



Meeting Minutes

January 28, 2019 Regular Board Meeting
01/28/2019 09:00 AM
1535 W. Jefferson
Room # 122
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Arizona State Board of Education

AMENDED Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday January 28, 2019, at 9:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122**, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007. A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, to consider records exempt by law from public inspection, including the receipt and discussion of information that is required to be maintained as confidential by state or federal law.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 16th day of January, 2019.

Arizona State Board of Education

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams", written over a horizontal line.

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

9:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PRAYER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM, AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Calvin Baker
Dr. Rita Cheng
Dr. Daniel Corr
Patricia Welborn
Jill Broussard
Christine Burton
Michele Kaye by phone
Lucas Narducci
Kathy Hoffman
Armando Ruiz

1. Presentation of Candidates and Election of State Board of Education Officers for 2019

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

The Board voted to elect Lucas Narducci as Board President and Dr. Daniel Corr as Vice President.

2. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

1. Welcome Superintendent Hoffman

President Narducci welcomed Superintendent Hoffman.

2. Welcome to the new Board Member, Armando Ruiz

President Narducci welcomed new Board Member, Mr. Armando Ruiz.

3. Member Mak Update

President Narducci informed the Board that Member Mak was not in attendance as she was invited to speak in Washington D.C.

B. Superintendent's Report

1. Update on Department Activities

Superintendent Hoffman provided updates on Department activities.

C. Executive Director's Report

1. Introduction of new staff

Executive Director Williams introduced Jessica Mueller as the new staff member on Board staff.

2. Update on Board staff activities

3. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Stephen Neal, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Joe Geusic, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

4. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made to approve items 4A-4K and 4L1.

The Board held discussion around item 4E, 4L2, and 4L3.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. Approval of Adult Education FY 18/19 Allocations to Expand Adult Education Literacy Services to Disconnected Youth
- B. Approval of the Adult Education FY 2019 -2020 Allocations to Local Providers of Adult Education
- C. Receipt of the Special Education Advisory Panel (SEAP) Annual Report FY 2017-2018
- D. REMOVED - Approval of the Migrant Education Program Revised Funding Formula for Basic/Consortia Grants - REMOVED

This item was removed from the agenda.
- E. Approval of the McKinney-Vento Homeless Education Program Mini-Grant
- F. Approval of the Structured English Immersion (SEI) Courses
- G. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds
- H. Approval of the University of Arizona Early Childhood Education educator preparation program leading to educator certification
- I. REVISED - Approval of the Arizona Charter School Program Grant, Project Years 2020 - 2024 Subrecipients - REVISED

- J. Approval of modifications to the membership structure of the Accountability Technical Advisory Committee and the Alternative Accountability Technical Advisory Committee
- K. Approval of the A-F Appeals Committee's recommendation to approve the A-F Appeal of Miami Junior-Senior High School
- L. Approval of the hearing officer's recommendations to dismiss the following appeals of denied certifications for reasons that did not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct:
 - 1. Sydney Bandy, Case No. 2018-004
 - 2. Davlin Edwards, Case No 2018-003

A motion was made to resend this case back to the hearing officer.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- 3. Stephen Neal, Case No. 2018-001

A motion was made to resend this case back to the hearing officer.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Not Present

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

5. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Rebecca Beebe, representing the Arizona School Administrators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Mari Jo Mulligan, representing Lake Havasu Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Dr. Amy Schlessman, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Member Kaye joined the meeting by phone at 9:45 a.m.

6. GENERAL SESSION

- A. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the following A-F Accountability Models: - UPDATED

1. K-8

It is recommended that the Board approve ATAC's recommendation to adopt the K-8 A-F Accountability model with the business rule changes presented at the December 17, 2018 Board Meeting and outlined above.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

2. 9-12

The Board recessed at 10:50 a.m. and reconvened at 11:05 a.m.

It is recommended the Board approve ATAC's recommendation and release the three options for public comment.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

3. Alternative Schools

It is recommended the Board approve the AATAC's recommendation to adopt the proposed alternative accountability model as presented.

Motion passed 8-2.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - No
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - No
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to determine noncompliance by Murphy Elementary School District #21 with the Uniform System of Financial Records and to withhold state funds pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-272(B)

Karen Hartman-Tellez, representing the Attorney General's Office, presented information to the Board.

