



## Meeting Minutes

Printed : 6/15/2020 9:23 AM MST

**April 20, 2020 Regular Board Meeting**

**04/20/2020 10:00 AM**

1535 W. Jefferson

Room # 122

Phoenix, AZ 85007

### Arizona State Board of Education AMENDED Agenda

#### **NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, April 20, 2020, at 10:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007.**

The boardroom will be closed to the public. Information on how the public may attend is outlined below.

***For this meeting, all public comment will be accepted in written form only. Information on how the public may submit written comment is also outlined below.***

A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The April 20, 2020 State Board of Education meeting will be held telephonically.

The audience area of the boardroom will be closed for the meeting, as the State Board is following the federal Centers for Disease Control and Prevention's (CDC) guidelines and limiting the amount of people present in the room to 10. This number represents the Board members and staff who will be attending in person for the meeting. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically.

#### **Methods on accessing the State Board of Education meeting:**

##### **To watch the State Board meeting via computer or a smartphone with a data plan:**

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit [azsbe.az.gov](http://azsbe.az.gov)
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click "ok"
- When the meeting starts, you will see a "live" video. If you do not see this, and the meeting's start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>

**If you do not have internet access or a smartphone with a data plan:** Due to the boardroom being closed to the public, State Board staff has worked collaboratively with the County School Superintendents' offices to host live-streaming video areas for constituents whom do not have internet access or a smartphone with live streaming capabilities.

Constituents may attend and listen to the meeting at one of the County School Superintendent's offices listed on the next page. Each of these locations will be following the same CDC guidelines and limiting attendance to 10 people. Therefore, if you are able to watch the State Board meeting through a computer or smartphone, please do so. This will allow individuals without access to have the opportunity to attend the live streamed meetings at the locations listed on the attached page.

**Procedure for Submitting Public Comment:**

All public comments for the meeting will be accepted in written form only. All public comments will be posted on the Board's website and **will not be orally read** into the record at the Board Meeting. All public comments are due to Board staff by 12:00 p.m. on Friday, April 17, 2020 and will be posted on the Board's website and available for review by end of business on April 17, 2020.

For agenda Items 6 and 8, a party to a contested action and/or their representative may request to make a comment in a format other than in writing. Upon receipt of such a request, the Board will remove the item from the meeting agenda and direct Board staff to place the item for consideration at a meeting on a date to be determined in the future. Such requests are subject to the same requirements as all other written public comments.

There are three ways to submit written comment:

Via email: [inbox@azsbe.az.gov](mailto:inbox@azsbe.az.gov)

Via fax: (602)542-3046

Via USPS: 1700 W. Washington St, Executive Tower, Suite 300 Phoenix, Arizona 85007

DATED AND POSTED this 16th day of April, 2020.

Arizona State Board of Education

By: 

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

**Attendees**

---

**Voting Members**

Calvin Baker, Board Member

Dr. Rita Cheng, Board Member

Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President  
Patricia Welborn, Board Member  
Jill Broussard, Board Member  
Christine Burton, Board Member  
Michele Kaye, Board Member  
Janice Mak, Board Member  
Lucas Narducci, President  
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Armando Ruiz, Board Member

---

## **1. BUSINESS REPORTS**

### A. President's Report

President Narducci informed the Board that he did not have updates to report.

### B. Superintendent's Report

#### 1. Update on Department Activities

Superintendent Hoffman provided updates regarding updates on the Departments activities during COVID-19.

### C. Executive Director's Report

#### 1. Update on Remote Learning Opportunity Plan

Executive Director Williams provided an update regarding the Remote Learning Opportunity Plan.

## **2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Public comment was submitted and is included in the material.

## **3. CONSENT AGENDA**

President Narducci announced that item 3C was removed prior to the setting of the agenda.

A motion was made to approve items 3A, 3B, and items 3D-3J from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

Superintendent Hoffman provided comments regarding 3H.

- A. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base
- B. Denial of Grand Canyon University's application for an alternative educator preparation program for elementary and secondary education
- C. Item 3C is Removed
- D. Approval to extend the professional knowledge allowable deficiency timeframe for Career and Technical Education certificates and the proficiency assessment exam requirements for Student Teaching Intern Certificates
- E. Approval of the recommendation regarding Show Low Unified School District's Arizona Online Instruction application, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-808
- F. Approval of the Infant Toddler Developmental Guidelines 2nd Edition
- G. Approval of Structured English Immersion (SEI) Course Provider
- H. Approval of Washington Elementary School District's Classroom-Based Preparation Program application
- I. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver
- J. UPDATED - Approval of Arizona Department of Education's federal waiver requests - UPDATED

#### **4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

No public comments were received.

#### **5. GENERAL SESSION**

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking on the following certification rules as the result of a public health emergency:

Deputy Director Baden provided information to the Board regarding 5A1-5A3.

