



Meeting Minutes

Printed : 8/26/2020 5:47 PM MST

June 22, 2020 Regular Board Meeting

06/22/2020 10:00 AM

1535 W. Jefferson

Room # 122

Phoenix, AZ 85007

Arizona State Board of Education

AMENDED

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, June 22, 2020, at 10:00 A.M.** The meeting of the Board will be held telephonically, however, the Boardroom will be open for educators facing disciplinary actions only. Those educators and their legal representation can attend the meeting in person at 1535 W. Jefferson St., Room 122, Phoenix, Arizona 85007. To attend the meeting in person, a face covering is required. Please follow all instructions by staff members on where to sit and how to address the Board during the meeting.

Educators facing disciplinary actions and their legal representation: a Request to Speak form must be submitted electronically by Friday, June 19, 2020, at 12:00 PM for Items #6 and #8. The Request to Speak form can be found [HERE](#). Please list the name of the educator facing discipline in the form. Once completed, please email the form to inbox@azsbe.az.gov.

The boardroom will be closed to the general public. Information on how the public may attend is outlined below.

For this meeting, public comment for Items #2 and #4 will be accepted in written form only. Information on how the public may submit written comment is outlined below.

A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A) (3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The June 22, 2020 State Board of Education meeting will be held telephonically, with limited boardroom access as outlined above.

Methods on accessing the State Board of Education meeting:

To watch the State Board meeting via computer or a smartphone with a data plan:

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit azsbe.az.gov
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click “ok”
- When the meeting starts, you will see a “live” video. If you do not see this, and the meeting’s start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>

If you do not have internet access or a smartphone with a data plan: Due to the boardroom being closed to the general public, State Board staff has worked collaboratively with the County School Superintendents’ offices to host live-streaming video areas for constituents whom do not have internet access or a smartphone with live streaming capabilities.

Constituents may attend and listen to the meeting at one of the County School Superintendent’s offices listed on the next page. Each of these locations will be following CDC guidelines and limiting attendance to 10 people. Therefore, if you are able to watch the State Board meeting through a computer or smartphone, please do so. This will allow individuals without access to have the opportunity to attend the live streamed meetings at the locations listed on the attached page.

Procedure for Submitting Public Comment:

All public comment for Items #2 and #4 will be accepted in written form only. All public comments will be posted on the Board’s website and **will not be orally read** into the record at the Board Meeting. All public comments are due to Board staff by 12:00 PM on Friday, June 19, 2020 and will be posted on the Board’s website and available for review by end of business on June 19, 2020.

For agenda Items #6 and #8, a party to a contested action and/or their legal representative may request to make a comment in a format other than in writing. Parties may attend the meeting in person and submit a request to speak form to address the Board by June 19, 2020, at 12:00 PM, as outlined above. Each individual’s public comments are limited to three minutes.

There are three ways to submit written comment:

Via email: inbox@azsbe.az.gov

Via fax: (602)542-3046

Via USPS: 1700 W. Washington St, Executive Tower, Suite 300 Phoenix, Arizona 85007

DATED AND POSTED this 17th day of June, 2020.

Arizona State Board of Education



BY:

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Voting Members

Calvin Baker, Board Member

Dr. Rita Cheng, Board Member

Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President

Patricia Welborn, Board Member

Jill Broussard, Board Member

Christine Burton, Board Member

Michele Kaye, Board Member

Janice Mak, Board Member

Lucas Narducci, President

Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction

Armando Ruiz, Board Member

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

1. August State Board retreat and regular meeting update

Dr. Corr announced that the August Board retreat would be canceled and the regular meeting would still be held on Friday, August 21.

B. Superintendent's Report

1. Update on current events

Superintendent Hoffman provided updates on the Departments current activities. Those comments can be found attached to the meeting material.

C. Executive Director's Report

1. Update on 2019-2020 school year Exit Survey, including Teacher Survey

Executive Director Williams provided the Board with updates regarding the 2019-2020 school year Exit Survey.

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No public comments were received.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made to approve 3A - 3F
Motion approved 11-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. Approval of the acceptance of funds from the United States Department of Agriculture for the Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Program
- B. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver
- C. Approval of the Grand Canyon University Dual Elementary Education and Special Education educator preparation program leading to Arizona educator certification
- D. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base
- E. Approval of Adult Education Additional Allocations for PY2020/21
- F. Approval of Special Education Advisory Panel (SEAP) Candidates for Membership

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No public comments were received.

5. GENERAL SESSION

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Article 15, Empowerment Scholarship Accounts

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Article 15, Empowerment Scholarship Accounts

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- B. EXECUTIVE SESSION - Presentation and discussion regarding the Statewide ELA and Mathematics Assessment for Grades 3-8 and High School Request For Proposal (RFP) Vendor Recommendation. Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

The Board met in Executive Session at 10:47 a.m. and reconvened at 11:06 a.m.

