83, and #95 for conflict of interest.

Member Ruiz recused himself from voting on Appeals #2 and #59 for conflict of interest.

A motion was made to approve the A-F Appeals Committee's recommendations, rationales and conditions as provided for Appeals #1, #3-25, #27-55, #57-58, #60-82, #84-94, and #96-99 by Member Baker, seconded by Member Burton. Motion passed 8-0.

A motion was made to approve the A-F Appeals Committee's recommendations, rationales and conditions as provided for Appeals #26, #56, #83, and #95 by Member Baker, seconded by Member Welborn. Motion passed 7-0.

A motion was made to approve the A-F Appeals Committee's recommendations, rationales and conditions as provided for Appeals #2 and #59 by Member Kaye, seconded by Member Welborn. Motion passed 7-0.

- C. Presentation and discussion of research and auditing conducted by the Arizona Department of Education regarding the A-F Accountability College and Career Ready Index

Wendy Davy, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time.

The Board recessed at 11:34 a.m. and reconvened at 11:45 a.m.

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the 2019-2020 A-F Accountability System

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

Wendy Davy, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended the Board direct staff to release a survey on the options discussed in preparation for potential adoption at the January 27 Board Meeting.

Motion passed 8-0.

The Board recessed at 12:30 pm. and reconvened at 12:47 p.m.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Not Present

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- E. Presentation, discussion and possible action to determine noncompliance by Elfrida Elementary School District with the Uniform System of Financial Records and to withhold state funds pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-272(B)

Victoria Bergin, representing the Arizona Attorney General's Office as representation for the Arizona State Board of Education, presentation information to the Board.

It is recommended that, based on the Auditor General's reviews, the Board determine that Elfrida Elementary School District is out of compliance with the USFR for the fiscal year ending 2018 and move to direct the Superintendent of Public Instruction to withhold 3% of the District's state aid until the Auditor General reports that the District is in compliance with the USFR.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Not Present
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- F. Presentation, discussion and possible action to determine noncompliance by Morenci Unified School District with the Uniform System of Financial Records and to withhold state funds pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-272(B)

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that, based on the Auditor General's reviews, the Board determine that Morenci Unified School District is out of compliance with the USFR for fiscal years ending June 30, 2017 and June 30, 2018 but to table any action pending the results of the Auditor General's status review.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Not Present
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- G. Update on rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-619, Renewal Requirements

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time.

- H. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-615.01 Special Education Endorsement - UPDATED

It is recommended that the Board open rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-615.01 Special Education Endorsement.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Not Present
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- I. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Title 7, Article 13, Conduct

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Title 7, Article 13, Conduct

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Not Present

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- J. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-604 Educator Preparation Program Definitions

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-604 Educator Preparation Program Definitions.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Not Present

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- K. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-306, English Language Learner Programs

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-306, English Language Learner Programs.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Not Present

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- L. EXECUTIVE SESSION - Approval of the Scope of Work for Statewide ELA and Mathematics Summative Assessment for Grades 3-8 and High School. Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Member Welborn made a motion, seconded by Member Broussard, to move into to Executive Session. Motion passed 8-0.

The Board met in Executive Session at 1:00 p.m. and reconvened at 1:10 p.m.

Member Mak joined the meeting at 1:00 p.m. in Executive Session.

A motion was made to approve the Scope of Work, with input from stakeholders, and direct the Department of Education to release a request for proposals (RFP) by the end of December 2019 by Member Broussard, seconded by Member Welborn.

Motion passed 9-0.

Superintendent Hoffman and Member Ruiz exited the meeting at 1:15 p.m.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made earlier in the meeting to approve item 7A13 by Member Welborn, seconded by Baker. Member Kaye recused herself. Motion passed 7-0.

