



## December 9, 2022 Regular Board Meeting

**12/09/2022 - 10:00 AM**

1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower

2nd Floor Conference Room

Phoenix, AZ 85007

### MEETING MINUTES

---

#### Arizona State Board of Education

#### **AMENDED** Agenda

#### **NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Friday, December 9, 2022 at 10:00 A.M.**

The **Friday, December 9, 2022** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. This means that the public has the opportunity to participate in-person or virtually.

Please note the location of the **Friday, December 9, 2022** State Board of Education meeting: 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, 2nd Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, AZ 85007

A copy of the meeting agenda is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically or virtually.

Agenda materials can be reviewed online at [http://azsbe.az.gov\(https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/4ZwqeeEQC9x6DOQvi8FGHQ==\)](http://azsbe.az.gov(https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/4ZwqeeEQC9x6DOQvi8FGHQ==))

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A) (3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The **Friday, December 9, 2022** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. Please see below on how to access the meeting and provide public comment on agenda items, regardless of the chosen access method.

#### **Accessing the State Board of Education Meeting Virtually**

##### **To watch the State Board meeting via computer or a smartphone with a data plan/Wi-Fi:**

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit [azsbe.az.gov](http://azsbe.az.gov)
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click "ok"
- When the meeting starts, you will see a "live" video. If you do not see this, and the meeting's start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: [https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A\(https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/xdH6GgaHzBdDTRUXaOliiA==\)](https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A(https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/xdH6GgaHzBdDTRUXaOliiA==))

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

#### **Procedure for Submitting a Public Comment (Please read through each option carefully):**

##### **Written Comment:**

Written comments for the meeting will be accepted by:

- email [inbox@azsbe.az.gov\(https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/YhrEghWngpFB0plus4VUf5yDQ==\)](mailto:inbox@azsbe.az.gov(https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/YhrEghWngpFB0plus4VUf5yDQ==))
- fax to (602) 542-3046
- USPS to 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, Suite 300, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

#### **The deadline to submit a written comment will be Tuesday, December 6, 2022 at 12:00 PM.**

Written comments received after the deadline, including those that are mailed but not received by staff, will not be posted and will not be provided to members.

Written comments will not be read into the record. However, staff will post all written comments received by the deadline on the Board's agenda on **Tuesday, December 6, 2022 at 5:00 PM.**

**Virtual Verbal Comment:**

Individuals must register to submit a virtual verbal comment at the meeting.

Please use the link below to register.

**The deadline to register for a virtual verbal comment will be Tuesday, December 6, 2022 at 12:00 PM.**

By registering, you are submitting a request to speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak virtually during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

The name in which you register **MUST** match the name on the account when signing in to the meeting to speak. Prior to the meeting, you may need to download the Zoom application to your device and create an account to ensure name matching. Board staff will only call speakers once and then will move on to the next speaker. If you miss your turn, Board staff will attempt again at the end of the list. The order in which names are called will be in the order in which the registrations are received.

Individuals who register after the noon deadline on **Tuesday, December 6, 2022** will not be provided the opportunity to give virtual verbal public comment at the meeting.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine which public comment agenda item you will be called.

All Board policies in regard to public comment at in-person meetings are transferable to virtual verbal public comment for meetings. Virtual verbal public comment is limited to three minutes, unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting.

Please use this link to register for a **virtual** verbal public comment:

[https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN\\_ytnl1aOJRQi8pDeyFFghBQ](https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_ytnl1aOJRQi8pDeyFFghBQ)(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/MXddplus9lppuYU4wPfjReyg==>)

**In-Person Verbal Public Comment:**

Individuals must register in advance to submit an in-person verbal comment at the meeting.

No requests to speak will be accepted on the morning of the meeting.

Please use the link below to register.

**The deadline to register for an in-person verbal comment will be Tuesday, December 6, 2022 at 12:00 PM.**

By registering, you are submitting a request-to-speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

By registering, you are also informing Board staff that you will be present in-person at the meeting to provide your public comment. Staff will not switch your registration to virtual if you fail to attend the meeting in-person.