The Board both approve ADE's recommendation for the selected vendors for new ELA and mathematics assessments for grades three through eight and high school, pending review by the Joint Legislative Budget Committee pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes 15-741.03 and pursuant to the Board's Five Year Assessment Plan, direct the Department to seek peer review and any necessary contracts to provide assessment choice in high school with the assessments that are currently on the Menu of Assessments and that responded to the statewide assessment request for proposals

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- C. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs including implementation of chaptered bills. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Vote Not Recorded

Dr. Rita Cheng - Vote Not Recorded
Dr. Daniel Corr - Vote Not Recorded
Patricia Welborn - Vote Not Recorded
Jill Broussard - Vote Not Recorded
Christine Burton - Vote Not Recorded
Michele Kaye - Vote Not Recorded
Janice Mak - Vote Not Recorded
Lucas Narducci - Vote Not Recorded
Kathy Hoffman - Vote Not Recorded
Armando Ruiz - Vote Not Recorded

6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No public comments were received.

7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve 7A1-7A3 and 7B.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. David Beck, Case no. C-2019-792

a. David Beck, Case no. C-2019-792 - Supporting Documents

2. James Onstott, Case no. C-2020-000089

a. James Onstott, Case no. C-2020-000089-Supporting Documents

3. Paula Stockamp, Case no. C-2019-121

a. Paula Stockamp, Case no. C-2019-121-Supporting Documents

B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:

1. Michael Driscoll, Case no. C-2019-572

a. Michael Driscoll, Case no. C-2019-572 - Supporting Documents

8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

John Checkett, representing Richard Krzyzanowski, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Richard Krzyzanowski, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Clarence Horton III, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jess Lorona, representing Jacquelyn Oates, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jess Lorona, representing Leslie Belan, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jess Lorona, representing Tasha Smith, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Denise Blommel, representing Gerald Alfieri, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Flynn Carey, representing Austin Nichols, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Roger Frazier, representing Jose Jimenez, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Clarence Horton III, representing himself, submitted a written statement that was provided to the Board prior to the meeting.

9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

Member Baker requested to remove 9A2.

A motion was made to approve 9A1 and 9A3 - 9A6.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Gerald Alfieri, Case no. C-2018-559
 - a. Gerald Alfieri, Case no. C-2018-559 - Supporting Documents
2. Christopher Chinchilla, Case no. C-2020-000164R

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Negotiated Settlement Agreement for Christopher Chinchilla.

Motion passed 10-1.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - No
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- a. Christopher Chinchilla, Case no. C-2020-000164 - Supporting Documents
3. Moises Duran, Case no. C-2019-313
 - a. Moises Duran, Case no. C-2019-313-Supporting Documents
4. Austin Nichols, Case no. C-2019-503
 - a. Austin Nichols, Case no. C-2019-503-Supporting Documents
5. Jacquelyn Oates, Case no. C-2020-00090
 - a. Jacquelyn Oates, Case no. C-2020-00090-Supporting Documents
6. Darbie Thompson, Case no. C-2019-199
 - a. Darbie Thompson, Case no. C-2019-199-Supporting Documents

B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke all certificates held by Richard Krzyzanowski, Case no. C-2019-504

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to Revoke any and all certificate(s) held by

Richard Krzyzanowski, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion approved 10-1.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - No

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Richard Krzyzanowski, Case no. C-2019-504

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to grant the application for certification for Clarence Horton III, Case no. C-2018-320R

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to approve the application for certification of Clarence Horton III and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion approved 11-0.

Motion made by: Lucas Narducci

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Clarence Horton III, Case no. C-2018-320R - Supporting Documents

- D. UPDATED - Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates held by Lesley Belan, Case no. C-2020-000025 for breach of condition of prior settlement agreement-UPDATED

It is recommended that the State Board of Education enforce the terms of the Settlement Agreement signed by Ms. Belan and automatically revoke any and all certificates held by Ms. Belan for a period of five years with all states and territories being so notified.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker
Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Leslie Belan, Case no. C-2020-000025 - Supporting Documents

E. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Request for Rehearing for:

1. ITEM REMOVED - Luis Alvarez, Case no. C-2019-296
2. Jose Jimenez, Case no. C-2019-164

It is recommended that the State Board of Education deny the Request for Rehearing for Jose Luis Jimenez.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard
Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- a. Jose Jimenez, Case no. C-2019-164-Supporting Documents
3. Tasha Smith, Case no. C-2018-340 and C-2018-340-2

It is recommended that the State Board of Education deny the Request for Rehearing for Tasha Smith

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Lucas Narducci
Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Tasha Smith, Case no. C-2018-340 and C-2018-340-2-Supporting Documents

10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Executive Director Williams provided a status update on AOI applications.

Dr. Corr adjourned the meeting at 12:17 p.m.