

ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

The Arizona State Board of Education held a regular meeting April 28, 2014 at the Arizona Department of Education, 1535 West Jefferson Street, Room 417, Phoenix, Arizona. The meeting was called to order at 9:01 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present:	Members Absent
President Tyree	Dr. Hart
Ms. Hamilton	Ms. Rogers
Dr. Rottweiler	
Superintendent Huppenthal	
Mr. Ballantyne	
Mr. Jacks	
Vice President Miller	
Mr. Molera	
Mr. Moore	

9:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, MOMENT OF SILENCE, AND ROLL CALL

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

President Tyree welcomed new Board members, Reginald Ballantyne III and Cheryl Rogers. He thanked Eileen Klein and Diane Ortiz-Parsons for their outstanding service. President Tyree appointed Member Moore, Ms. Vicki Ballantine, Ms. Joanne Cramer to serve on the Structured English Immersion Models Review Committee.

B. Superintendent's Report

1. Presidential Awards for Excellence in Mathematics and Science

Superintendent Huppenthal thanked Member Klein and Member Ortiz for their service and welcomed new Board members. Superintendent Huppenthal gave a brief report to the members regarding empowerment scholarship accounts. Superintendent Huppenthal spoke about the Summer Reading Collaborative and how important continued reading is to students of all ages. He talked about the Read On Arizona program and how the Arizona Department of Education and myOn, a digital literacy provider, are working to provide access to thousands of digital books to Arizona children ages 3 and up as part of an effort to improve literacy. Superintendent Huppenthal recognized Terry Clark for her hard work and important role in getting this program up and running. Superintendent presented awards for the Presidential Awards for Excellence in Mathematics and Science to the 2012 Arizona awardees for the Presidential Awards for Excellence in Mathematics and Science. The following individuals were presented awards: science awardee, Cindy Piano of Peoria Unified

School District, and mathematics awardee, Allison Davis of Chandler Unified School District. The 2013 Arizona finalists for Science and Mathematics have been nominated by Arizona for selection; science finalists Marni Landry of Paradise Valley Unified School District, Tamara Gwara formally from Gilbert Public Schools, Heather Obrien of Mesa Public Schools, Margaret Wilch of Tucson High Magnet School, and mathematics finalists, Mary Kelly Lantz of Catalina Foothills District and Shannon Mann of Osborn district.

C. Board Member Reports

Member Moore reported that he attended the WestEd Board meeting in San Francisco and gave the Board a brief overview of the meeting.

D. Executive Director's Report

Nothing to report

2. CONSENT AGENDA

A. Consideration to approve Arizona State Board of Education minutes for:

1. February 24, 2014 Regular Meeting
2. February 24, 2014 Executive Session
3. March 6, 2014 Special Meeting
4. March 6, 2014 Executive Session
5. March 24, 2014 Regular Meeting

B. Consideration to approve the following contract abstracts:

1. 2013-2014 Migrant Education Program – Identification and Recruitment of Migrant Students
2. Arizona Charter School Program Awards, Round II, Project Years 2015-2017

C. Consideration to approve school district applications for the Arizona On-Line Instruction Program, pursuant to A.R.S. §15-808

D. Consideration to approve additional monies for teacher compensation for Fiscal Year 2014-2015 to districts that have submitted Statements of Assurance, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-952 and A.R.S. § 15-537

E. Consideration to accept and approve the optional Performance Incentive Program and Budget for Fiscal Year 2013-2014 for Sedona-Oak Creek Joint Unified School District pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-919

F. Consideration to accept the recommendations of the Career Ladder Advisory Committee and approve the Career Ladder programs of districts for Fiscal Year 2014-2015

- G. Consideration to approve funds for Interagency Service Agreement No. ISA –MULTI-15-0710-01 between First Things First and the Arizona Department of Education (ADE) pursuant to A.R.S.§35-148(A)
- H. Consideration to approve funds for Interagency Service Agreement No. ISA-14-27-ED between the Governor’s Office for Children, Youth and Families and the Arizona Department of Education (ADE) pursuant to A.R.S.§35-148(A)
- I. Consideration to appoint Mr. Matt Weber to the Certification Advisory Committee (CAC)
- J. Consideration to grant three year approval for professional preparation programs for Arizona State University’s Secondary Education Undergraduate Certificate Program pursuant to R7-2-604 and R7-2-604.01
- K. Consideration to approve the proposed achievement levels for the following assessments related to Board Examination Systems and the Grand Canyon Diploma:
 - 1. AP History
 - 2. AP World History
- L. Consideration to permanently revoke any and all teaching certificates held by the following, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550:
 - 1. Jeffrey J. Huelster
 - 2. Kimberly Ali
- M. Consideration to accept voluntary surrender of the certificates held by Erikka Jean Barnes
- N. Consideration to accept the recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to amend the Findings of Facts in the matter of Anthony Gier
- O. Consideration to accept the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to grant the applications for certification for Edward Lee Fluhman
- P. Consideration to approve the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA literacy plans which have been reviewed for release of K-3 Reading Base Support funds