Board staff will only call speakers one time. If a speaker is not ready and available to comment at that time, staff will move on to the next speaker. If you miss your turn, Board staff will attempt again at the end of the list. The order in which names are called will be in the order in which the registrations are received.

Individuals who register after the noon deadline on **Tuesday, December 6, 2022** will not be provided the opportunity to give an in-person public comment at the meeting.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine which public comment agenda item you will be called.

In-person verbal public comments are limited to three minutes, unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting.

Please use this link to register for in-person verbal comment:

<https://forms.gle/CduxVydoD2No1nGn7>(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/plusHBBNdoe1Ocl3Dfh3w3ptA==>)

If you need assistance with registering, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

If you do not have internet access to register for a virtual comment, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

DATED AND POSTED this **6th day of December**, 2022.

Arizona State Board of Education

By:



Alicia Williams  
Executive Director  
(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

**Attendees**

---

Dr. Daniel Corr, President  
Christine Burton, Vice President  
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent - Virtual (*left the meeting at 10:36am*)  
Jenny Clark, Board Member  
Dr. Jacqui Clay, Board Member - Virtual  
Dr. Scott Hagerman, Board Member - Virtual  
Katherine Haley, Board Member  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas, Board Member  
Julia Meyerson, Board Member  
Jason Catanese, Board Member (*left the meeting at 2:13pm*)  
Dr. Robert Robbins, Board Member - Virtual (*left the meeting at 2:26pm*)

---

**1. BUSINESS REPORTS**

*Meeting called to order at 10:00 am.*

**A. President's Report**

**1. Recognition of Superintendent Hoffman**

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item and presented an award.

President Dr. Corr provided the floor to Superintendent Hoffman.

Superintendent Hoffman made comments about this agenda item.

**2. Appointment of Nominating Committee pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-101(A)(5) to prepare a slate of candidates for elected officers for presentation to the Arizona State Board of Education**

President Dr. Corr made comments in recognition of Executive Director Williams and presented an award.

President Dr. Corr provided the floor to Executive Director Williams.

Executive Director Williams made comments in recognition.

President Dr. Corr appointed Member Hagerman, Member Catanese, and Member Meyerson to prepare a slate of candidates for elected officers for presentation to the Arizona State Board of Education.

**3. Appointment of a member to the Board's Legislative Committee to join the President and Vice President**

President Dr. Corr appointed Member Haley to the Board's Legislative Committee.

**B. Superintendent's Report**

Superintendent Hoffman presented to the Board.

**1. Student Reports**

The students presented to the Board.

a. Christian Moore

b. Katie Ritchie

c. Noah Killeen

## 2. Department of Education Updates

Superintendent Hoffman left the Board meeting at 10:36am.

### C. Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Williams has no report at this time.

## 2. ITEM REMOVED- Presentation and discussion on the Financial Literacy Task Force

### 3. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Jamie Rosenberg, representing ClassWallet, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

Mark Joraanstad, representing Arizona School Administrators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

Lori Riegel, PhD, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

### 4. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made to approve items 4B through 4D and 4F through 4O.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jenny Clark

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

#### A. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to approve the list of approved Move on When reading LEA literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Jason Catanese

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

#### B. Approval of the acceptance of the Salt River Project Grant Award

#### C. Receipt of an update on the Requirements for HB 2135 (2021) - Supports for Algebra I, Geometry, and Algebra II

#### D. Approval of the Economics Credit through Career Technical Education Business Management Program

#### E. Approval of a scoring adjustment to the Arizona Educator Proficiency Assessment (AEPA) Special Education: Early Childhood exam

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

Deputy Associate Superintendent Bruce DuPlanty clarified this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr sought clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item.

Deputy Associate Superintendent Bruce DuPlanty clarified this agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item.

Deputy Associate Superintendent Bruce DuPlanty clarified this agenda item.

