



Meeting Minutes

Printed : 2/28/2020 8:14 AM MST

January 27, 2020 Regular Board Meeting

01/27/2020 10:00 AM

2020 S Ave 8 E

Schoening Conference Center, South Wing,

Yuma, AZ 85365

Arizona State Board of Education

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, January 27, 2019, at 10:00 A.M. at 2020 S Ave 8 E, Schoening Conference Center, South Wing, Yuma, AZ 85365**. A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 16th day of January, 2020.

Arizona State Board of Education

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams", written over a horizontal line.

By:

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Calvin Baker, Board Member
Patricia Welborn, Board Member
Jill Broussard, Board Member, by phone
Christine Burton, Board Member
Michele Kaye, Board Member, by phone
Lucas Narducci, President
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction, by phone
Armando Ruiz, Board Member
Janice Mak, Board Member

1. Presentation of Candidates and Election of State Board of Education Officers for 2020

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

The Board voted to elect Lucas Narducci as Board President and Dr. Daniel Corr as Vice President by unanimous vote of 10-0.

2. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

President Narducci and Vice President Dr. Corr welcomed the Board to Yuma.

1. Recognition of Roosevelt Elementary School in the Yuma Elementary School District for their Achievement in Early Literacy

Terri Clark, representing Read On Arizona in collaboration with the State Board of Education and Department of Education, presented the case study "Decoding What Works" for Roosevelt Elementary School. Roosevelt Elementary School was presented with an Apple award in recognition of their successes in early literacy gains.

B. Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Hoffman recognized Principal Omar Duron, from Southwest Junior High School. Superintendent Hoffman reported that she would be delivering her State of Education speech to the House Education Committee on February 3rd.

1. Update on Department Activities

C. Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Williams had no updates.

1. Updates on Educator Discipline Data

Research and Data Analyst Jessica Mueller presented information to the Board.

3. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Fatima Covarrubia, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Margot Soto-Chevira, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

4. CONSENT AGENDA

Member Welborn recused herself from voting on Item 4AC.

A motion was made to approve items 4A-4B, 4D-4F from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. UPDATED - Approval of Research-Based Structured English Immersion and Alternative Models of English Instruction - UPDATED
- B. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base
- C. Approval of the Arizona Charter Schools Program Request to Approve Subgrantees

A motion was made to approve Item 4C from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Recuse

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- D. Approval of the Inclusive Classroom Profile Renewal Grant
- E. Approval of appointment to the Certification Advisory Committee
- F. Receipt of the Special Education Advisory Panel (SEAP) Annual Report (2018-2019)

5. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

6. GENERAL SESSION

- A. UPDATED-Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the 2019-2020 and the 2020-2021 A-F Accountability System for traditional schools and alternative schools-UPDATED

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

Wendy Davy, representing the Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Member Kaye left the meeting at 10:31 a.m.

A motion was made to approve the changes to the 9-12 Alternative Accountability system, for school years 2019-2020 and 2020-2021, to include:

- Lowering the total points needed to receive a letter grade to 50 total points.
- Adding Community College and Trade school enrollment to the post-secondary bucket of the CCRI rubric, while keeping the points awarded in the bucket to 1.

by Member Baker, seconded by Member Mak. Motion passed 9-0.

A motion was made to approve Option B (Award 2.5 points to schools who increase the percent of highly proficient (performance level 4) 8th grade math students from the prior year to the current year and 2.5 points to schools who decrease the percent of minimally proficient (performance level 1) 8th grade math students from the prior year to the current) for the Acceleration Readiness Indicator for the K-8 Accountability system for the 2019-2020 and 2020-2021 school years, and bring thresholds to the next Board meeting, by Member Mak, seconded by Member Welborn. Motion passed 9-0.

A motion was made to approve Option B (Move to a Student Growth Percentile (SGP) model of growth, utilizing the 8th grade assessment and comparing to the new 10th grade assessment) for the Growth Indicator for the 9-12 Accountability system for the 2019-2020 and 2020-2021 school years, by Member Baker, seconded by Member Mak. Motion passed 8-1. Member Welborn voted no and explained her vote.

A motion was made to table the discussion and possible action for Special Education Bonus Points for both the K-8 and 9-12 accountability models until the next Board meeting, by Member Welborn, seconded by Member Baker. Motion passed 8-0. Superintendent Hoffman exited the meeting prior to the vote at 11:34 a.m.

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the Accountability System for Arizona Online Instruction (AOI)

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

The Board recessed at 11:35 a.m. and reconvened at 11:45 a.m.

Member Ruiz entered the meeting at 11:48 a.m.

It is recommended the Board release a survey on the draft AOI Accountability Plan.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures A.A.C. R7-2-604.03, Alternative Educator Preparation Program Approval Process

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-604.03, Alternative Educator Preparation Program Approval Process.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- D. Update on rulemaking procedures A.A.C. R7-2-615.01, Special Education Endorsement

This item is for information only and no action is requested at this time.

- E. Update on rulemaking procedures A.A.C. Article 10 and Article 11, School District Procurement

This item is for information only and no action is requested at this time.