Member Ballantyne requested Item 2G be removed from the consent agenda for further discussion. Member Molera recused himself from the vote of the Consent Agenda.

Superintendent Huppenthal made a motion to approve the Consent agenda with the exception of Item 2G. Member Miller seconded the motion. Motion passed.

Discussion was held regarding Consent Item 2G. Mr. Ballantyne asked about the historical partnerships between the Department and First Things First, which Amy Corriveau answered. Ms. Thompson stated the Executive Director of First Things First would be happy to discuss the partnership between ADE and First Things First in greater detail with Mr. Ballantyne.

Dr. Rottweiler made a motion to approve Consent Item 2G. Superintendent Huppenthal seconded the motion. Motion passed.

3. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

None

4. GENERAL SESSION

- A. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals. This item to be presented by Ms. Cannata.

Ms. Cannata spoke to the Board regarding the final legislative report. Legislative session came to a close on Thursday, April 18th. Ms. Cannata gave an update regarding legislation impacting the Board.

Member Molera thanked Ms. Cannata for her outstanding legislative service during this legislative session. Mr. Molera asked President Tyree to publicly thank in the form of a letter those organizations who publicly supported the work of the Board during the legislative sessions. President Tyree agreed and asked Ms. Cannata and Ms. Thompson to prepare thank you letters to go out on behalf of the Board members.

- B. Presentation, discussion and consideration to close the rulemaking record and adopt, effective July 1, 2014, proposed amendments to Article 10 and Article 11 of Board rule related to school district procurement, consisting of proposed rules R7-2-1001 through R7-2-1008; R7-2-1010 through R7-2-1016; R7-2-1018; R7-2-1021 through R7-2-1033; R7-2-1035 through R7-2-1037; R7-2-1041 through R7-2-1042; R7-2-1044 through R7-2-1050; R7-2-1053; R7-2-1055 through R7-2-1056; R7-2-1058; R7-2-1061 through R7-2-1063; R7-2-1066 through R7-2-1070; R7-2-1073 through R7-2-1081; R7-2-1083 through R7-2-1087; R7-2-1092 through R7-2-1093; R7-2-1100 through R7-2-1115; R7-2-1117 through R7-2-1123; R7-2-1125; R7-2-1131; R7-2-1141 through R7-2-1153; R7-2-1155 through R7-2-1159; R7-2-1161; R7-2-1164 through R7-2-1165; R7-2-1167 through R7-2-1170; R7-2-1181 through R7-2-1185; R7-2-1191 through R7-2-1192; and R7-2-1194 through R7-2-1196, and the proposed repeal of rules R7-2-1009, R7-2-1057, R7-

2-1091, and R7-2-1116. This item to be presented by Ms. Thompson and Mr. Stelpstra.

Executive Director spoke to the Board regarding this item. She stated this item has been before the Board two other times and Rules Hearings were held with no further comments.

Member Miller made a motion to close the rulemaking record and adopt, effective July 1, 2014, proposed amendments to Article 10 and Article 11 of Board rule related to school district procurement, consisting of rules R7-2-1001 through R7-2-1008; R7-2-1010 through R7-2-1016; R7-2-1018; R7-2-1021 through R7-2-1033; R7-2-1035 through R7-2-1037; R7-2-1041 through R7-2-1042; R7-2-1044 through R7-2-1050; R7-2-1053; R7-2-1055 through R7-2-1056; R7-2-1058; R7-2-1061 through R7-2-1063; R7-2-1066 through R7-2-1070; R7-2-1073 through R7-2-1081; R7-2-1083 through R7-2-1087; R7-2-1092 through R7-2-1093; R7-2-1100 through R7-2-1115; R7-2-1117 through R7-2-1123; R7-2-1125; R7-2-1131; R7-2-1141 through R7-2-1153; R7-2-1155 through R7-2-1159; R7-2-1161; R7-2-1164 through R7-2-1165; R7-2-1167 through R7-2-1170; R7-2-1181 through R7-2-1185; R7-2-1191 through R7-2-1192; and R7-2-1194 through R7-2-1196, and the repeal of rules R7-2-1009, R7-2-1057, R7-2-1091, and R7-2-1116. Member Moore seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

- C. Presentation, discussion and consideration to initiate rulemaking procedures for proposed rules R7-2-301 and R7-2-302 regarding online and distance instruction pursuant to A.R.S. §15-808. This item will be presented by Ms. Thompson.