Member Clark sought clarification about this agenda item.  
Deputy Associate Superintendent Bruce DuPlanty clarified this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to approve a scoring adjustment to the Arizona Educator Proficiency Assessment (AEPA) Special Education: Early Childhood exam.

Motion passed: 9-1.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jason Catanese

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - No  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

**F. Approval of oral history resources pursuant to Laws 2022, Chapter 303**

**G. Approval of the Arizona Department of Education and Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP) Partnership Agreement**

**H. Approval of the Chandler Unified School District RISE Classroom-Based Elementary Education, Grades K-8, Educator Preparation Program**

**I. Approval of Northern Arizona University's Bachelor of Science in Secondary Education, Grades 6-12, Educator Preparation Program Leading to educator certification**

**J. Approval of Northern Arizona University's M.S in Science Education, & M.A in Teaching with a teaching science certificate, Educator Preparation Program leading to Arizona educator certification**

**K. Approval of the Pima Community College Post-Baccalaureate Special Education Mild-Moderate Certificate, Educator Preparation Program leading to Arizona educator certification**

**L. Approval of the Prescott College Master of Education in Elementary Education, Grades K-8, Educator Preparation Program leading to Arizona educator certification**

**M. Approval of the National School Lunch Program Equipment Grant Funds for Fiscal Year 2022**

**N. Approval of the ACT Assessment Waiver for Highly Performing Students**

**O. Approval of the hearing officer's recommendations to deny the appeal for certification for reasons that do not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct for Dr. Lori Riegel, Case No. 2020-015**

## **5. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Sarah Collins, representing Kyrene School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

Rebecca Bolnick, representing Kyrene School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

Susie Ostmeyer, representing Kyrene School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Stacey Cochran, representing the Center for Educational Excellence, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

Robin Bayles, representing Queen Creek Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

## **6. GENERAL SESSION**

### **A. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding 2021-2022 A-F Accountability Appeals - UPDATED**

A motion was made to approve the appeal application for Vista College Preparatory to "B" Letter Grade for Appeal Factor 1 based on limitations outside of the school's control in being eligible for these letter grade points, and deny for Appeal Factor 2 due to not a valid grounds for appeal (student characteristics).

*Member Meyerson recused herself from this agenda item.*

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Katherine Haley

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - not present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Julia Meyerson - recused  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

A motion was made to approve the appeal application for New Crossroads Academy to "NR" Letter Grade with accepting the school's submission of CCRI and On Track to Graduate self-reported data for the Department's records and for the Department of Education to work with communications of this "NR" for the school. The Department will work on the coding issues to ensure that first year in operation schools are not included in the future.

*Member Dr. Clay recused herself from this agenda item.*

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton  
Motion seconded by: Julia Meyerson  
Voting:  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - not present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - recused  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

A motion was made to approve the appeal application for San Carlos High School to "C" Letter Grade based incorrect data (removal of growth due to ineligibility on N-Size of 10 FAY student scores) and inclusion of submission of CCRI self-reported data. School shall correspond with ADE Accountability to correct data. Audit next year for self-reported component submission (CCRI) due to non-timely submission.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton  
Motion seconded by: Jacqui Clay  
Voting:  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - not present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

A motion was made to deny the appeal application for Isaac Middle School due to not a valid grounds for appeal [student characteristics, COVID-19 without extenuating circumstances in the affected school year(s)].

*Member Catanese recused himself from this item.*

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton  
Motion seconded by: Jenny Clark  
Voting:  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - not present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Jason Catanese - recused  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

A motion was made to approve the A-F Appeals Committee's recommendations, rationales and conditions for the schools as provided outside of Vista College Preparatory, New Crossroads Academy, San Carlos High School, Isaac Middle School, Kyrene de las Manitas, and the Center for Educational Excellence.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jenny Clark

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - not present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

A motion was made to move the letter grade for the Center for Educational Excellence to a letter grade from a "B" to an "A" due to the new information.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this school.  
ADE Chief Accountability Officer Sean Smith provided clarification about this school.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Julia Meyerson

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - not present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

A motion was made to approve the appeal application for Kyrene de las Manitas to "C" Letter Grade for Appeal Factor 1 based on supporting evidence of tragedy and supporting documentation including benchmark testing. Recommend Denial for Appeal Factors 2-4 due to not valid grounds for appeal.