A motion was made to approve items 7A1-7A12 and 7B.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Not Present

- A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Lynn Collins, Case no. C-2019-277

- a. Lynn Collins, Case no. C-2019-277 - Supporting Documents
 2. Loren Foley, Case no. C-2018-801
 - a. Loren Foley, Case no. C-2018-801 - Supporting Documents
 3. Stephanie Gjerde, Case no. C-2018-828
 - a. Stephanie Gjerde, Case no. C-2018-828 - Supporting Documents
 4. Jason Graczyk, Case no. C-2018-147
 - a. Jason Graczyk, Case no. C-2018-147 - Supporting Documents
 5. Aarin Klovenas, Case no. C-2018-286
 - a. Aarin Klovenas, Case no. C-2018-286 - Supporting Documents
 6. Laura Oropeza, Case no. C-2019-177
 - a. Laura Oropeza, Case no. C-2019-177 - Supporting Documents
 7. Todd Pitts, Case no. C-2017-188
 - a. Todd Pitts, Case no. C-2017-188 - Supporting Documents
 8. Michael Sember, Case no. C-2016-418
 - a. Michael Sember, Case no. C-2016-418 - Supporting Documents
 9. Dion Shteir, Case no. C-2017-002
 - a. Dion Shteir, Case no. C-2017-002 - Supporting Documents
 10. Daniel Tenney, Case no. C-2018-397
 - a. Daniel Tenney, Case no. C-2018-397 - Supporting Documents
 11. Eric Thompson, Case no. C-2019-135
 - a. Eric Thompson, Case no. C-2019-135 - Supporting Documents
 12. John Titensor, Case no. C-2019-211
 - a. John Titensor, Case no. C-2019-211 - Supporting Documents
 13. David Troyer, Case no. C-2019-459
 - a. David Troyer, Case no. C-2019-459 - Supporting Documents
- B. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1307(A), held by:
1. Nathan S. Morales, Case no. C-2019-016
 - a. Nathan Morales, Case no. C-2019-016 - Supporting Documents

8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Amy Fraser, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Robert Jarvis, representing Amy Fraser, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 9A1-9A6.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Not Present

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:
1. Laurel Baca, Case no. C-2017-619
 - a. Laurel Baca, Case no. C-2017-619 - Supporting Documents
 2. Erika Derma, Case no. C-2019-352
 - a. Erika Derma, Case no. C-2019-352 - Supporting Documents
 3. Jeremy Dittrich, Case no. C-2019-178
 - a. Jeremy Dittrich, Case no. C-2019-178 - Supporting Documents
 4. Dennis Foster, Case no. C-2016-512
 - a. Dennis Foster, Case no. C-2016-512 - Supporting Documents
 5. Amy K. Fraser, Case no. C-2015-102
 - a. Amy K. Fraser, Case no. C-2015-102 - Supporting Documents
 6. David Winkle, Case no. C-2019-563 & C-2019-563-2R
 - a. David Winkle, Case no. C-2019-563 & C-2019-563-2R - Supporting Documents
- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend any and all certificates of Peter Cheesebrough, Case no. C-2017-750, for a period of one year

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Finding of Fact, Conclusions of Law and reject the Recommendation of the PPAC, and revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Peter Cheesebrough, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Not Present

1. Peter Cheesebrough, C-2017-750 - Supporting Documents

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to approve the application for certification(s) of Krysta Nope, Case no. C-2019-150-R

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Finding of Fact, Conclusions of Law and reject the Recommendation of the PPAC, and deny the application for certification for Krysta Nope, for a period of two years.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Not Present

1. Krysta Nope, Case no. C-2019-150-R - Supporting Documents

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Motion for Rehearing regarding educator Jennifer Bos, Case No. 2017-243

Larry Cohen, representing Jennifer Bos, presented information to the Board.

Kathleen Harrington, representing the State Board of Education in this matter, presented information to the Board.

The Board may affirm its decision and deny Jennifer Bos's motion for rehearing by reason of her failure to establish any basis under Board rule R7-2-709(B) to merit a rehearing in the matter.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Not Present

1. Jennifer Bos, Case No. 2017-243 - Supporting Documents

10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Executive Director Williams addressed the Board with additional information for the January 2020 Board meeting being held in Yuma, AZ.

Meeting adjourned 1:47p.m.

Chairperson

Secretary