- 1. R7-2-614 Other Teaching Certificates

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking on R7-2-614 Other Teaching Certificates.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
 Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
 Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
 Patricia Welborn - Yes  
 Jill Broussard - Yes  
 Christine Burton - Yes  
 Michele Kaye - Yes  
 Janice Mak - Yes  
 Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

2. R7-2-616 Standard Professional Administrative Certificates

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking on R7-2-616 Standard Professional Administrative Certificates

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

3. R7-2-623 Certification Requirements in a Public Health Emergency

It is recommended the open rulemaking on R7-2-623 Certification Requirements in a Public Health Emergency.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

B. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding a follow-up with local education agencies on the educational opportunities provided during school closures - UPDATED

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board regarding school exit survey.

Board members provided feedback to the Board staff regarding the exit survey.

C. Presentation, discussion, and possible action on the revision process for Arizona's Educational Technology Standards

Executive Director Williams provided information to the Board.

- D. EXECUTIVE SESSION - Presentation, discussion, and possible action to approve the vendors for the Statewide Menu of Assessment Request For Proposal (RFP) for the 2020-2021 school year. Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

President Narducci announced that Executive Session would not be necessary.

It is recommended the Board approve eligible vendors regarding the request for proposals for the Menu of Assessments.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- E. ADDED - Presentation, discussion and possible action to waive reporting requirements in A.R.S. 15-901 (A)(1) pursuant to HB 2910 - ADDED

It is recommended the Board approve waiving, for the remainder of school year 2019-2020, the requirement in A.R.S. 15-901(A)(1) that requires school districts and charter schools to submit absence data at least once every 60 days.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

## **6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Public comment was submitted and is included in the material.

## 7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

President Narducci announced that item 7C was removed from the agenda and would not be voted on during this meeting.

A motion was made to approve items 7A1-7A16 and item 7B.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Alan Chintis, Case no. C-2019-000766
  - a. Alan Chintis, Case no. C-2019-000766 - Supporting Documents
2. Timothy Estabrook, Case no. C-2019-000775
  - a. Timothy Estabrook, Case no. C-2019-000775-Supporting Documents
3. Omanakutty Joseph, Case no. C-2019-000732
  - a. Omanakutty Joseph, Case no. C-2019-000732-Supporting Documents
4. Sean Katz, Case no. C-2019-000769
  - a. Sean Katz, Case no. C-2019-000769-Supporting Documents
5. Christian Lewis, C-2020-000009
  - a. Christian Lewis, C-2020-000009-Supporting Documents
6. Benjamin Tackett, Case no. C-2020-000035
  - a. Benjamin Tackett, Case no. C-2020-000035-Supporting Documents
7. Terri Van Herpen, Case no. 2019-000440
  - a. Terri Van Herpen, Case no. 2019-000440-Supporting Documents
8. Michael Washington, Case no. 2019-791
  - a. Michael Washington, Case no. 2019-791-Supporting Documents
9. Gwendolyn Zeigler, Case no. 2020-000062

- a. Gwendolyn Zeigler, Case no. 2020-000062-Supporting Documents
  10. Charles Chapman, Case no. 2019-000773
    - a. Charles Chapman, Case no. 2019-000773 - Supporting Documents
  11. Todd Dearden, Case no. C-2017-438 and C-2017-438-2
    - a. Todd Dearden, Case no. C-2017-438 and C-2017-438-2 - Supporting Documents
  12. Kevin Fallon, Case no. 2020-000052
    - a. Kevin Fallon, Case no. 2020-000052 - Supporting Documents
  13. Charles Kidder, Case no. 2020-000067
    - a. Charles Kidder, Case no. 2020-000067 - Supporting Documents
  14. Tomas Melero, Case no. 2020-000085
    - a. Tomas Melero, Case no. 2020-000085 - Supporting Documents
  15. Caleb Rosado, Case no. 2019-000777
    - a. Caleb Rosado, Case no. 2019-000777 - Supporting Documents
  16. Lyonell Tso, Case no. 2020-000087
    - a. Lyonell Tso, Case no. 2020-000087 - Supporting Documents
- B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:
1. Shanthy Rabindranath, Case no. 2018-721
    - a. Shanthy Rabindranath, Case no. C-2018-721 - Supporting Documents
- C. Approval of the revocation of the educator certificates held by:
1. ITEM REMOVED - Approval of the automatic revocation of any and all educator certificates held by Lesley Belan, Case no. C-2020-000025 for breach of condition of prior settlement agreement - ITEM REMOVED

## **8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Public comment was submitted and is included in the material.

## **9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

A motion was made to table 9A7 and 9A17 until a future board meeting and to direct staff to inform respondents of the change so they may participate in the meeting.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

A motion was made to approve 9A1-9A6, 9A8-9A16, and 9A18.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Elizabeth Bluff, Case no. C-2019-668
  - a. Elizabeth Bluff, Case no. C-2019-668 - Supporting Documents
2. Brian Galbreath, Case no. C-2018-827
  - a. Brian Galbreath, Case no. C-2018-827-Supporting Documents
3. Lynda Morales, Case no. C-2019-767
  - a. Lynda Morales, Case no. C-2019-767-Supporting Documents
4. Linda Russell, Case no. C-2019-246
  - a. Linda Russell, Case no. C-2019-246-Supporting Documents
5. Tara Ryan, Case no. C-2018-419
  - a. Tara Ryan, Case no. C-2018-419-Supporting Documents
6. Tammie Sawyer, Case no. C-2018-064
  - a. Tammie Sawyer, Case no. C-2018-064-Supporting Documents
7. Gerald Alfieri, Case no. C-2018-559
  - a. Gerald Alfieri, Case no. C-2018-559 - Supporting Documents