Member Meyerson made comments and sought clarification about this item.  
Executive Director Williams provided clarification about this item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this item.  
Executive Director Williams provided clarification about this item.

Member Dr. Clay sought clarification about this item.  
Research & Data Analyst Jessica Mueller provided clarification about this item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas sought clarification about this item.  
Research & Data Analyst Jessica Mueller provided clarification about this item.  
Executive Director Williams made comments about this item.

Member Catanese sought clarification about this item.  
Member Meyerson sought clarification about this item.  
Research & Data Analyst Jessica Mueller provided clarification about this item.

Member Meyerson made comments about this item.  
President Dr. Corr made comments about this item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this item.  
Member Meyerson made comments about this item.  
Member Catanese made comments and sought clarification about this item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas sought clarification about this item.  
Research & Data Analyst Jessica Mueller provided clarification about this item.

Member Dr. Hagerman made comments about this item.  
President Dr. Corr made comments about this item.  
Member Haley made comments about this item.  
Member Meyerson made comments about this item.

Motion passed: 6-4.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jenny Clark

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - not present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - No  
Julia Meyerson - No  
Jason Catanese - No  
Dr. Robert Robbins - No

President Dr. Corr made comments about this item.

**B. UPDATED: Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Open Enrollment/School Choice content for publication and distribution**

Executive Director Williams presented to the Board.  
Member Clark made comments about this agenda item.

Vice President Burton made comments about this agenda item.  
Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item.  
Executive Director Williams provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Haley made comments about this agenda item.  
Member Clark made comments about this agenda item.  
Executive Director Williams provided clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.  
Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to approve the Open Enrollment/School Choice content as presented, with communicated changes, for publication and distribution in January.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Katherine Haley

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

**C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures for A.A.C. R7-2-604, R7-2-604.02, R7-2-604.03, R7-2-604.05, R7-2-604.06, R7-2-607, R7-2-610.02, R7-2-616, R7-2-619, Educator Certification**

A motion was made to adopt the submitted drafts of Rule and close rulemaking procedures for A.A.C. R7-2-604, R7-2-604.02, R7-2-604.03, R7-2-604.05, R7-2-604.06, R7-2-607, R7-2-610.02, R7-2-616, R7-2-619, Educator Certification.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Julia Meyerson

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes



Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

**D. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures for A.A.C. R7-2-618, Certification Fees**

A motion was made to close rulemaking procedures for A.A.C. R7-2-618, Certification Fees.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Jason Catanese

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

**E. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures for A.A.C. R7-2-302, Minimum Course of Study and Competency Requirements for Graduation from High School**

A motion was made to close rulemaking procedures for A.A.C. R7-2-302, Minimum Course of Study and Competency Requirements for Graduation from High School.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jason Catanese

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

*The Board Meeting was temporarily adjourned at 12:10pm.*

*The Board Meeting returned at 12:45pm.*

*Member Phillips-Krivickas left the board meeting at 12:45pm.*

*Member Phillips-Krivickas returned to the Board Meeting at 12:46pm.*

President Dr. Corr gave the floor to the Board's Project Director of Constitution Services, Shannon Etz, and the Project Director of Policy, Federico Yanez.

The Board's Project Director of Policy, Federico Yanez, introduced himself.

The Board's Project Director of Constitution Services, Shannon Etz, introduced herself.

*Member Meyerson thanked the Board and Department staffers for their assistance with the Accountability Appeal Committee.*

*Vice President Burton expressed thanks to the Board and Department staffers.*

**F. UPDATED - Update on rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Article 15, Empowerment Scholarship Accounts - UPDATED**

Executive Director Williams presented to the Board.