A motion was made to continue with status quo with receivership in place and not withhold funds from Murphy Elementary School District No. 21.

Motion passed unanimously.

Motion made by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures for proposed rule R7-2-319 regarding the State Seal of Personal Financial Proficiency Program

It is recommended that the Board open rulemaking on a proposed rule R7-2-319, State Seal of Personal Financial Proficiency Program.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard
Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures for proposed rule R7-2-320 regarding the State Seal of Civics Literacy Program.

It is recommended that the Board open rulemaking on a proposed rule R7-2-320, State Seal of Civic Literacy Program.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard
Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- E. Update on rulemaking procedures on Arizona Administrative Code Title 7, Chapter 2, Article 13 regarding Unprofessional and Immoral Conduct

No action taken.

- F. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

- G. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve third-party evaluators regarding the request for proposals for the Menu of Assessments. Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, to consider records exempt by law from public inspection, including the receipt and discussion of information

that is required to be maintained as confidential by state or federal law.

Member Baker made a motion, seconded by Dr. Cheng, to convene into executive session.

Motion passed 10-0.

Member Cheng exited meeting at 12:00 p.m.

Member Baker made a motion, seconded by Member Ruiz, to approve the qualifying third party evaluators in the Menu of Assessments of 2, 4, 5, 6, and 7.

Motion passed 9-0.

The Board recessed at 12:18 p.m. and reconvened at 12:28 p.m.

7. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No request to speak forms were received.

8. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 8A1-8A4 and 8B.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. David Canales, Case no. C-2017-244

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by David Canales, and that all states and territories be so notified.

a. David Canales, Case no. C-2017-244 - Supporting Documents

2. Jody Erickson, Case no. C-2017-633

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Jody Erickson, and that all states and territories be so notified.

a. Jody Erickson, Case no. C-2017-633 - Supporting Documents

3. Jack Holland, Case no. C-2018-142 & C-2018-142-2

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Jack Holland, and that all states and territories be so notified.

- a. Jack Holland, Case nos. C-2018-142 & C-2018-142-2 - Supporting Documents

4. Glen Simpson, Case no. C-2018-561

- a. Glen Simpson, Case no. C-2018-561 - Supporting Documents

B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:

1. Tadashi Harvey, Case no. C-2018-718

It is recommended that, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, the State Board of Education permanently revoke any and all certificates held by Tadashi Harvey, and that all states and territories be so notified.

- a. Tadashi Harvey, Case no. C-2018-718 - Supporting Documents

9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No request to speak forms were received.

10. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Gwen Sherwood, Case no. C-2018-079

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Negotiated Settlement Agreement, with conditions, for Gwen Sherwood.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- a. Gwen Sherwood, Case no. C-2018-079 - Supporting Documents

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Johnny London, Case no. C-2018-248

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke the teaching certificate of Johnny London, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Kathy Hoffman

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Johnny London, Case no. C-2018-248 - Supporting Documents

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Anna Dugan, C-2017-665 & C-2017-665-2R, for 3 years, as well as deny her application for certification for a period of 3 years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Anna Dugan, C-2017-665 & C-2017-665-2R, for 3 years, as well as deny her application for certification for a period of 3 years

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Anna Dugan, Case no. C-2017-665-2R - Supporting Documents

11. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Motion for Rehearing regarding educator Peter O'Brien, Case nos. C-2017-702 & C-2017-702R

Murray Henner, representing Peter O'Brien, presented information to the Board.

The Board may affirm its decision and deny Peter O'Brien's motion for rehearing or review by reason of his failure to establish any basis under Board Rule R7-2-709 to merit a rehearing or review of the decision.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Peter O'Brien, Case nos. C-2017-702 & C-2017-702R - Supporting Documents

12. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Executive Director gave updates to the Board regarding upcoming events.

AZ Merit will be added as an agenda item in a future meeting, as requested by Superintendent Hoffman and Member Welborn.

The Board held discussion around moving a meeting to a later time.

Member Baker suggested adding an agenda item in the future regarding self reporting data.

Meeting adjourned at 01:10 p.m.