Executive Director Thompson stated that this rule change was to align the rule to recent changes to the law. There were no questions or comments.

Member Miller made a motion to initiate rulemaking procedures for proposed amendments to rules R7-2-301 and R7-2-302 regarding online and distance education. Member Rottweiler seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

- D. Presentation, discussion and consideration to adopt proposed method for awarding a Standard Diploma to certain Move On When Ready participants and adopt the proposed AIMS equivalent scores for the following assessments related to Board Examination Systems for the award of a Standard Diploma:
 1. IGCSE English First Language
 2. IGCSE Mathematics
 3. QualityCore English 10
 4. QualityCore Algebra 1
 5. QualityCore Geometry

Dr. Sybil Francis and Dr. Amanda Burke gave a brief overview to the Board regarding the Move on When Ready initiative and proposal that is being presented. Superintendent Huppenthal asked for clarification on the recommended exam equivalent scores and discussion was held. Mr. Miller asked how this performance

based process is tied to a Grand Canyon diploma and what happens if a student falls short of the Grand Canyon Diploma. In her PowerPoint presentation to the Board, Dr. Francis explained how a student must attend high school for the full four years as well as state assessments and must meet all the high school graduation requirements for a standard diploma should they not meet the requirements for a Grand Canyon Diploma. Member Miller asked about the incentive for gap student to continue to pursue the program if they are not going to make the high graduation requirements for the Grand Canyon Diploma. Member Molera stated he has a lot of comfort with the program. Member Huppenthal stated this program needs to be monitored very closely to make sure students are getting their academic content. Dr. Francis stated this program is monitored very closely and this is not intended to be an elite program. She stressed this is a program for all students, not just high achieving students. Dr. Rottweiler stated he is committed to this program. He stressed the importance of getting all students college and career ready, and recognized that this program will help achieve that goal. Member Jacks is concerned about students who are in the program and somewhere along the way may change their direction or pathway. Dr. Francis stated this initiative adds to those choices and does not take away from their choices. Member Ballantyne asked what the numbers are for students who have already gone through this program. Dr. Francis stated this is the third year and 30,000 students and 30 schools are currently participating and just over a handful of students have actually earned the diploma. President Tyree stated many schools are using the program because they like the rigor and believe it is has the high standards needed for students today. Member Moore stated he is very supportive of the program. Member Rottweiler stated the high standards should be the aim. Ms. Thompson reminded the Board that this issue will need to be revisited once the new assessment is selected. Dr. Francis believes all students could achieve at this level given the opportunity and support. Member Jacks asked if students are required to have the 22 required high school graduation credits to receive a standard diploma. Dr. Francis stated that is required for all students.

Member Huppenthal made a motion to adopt proposed method for awarding a Standard Diploma to certain Move On When Ready participants and adopt the proposed AIMS equivalent scores for the assessments related to Board Examination Systems for the award of a Standard Diploma as presented in the materials. Member Molera seconded the motion.

E. Presentation, discussion and consideration to adopt the proposed modifications to the A-F Letter Grade Accountability System.

Dr. Leila Williams introduced Dr. Yovhane Metcalfe and congratulated her on her new promotion as Director of Accountability. Dr. Metcalfe gave the Board a brief overview regarding the A-F Letter Grade Accountability System and the AZLEARNS Subcommittee meetings that were held prior to this month's Board meeting. She gave a detailed PowerPoint presentation to the Board highlighting the proposals being discussed. She talked about qualifying appeals. She discussed changes made to the former scale and how it impacted data. Member Molera asked for clarification regarding percent passing on Performance Comparison on the PowerPoint presentation. Superintendent Huppenthal asked about the weighted comparisons and how a school has to show their significant changes regarding the new scale vs. the old scale. Dr.