Member Clark made comments about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

**G. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the State Board of Education's 2023 Legislative Priorities**

Executive Director Williams presented to the Board.

Project Director of Policy Yanez presented to the Board.

Member Meyerson sought clarification on the agenda item.

Project Director of Policy Federico Yanez provided clarification to the Board.

Executive Director Williams provided clarification to the Board.

Member Phillips-Krivickas sought clarification on the agenda item.  
Executive Director Williams provided clarification to the Board.

A motion was made to approve the 2023 Legislative Priorities as outlined in the attachment.

Member Meyerson sought clarification on the motion.  
President Dr. Corr provided clarification about this agenda item.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Katherine Haley

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

#### **H. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Executive Director transition plan**

Executive Director Williams presented to the Board.  
President Dr. Corr thanked Executive Director Williams.  
Member Haley thanked Executive Director Williams.

Member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item.  
Member Catanese thanked Executive Director Williams.

#### **I. Discussion, consideration and possible action on the search and selection of the new Executive Director of the State Board of Education**

A motion was made to move into executive session pursuant with A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(1)(n)(3) for discussion and consideration of employment matters and/or legal advice for the selection of the new Executive Director of the State Board of Education.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jason Catanese

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - not present

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

*The Board moved to Executive Session at 1:36pm.*

*Member Catanese left the Board Meeting at 2:13pm.*

*Member Dr. Robbins left the Board Meeting at 2:26pm.*

*The Board returned from Executive Session at 2:29pm.*

A motion was made to approve the hire of the candidate discussed at the salary discussed with the start date of January 9, 2023.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Katherine Haley

Motion seconded by: Dr. Jacqui Clay

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Jason Catanese - Not Present

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

President Dr. Corr congratulated the new State Board Executive Director Sean Ross.

## 7. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Renee Osipov, representing Chelle Law, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

## 8. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 8A1 through 8A10, 8B1, and 8C1.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Jason Catanese - Not Present

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

### A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

#### 1. Aaron Dunton, Case no. C-2022-001077

a. Aaron Dunton, Case no. C-2022-001077 - Supporting Documents

#### 2. Patricia McKelvy, Case no. C-2022-001081

a. Patricia McKelvy, Case no. C-2022-001081 - Supporting Documents

#### 3. Kelly Norton, Case no. C-2022-000442

a. Kelly Norton, Case no. C-2022-000442 - Supporting Documents

#### 4. Jaron Rheilander, Case no. C-2022-002266

a. Jaron Rheilander, Case no. C-2022-002266 - Supporting Documents

#### 5. Dylan Riddle, Case no. C-2022-002287

a. Dylan Riddle, Case no. C-2022-002287 - Supporting Documents

#### 6. Andrea Schembre, Case no. C-2022-001647

a. Andrea Schembre, Case no. C-2022-001647 - Supporting Documents

#### 7. Benjamin Schnieder, Case no. C-2021-000215

a. Benjamin Schnieder, Case no. C-2021-00215 - Supporting Documents

#### 8. David Schuck II, Case no. C-2020-000676

a. David Schuck II, Case no. C-2020-000676 - Supporting Documents

#### 9. Vanessa Valenzuela, Case no. C-2022-001147

a. Vanessa Valenzuela, Case no. C-2022-001147- Supporting Documents

#### 10. Tammy Wilson, Case no. C-2022-001372

a. Tammy Wilson, Case no. C-2022-001372 - Supporting Documents

### B. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-534.04(C), held by:

#### 1. Joshua Carlton, Case no. C-2022-001915

a. Joshua Carlton, Case no. C-2022-001915- Supporting Documents

C. Approval of the summary suspension of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1309(A), held by:

1. Natalie Woods, Case no. C-2021-012959

a. Natalie Woods, Case no. C-2021-012959 - Supporting Documents

**9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Molly Brizgys, representing Mitchel Stein Carey Chapman, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

John Desjardins, representing Frontline Substitutes, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

Renee Osipov, representing Chelle Law, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Angela Tapaha, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, and addressed the Board.