8. David Andreen, Case no. C-2019-133
    - a. David Andreen, Case no. C-2019-133 - Supporting Documents
  9. Lawrence Cottle, Case no. C-2019-670
    - a. Lawrence Cottle, Case no. C-2019-670 - Supporting Documents
  10. Tiffany Dunaway, Case no. 2019-00759
    - a. Tiffany Dunaway, Case no. 2019-00759 - Supporting Documents
  11. Jerome Kusters, Case no. C-2019-768
    - a. Jerome Kusters, Case no. C-2019-768 - Supporting Documents
  12. Dora Nava-Amaya, Case no. C-2019-686
    - a. Dora Nava-Amaya, Case no. C-2019-686 - Supporting Documents
  13. Patricia Richardson, Case no. C-2019-673
    - a. Patricia Richardson, Case no. C-2019-673 - Supporting Documents
  14. Eric Roof, Case no. C-2018-268
    - a. Eric Roof, Case no. C-2018-268 - Supporting Documents
  15. Emily Rowley, Case no. C-2019-590
    - a. Emily Rowley, Case no. C-2019-590 - Supporting Documents
  16. Anthony Vechiola, Case no. C-2019-764
    - a. Anthony Vechiola, Case no. C-2019-764 - Supporting Documents
  17. Valerie Wilson, Case no. C-2018-608
    - a. Valerie Wilson, Case no. C-2018-608 - Supporting Documents
  18. Charles Zeeb, Case no. C-2018-842
    - a. Charles Zeeb, Case no. C-2018-842 - Supporting Documents
- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke all certificates held by Jennifer Burnley, Case no. C-2019-609

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to Revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Jennifer Burnley, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Jennifer Burnley, Case no. C-2019-609 - Supporting Documents

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification(s) and suspend all certificates held by Nathaniel Brown, Case no. C-2018-141 and C-2018-141-3R, for a period of eighteen months.

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to deny the application for certification and suspend any and all certificate held by Nathaniel Brown, for a period of eighteen months.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Nathaniel Brown, Case no. C-2018-141 and C-2018-141-3R - Supporting Documents

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke all certificates held by Kristen Hess, Case no. C-2019-618

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to Revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Kristen Hess, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Kristen Hess, Case no. C-2019-618 - Supporting Documents

- E. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke all certificates held by Constandinos Karras, Case no. C-2017-497

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to Revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Constandinos Karras, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Constandinos Karras, Case no. C-2017-497 - Supporting Documents

- F. ITEM REMOVED - Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke all certificates held by Richard Krzyzanowski, Case no. C-2019-504 - ITEM REMOVED

Item F has been removed and will be heard at an upcoming board meeting.

- G. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to grant the application for certification for Clarence Horton III, Case no. C-2018-320R

A motion was made to table item 9G for an upcoming meeting and direct Board staff to inform the respondent so they may participate at the upcoming meeting.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Clarence Horton III, Case no. C-2018-320R - Supporting Documents

- H. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend all certificates held by Tasha Smith for a period of 18 months, Case no. C-2018-340 and C-2018-340-2

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Tasha Smith, for a period of eighteen months, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Tasha Smith, Case no. C-2018-340 and C-2018-340-2 - Supporting Documents

- I. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke all certificates held by Aaron Ireland, Case no. C-2018-697

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Aaron Maxwell Ireland, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Aaron Ireland, Case no. C-2018-697 - Supporting Documents

- J. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke all certificates held by Kaleen Porras, Case no. C-2017-840

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Kaleen Porras, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Kaleen Porras, Case no. C-2017-840 - Supporting Documents

- K. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke all certificates held by Richard Williams, Case no. C-2017-664

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Richard Williams, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Richard Williams, Case no. C-2017-664 - Supporting Documents

- L. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification and suspend all certificate(s) held by Erik Conrath, for a period of 2 years,

Case no. C-2019-120, C-2019-120-2 and C-2019-120-3R

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to deny Erik Conrath's application for certification on the grounds of unprofessional or immoral conduct and prohibit Erik Conrath from submitting an application for certification for a period of two years, and take disciplinary action through suspension of any and all certificates held by Erik Conrath, for a period of two years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Erik Conrath, Case no. C-2019-120, C-2019-120-2 and C-2019-120-3R - Supporting Documents

## **10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**

President Narducci requested that Board staff work on updating the Arizona instruction online application to the Board for the May meeting and opening the application early so that it may be approved before the next school year.

Board members took turns discussing current events and possible future agenda items, especially aligned with online learning, accountability and assessments.

Next meeting is May 18, 2020.

Meeting adjourned at 11:24 a.m.