Metcalfe explained how graduation rate is a significant component in the letter grade and how they are able to demonstrate outside the state wide assessment in other areas. Student proficiency and student growth was prioritized based upon the new scale. Member Miller stated this was an issue of considerable concern during the AZLEARNS subcommittee meetings and talked about how the committee worked to address this issue. Dr. Metcalfe talked about the criteria with which an alternative school can become an alternative school.

Member Molera asked about statute which was changed two years ago to allow for a cut score to be assigned for F letter grades. He expressed his disappointment that a cut score for an F grade was not being presented, even after the changes in statute. Member Moore stated every student in the state should have an opportunity for an education, and expressed his concern about potentially closing schools in rural areas where students would have to be bused to other districts because there are no other schooling options available.

Dr. Metcalfe talked about AOI and dual enrollment. She talked about extremely small schools with less than 30 test records and coming back to the Board with recommendations for small schools. Member Ballantyne asked how many extremely small schools there are in the state. Dr. Metcalfe stated there are approximately 50 extremely small schools throughout the state. Dr. Metcalfe talked about coming back to the Board 45 days after the selection of the new assessment to discuss proposed accountability transition plan.

Thea Andrade, Director of Assessment and Accountability for Phoenix Union High School District, spoke to the Board regarding Letter Grade rubric changes. She asked why the model was not tested last spring when the Graduation Rates changed and the rubric changed also. It would seem that naturally some things would change when you change the accountability system but what has been done now is increased the system so as not to allow any change. There were a few schools that were on the cusp of increasing their letter grade and this grad rate impact would have moved those schools from Cs to Bs. Now under the current rubric this won't happen. It is frustrating to the field as we had a lot of schools who could potentially move up in letter grade.

Dr. Amy Schlessman, Rose Academy in Tucson, thanked the Board for setting scales for 2014 and stated this is a FY2014 fix as the new assessment comes into place and there will be other things yet to be worked out. She also thanked Dr. Metcalfe and the Accountability and Assessment for including several options to the AZLEARNS Subcommittee. She thanked Executive Director Thompson for sending out the AZLEARNS Memo to several organizations prior to the subcommittee meetings. She looks forward to timely discussion of any changes to the Model and discussion still needs to be held regarding the CCRI for Alternative Schools. The Consortium encourages prudent action regarding the FY15 Letter grade and distinct achievement profiles and labels for alternative schools. Regarding F schools, she asked the Board to remember that the growth for alternative high schools SGP (student growth profile) is only applicable for 10th graders and we don't know how that will work yet with the new assessment. Improvement is important for alternative high schools. She is very encouraged and looks forward to continue participation.

Ildi Laczko-Kerr, Vice President, Arizona Charter Association, spoke to the Board regarding 106 potential F graded schools. 37 of those schools are charters. The other are district schools. Many of those 106 schools were likely to receive a D rating because the bell curve of the test scores. If they have improved their graduation rate or percent passing, that will be negated because of the curve of their cut score. This is a cause for concern. In the current A-F Model she has shared her concerns with this Board how growth is calculated and in the next few weeks will be sharing with the Board and the Accountability and Assessment staff an alternative method that might be considered. Also, she stated she will be bringing recommendations to the Board and staff on how to look at the College and Career indicators. Starting this conversation is essential considering changes will have to come due to the new assessment. She urged for more transparency and ask the Board and staff to make as much of the data as possible transparent. Member Molera asked about the transparency of data and what data has not been available or what data would be helpful that would help make better analysis. She stated it is really unpacking and breaking down the public information that the department puts up. It's not that there isn't data available; it's that we would like it broken out into finer component parts so we can do more analysis.

Dr. Gabriel Trujillo, Principal, Trevor Browne High School, spoke to the Board about how schools are fighting to get out of the D or C range or even stay in the same A or B range. He talked about how his school has put together a school improvement plan. He talked about two variables that put two of the most vulnerable population at risk at the high school level, credit deficient student and ELL students. He stated there are certain times of the year, usually right before testing, when the registration office is flooded with a group of students that share one characteristic, who don't have the necessary credits to graduate on track and have been "out-counseled" by another school simply because they might present a liability to their home school in terms of testing and graduation rate. He stated his doors are wide open for those kids and it is the job of his school and his district to find a place at the table for all kids including those students and any student who have been ushered out by another school. Changing the formula could have more unintended consequences not only to those students but for the schools who service those students. Superintendent Huppenthal thanked Dr. Trujillo for his leadership and the great work he has provided to Trevor Browne High School.