- F. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-619, Renewal Requirements

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-619, Renewal Requirements.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- G. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals

The Board held discussion around this item.

This item is for information only and no action is requested at this time.

- H. Approval to Extend and Release a Menu of Assessments Request for Proposal. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

It is recommended that the Board approve the Scope of Work, with input from stakeholders, and direct the Department of Education to release a request for proposals (RFP) by the end of December 2019.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Yes

7. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

8. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 8A1-8A11 and 8B1.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Erik Cook, Case no. C-2019-326
 - a. Erik Cook, Case no. C-2019-326 - Supporting Documents
2. Edith Lynn Duko, Case No. C-2018-571-2 & C-2018-571-3
 - a. Edith Lynn Duko, Case No. C-2018-571-2 & C-2018-571-3 - Supporting Documents
3. Amir Gerges, Case no. C-2019-691
 - a. Amir Gerges, Case no. C-2019-691 - Supporting Documents
4. Robin Kubisiak, Case no. C-2018-724
 - a. Robin Kubisiak, Case no. C-2018-724- Supporting Documents
5. Sandra Lundeen, Case no. C-2018-016
 - a. Sandra Lundeen, Case no. C-2018-016 - Supporting Documents
6. Byron Maynes, Case no. C-2019-015
 - a. Byron Maynes, Case no. C-2019-015 - Supporting Documents
7. Brian Myers, Case no. C-2019-662
 - a. Brian Myers, Case no. C-2019-662 - Supporting Documents
8. UPDATED: Dixie Roberts, Case no. C-2018-143
 - a. Dixie Roberts, Case no. C-2018-143 - Supporting Documents
9. William Yaw IV, Case no. C-2019-763

- a. William Yaw IV, Case no. C-2019-763 - Supporting Documents
- 10. Cody Moore, Case no. C-2019-044
 - a. Cody Moore, Case no. C-2019-044 - Supporting Documents
- 11. Walter Benny III, Case no. C-2019-308
 - a. Walter Benny III, Case no. C-2019-308 - Supporting Documents
- B. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-534.04(C), held by:
 - 1. Harlan Lunt, Case No. C-2019-239
 - a. Harlan Lunt, Case No. C-2019-239 - Supporting Documents

9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

10. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

Item 10A4 was removed prior to the start of the meeting.

A motion was made to approve items 10A1-10A3, 10A5-10A6.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:
 - 1. Karen Burgen, Case no. C-2018-365
 - a. Karen Burgen, Case no. C-2018-365- Supporting Documents
 - 2. Ivan Harrell, Case no. C-2018-811
 - a. Ivan Harrell, Case no. C-2018-811 - Supporting Documents
 - 3. Tabitha McClellan, Case no. C-2019-552
 - a. Tabitha McClellan, Case no. C-2019-552 - Supporting Documents

4. ITEM REMOVED - Kelly Milani, Case no. C-2018-363 - ITEM REMOVED
 5. Edward Moore, Case no. C-2018-844 and C-2018-844-2
 - a. Edward Moore, Case no. C-2018-844 - Supporting Documents
 6. Abigail Sloman, Case no. C-2019-644
 - a. Abigail Sloman, Case no. C-2019-644 - Supporting Documents
- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee for:

1. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend any and all certificates of Chad Baitinger, Case no. C-2018-723, for a period of six months with conditions

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to suspend any and all teaching certificate(s) held by Chad Baitinger, for a period of six-months, with the condition that Mr. Baitinger also complete a Board approved alcohol treatment and counseling program before being reinstated, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- a. Chad Baitinger, Case no. C-2018-723 - Supporting Documents

2. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke any and all certificates of Joseph Berry, Case no. C-2019-278, C-2016-381 & C-2016-083 for a period of five years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Joseph Berry, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Joseph Berry, Case no. C-2019-278, C-2016-381 & C-2016-083 - Supporting Documents

3. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke any and all certificates of Brian Sharp, Case no. C-2018-638, for a period of five years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Brian Sharp, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Brian Sharp, Case no. C-2018-638 - Supporting Documents

4. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke any and all certificates of Brooke Spittell, Case no. C-2018-726, for a period of five years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC and revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Brooke Spittell, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Brooke Spittell, Case no. C-2018-726 - Supporting Documents

5. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke any and all certificates of Shani Stewart, Case no. C-2018-364, for a period of five years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Finding of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC and revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Shani Stewart, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Shani Stewart, Case no. C-2018-364 - Supporting Documents

6. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke any and all certificates of Christopher Swank, Case no. C-2017-465 for a period of five years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Christopher Swank, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Christopher Swank, Case no. C-2017-465 - Supporting Documents

7. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke any and all certificates of John Van Huss, Case no. C-2019-168, for a period of five years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke any and all certificate(s) held by John Van Huss, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. John Van Huss, Case no. C-2019-168 - Supporting Documents

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification of Troy Dorsey, Case no. C-2018-576, for a period of five years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC and deny the application for certification of Troy Dorsey, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Troy Dorsey, Case no. C-2018-576 - Supporting Documents

11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Meeting adjourned at 12:12 p.m.

Chairperson

Secretary