**10. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

**A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:**

A motion was made to approve items 10A1 through 10A4.

Member Phillips-Krivickas sought clarification on the proposed motion.  
Executive Director Williams provided clarification about this agenda item.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Jason Catanese - Not Present

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

1. Alfonso Brown, Case no. C-2022-001503R

a. Alfonso Brown, Case no. C-2022-001503R - Supporting Documents

2. Claro Paige, Case no. C-2021-012703

a. Claro Paige, Case no. C-2021-012703- Supporting Documents

3. Michelle A. Peterson, Case no. C-2022-000408

a. Michelle A. Peterson, Case no. C-2022-000408 - Supporting Documents

4. Purvi Roe, Case no. C-2022-001737

a. Purvi Roe, Case no. C-2022-001737 - Supporting Documents

**B. Presentation discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to grant Airam Coralescacho's application for certification, Case no. C-2022-000611R.**

A motion was made to adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to grant the application of Airam Coralescacho despite evidence showing that Applicant Coralescacho engaged in unprofessional or immoral conduct because sufficient evidence exists that mitigates Applicant Coralescacho's conduct and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed: 7-1.

Motion made by: Katherine Haley

Motion seconded by: Julia Meyerson

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Jason Catanese - Not Present

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - No  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

**1. Airam Coralescacho, Case no. C-2022-000611R, - Supporting Documents**

**C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Joy Malave, Case no. C-2021-012880**

A motion was made to adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke any and all certificates held by Joy Malave, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Not Present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

**1. Joy Malave, Case no. C-2021-012880 & C-2022-000322 - Supporting Documents**

**D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application of Sheri McClintock, Case no. C-2022-000726R and determine that she is prohibited from applying for certification for five years and revoke the certificates of Sheri McClintock, Case no. C-2022-001858, for a period of five years.**

A motion was made to deny the application of Sheri McClintock and determine that she is prohibited from applying for certification for five years and revoke any and all certificates of Sheri McClintock for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Not Present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

**1. Sheri McClintock, Case no. C-2022-000726R & C-2022-001858 - Supporting Documents**

**E. Presentation discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to issue a letter of censure to Angela Tapaha, Case no. C-2021-012775**

A motion was made to adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to issue a letter of censure to Angela Tapaha and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jenny Clark

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Not Present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

**1. Angela Tapaha, Case no. C-2021-012775 - Supporting Documents**

**F. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Request for Review of Mark Brinton, Case no. C-2021-012555**

Executive Director Williams made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to deny Mark Brinton's request for a rehearing of the Board's decision, from September 26, 2022 meeting, as after reviewing the record and all materials submitted by the parties, the Board finds that the reasons presented by Mark Brinton do not warrant rehearing under Arizona Administrative Code R7-2-709.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Dr. Jacqui Clay

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Not Present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

**1. Mark Brinton, Case no. C-2021-012555 - Supporting Documents**

**G. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Request for Review of John Desjardins, Case no. C-2021-006818**

Executive Director Williams made comments about this agenda item.

Attorney General, Kathleen Brantingham, made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to deny John Desjardins's request for a review and/or rehearing of the Board's decision from the September 26, 2022 meeting, as after reviewing the record, and all materials submitted by the parties, the Board finds that the reasons presented by Mr. Desjardins do not warrant either review or rehearing under Arizona Administrative Code R7-2-709.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Julia Meyerson

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Not Present  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

John Desjardin sought clarification about this agenda item.

Executive Director Williams provided clarification on this agenda item.

**1. John Desjardins, Case no. C-201-006818 - Supporting Documents**

**11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments.

President Dr. Corr made comments.

President Dr. Corr gave Executive Director Williams the floor.

Executive Director Williams made comments.

*Board Meeting adjourned at 3:00pm.*