Dr. Denton Santarelli, Superintendent, Peoria Unified School District, spoke to the Board and offered pleasure in the changes of the appeal process and applauds that change. He shares the same comments that his colleagues have stated. He stated concerns regarding asking teachers to teach a brand new curriculum but at the same time asking them to hold their students accountable for an assessment that does not align. In order for our teachers and students to be successful, gap documents have been put together and also have to be taught. Given all the changes that are currently happening, it might be surprising to see that fewer students are successful. I think it is detrimental to our ongoing efforts around accountability and rigor to see the bar has been raised in the middle of the game. Curriculum is much more rigorous while at the same time millions of dollars of funds have been eliminated but teachers are rising to the occasion and working hard. Member Molera asked when information was received

regarding the changes being discussed. Dr. Santarelli stated he has been privy to the increase in the grade rate and that has been heavily discussed. He learned of the change in the scale today during this meeting. Executive Director, Ms. Thompson, addressed Member Ballantyne's questions regarding when the changes would take effect. Superintendent Huppenthal stated the Board is making a valuable decision regarding graduation. Superintendent Huppenthal stated schools have to earn their letter grade. Just because there has been a policy change doesn't mean a school moves up a letter grade. If one is going to add weight/points for graduation rate and change the policy, that should not automatically mean everyone moves up 15 points - it means you have to redo the scale. That's what is painful. Some people looked at this and saw an automatic increase in a letter grade, saw some free points. The changes that were made were entirely appropriate.

Member Miller stated the Subcommittee met three different times. Staff worked tirelessly to get data to the Subcommittee and made sure stakeholders were aware of the process and the meeting dates. The presentation today is exactly the same item by item as what was presented at the Subcommittee meeting and many of the people who spoke to the Board today did not participate and were not at Subcommittee meetings nor were their organizations.

Member Miller made a motion to adopt and implement the modified A-F letter grade accountability system for 2014 as presented, including:

- *the A-F substantive appeals process;*
- *the graduation rate component of the CCRI for traditional and alternative high schools;*
- *the new scale for the assignment of traditional high school letter grades; and*
- *the new scale for the assignment of alternative high school letter grades.*

Superintendent Huppenthal seconded the motion. Member Molera, Member Ballantyne and President Tyree opposed. Motion did not pass.

Member Molera stated there has not been enough due diligence and input from the field. He stated that it is incumbent upon the Board to make sure there is input from stakeholders and the field so the Board is given every issue that might be a problem. Superintendent Huppenthal talked about how it is easier to achieve a higher letter grade now than before. The Board did not raise the goalpost as it was suggested. Executive Director Thompson talked about how the field is notified of special meetings and subcommittee meetings. Dr. Metcalfe mentioned that many schools will close without knowing what the A-F letter grade model will be. Dr. Metcalfe also explained the points gained with the inclusion of the graduation rate - schools on average gained 4 points altogether, C & D schools gained 7, A schools gained 1 point.

President Tyree asked if there were another subcommittee meeting would the schools be able to receive their letter grades on time. Superintendent Huppenthal recommended a public meeting on this subject between now and the next Board meeting.

Superintendent Huppenthal recommends that the Board come back in May with this

agenda item and move forward and schedule some kind of public hearing between now and May. President Tyree stated he was concerned that maybe the opportunity was not provided for additional input in the form of another Subcommittee meeting. Member Miller stated he will plan another AZLEARNS Subcommittee meeting to discuss these issues and give the field and others another opportunity to participate.

- F. Presentation and discussion regarding the Arizona Education Learning and Accountability System and Board update of the Quarterly performance review pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-249.

Mr. Mark Masterson gave a brief update and overview to the Board and introduced WestEd representatives, Dr. Ellen Mandinach and Mr. Warren Danforth, who gave the Board a progress report and provided a PowerPoint presentation highlighting objectives, goals and recommendations regarding the strategic implementation plan as it relates to AELAS. Mr. Masterson stated he will have a follow up presentation and ask for guidance and approval from the Board in May.

Presentation only.

- G. Board comments and future meeting dates. The executive director, presiding officer or a member of the Board may present a brief summary of current events pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.02(K), and may discuss future meeting dates and direct staff to place matters on a future agenda. The Board will not discuss or take action on any current event summary.

Member Molera accepted a position and at least every two years there is a progress report and would like to give a presentation to the Board.

5. ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 12:31.