



**February 28, 2022 Regular Board Meeting**

**02/28/2022 - 10:00 AM**

1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower

3rd Floor Conference Room

Phoenix, AZ 85007

## MEETING MINUTES

---

### Arizona State Board of Education

#### Agenda

#### **NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, February 28, 2022 at 10:00 A.M.**

The **Monday, February 28, 2022** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. This means that the public has the opportunity to participate in-person or virtually.

Please note the location of the **Monday, February 28, 2022** State Board of Education meeting: **1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, 3rd Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, AZ 85007**

A copy of the meeting agenda is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically or virtually.

Agenda materials can be reviewed online at  
(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/4ZwqeeEQC9x6DOQvi8FGHQ==>)

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A) (3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The **Monday, February 28, 2022** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. Please see below on how to access the meeting and provide public comment on agenda items, regardless of the chosen access method.

#### **Accessing the State Board of Education Meeting Virtually**

#### **To watch the State Board meeting via computer or a smartphone with a data plan/Wi-Fi:**

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)

- Visit [azsbe.az.gov](https://azsbe.az.gov)
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click “ok”
- When the meeting starts, you will see a “live” video. If you do not see this, and the meeting’s start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>  
(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/xdH6GgaHzBdDTRUXaOlilA==>)

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board’s office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

**Procedure for Submitting a Public Comment (Please read through each option carefully):**

**Written Comment:**

Written comments for the meeting will be accepted by:

- email [inbox@azsbe.az.gov](mailto:inbox@azsbe.az.gov)  
(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/YhrEghWngpFB0plus4VUf5yDQ==>)
- fax to (602) 542-3046
- USPS to 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, Suite 300, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

**The deadline to submit a written comment will be Friday, February 25, 2022 at 12:00 PM.**

Written comments received after the deadline, including those that are mailed but not received by staff, will not be posted and will not be provided to members.

Written comments will not be read into the record. However, staff will post all written comments received by the deadline on the Board’s agenda by **Friday, February 25, 2022 at 5:00 PM.**

**Virtual Verbal Comment:**

Individuals must register to submit a virtual verbal comment at the meeting.

Please use the link below to register.

**The deadline to register for a virtual verbal comment will be Friday, February 25, 2022 at 12:00 PM.**

By registering, you are submitting a request to speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak virtually during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

The name in which you register **MUST** match the name on the account when signing in to the meeting to speak. Prior to the meeting, you may need to download the Zoom application to your device and create an account to ensure name matching. Board staff will only call speakers once and then will move on to the next speaker. If you miss your turn, Board staff will attempt again at the end of the list. The order in which names are called will be in the order in which the registrations are received.

Individuals who register after the noon deadline on **Friday, February 25, 2022** will not be provided the opportunity to give virtual verbal public comment at the meeting.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine which public comment agenda item (#2, #4, #6, #8) you will be called.

All Board policies in regard to public comment at in-person meetings are transferable to virtual verbal public comment for meetings. Virtual verbal public comment is limited to three minutes, unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting.

**Please use this link to register for a virtual verbal public comment:**

[https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN\\_VDIxfhQzQOa9OOgtctQhiA](https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_VDIxfhQzQOa9OOgtctQhiA)  
(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/gG2XvpDslshOfVTEp3KL7IGA==>)

**In-Person Verbal Public Comment:**

Individuals must register in advance to submit an in-person verbal comment at the meeting.

No requests to speak will be accepted on the morning of the meeting.

Please use the link below to register.

**The deadline to register for an in-person verbal comment will be Friday, February 25, 2022 at 12:00 PM.**

By registering, you are submitting a request-to-speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

By registering, you are also informing Board staff that you will be present in-person at the meeting to provide your public comment. Staff will not switch your registration to virtual if you fail to attend the meeting in-person.

Board staff will only call speakers once. If a speaker is not ready and available to comment at that time, staff will move on to the next speaker. If you miss your turn, Board staff will attempt again at the end of the list. The order in which names are called will be in the order in which the registrations are received.

Individuals who register after the noon deadline on **Friday, February 25, 2022** will not be provided the opportunity to give an in-person public comment at the meeting.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine which public comment agenda item (#2, #4, #6, #8) you will be called.

In-person verbal public comments are limited to three minutes, unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting.

**Please use this link to register for in-person verbal comment:**

<https://forms.gle/yVbkDX2Fop3nJMk8>  
(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/SkF4EngrZPZn1q2slshw9Lf6A==>)

If you need assistance with registering, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

If you do not have internet access to register for a virtual comment, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

DATED AND POSTED this 18th day of February, 2022

Arizona State Board of Education

By:



Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

**Attendees**

---

**Voting Members**

Lucas Narducci, President  
Jill Broussard, Board Member - Virtual  
Christine Burton, Board Member  
Michele Kaye, Board Member  
Armando Ruiz, Board Member  
Patricia Welborn, Board Member - Virtual (Arrived 10:23am)  
Calvin Baker, Board Member  
Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President  
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent (Left at 12:04pm)

---

**1. BUSINESS REPORTS**

**A. President's Report**

President Narducci welcomed Superintendent Hoffman back.

President Narducci did not provide updates to the Board.

**B. Superintendent's Report**

Superintendent Hoffman provided updates regarding the Department's activities.

**1. Department of Education Updates**

**2. Student Report**

Superintendent Hoffman introduced the guest speakers from the Student Advisory Board.

**a. Jaylie Foye**

Jaylie Foye, representing the Student Advisory Board, addressed the Board.

**b. Krish Desai**

Krish Desai, representing the Student Advisory Board, addressed the Board.

**c. Deezhchiil Benally**

Deezhchiil Benally, representing the Student Advisory Board, was unable to address the Board and will provide written comments to the Board.

**d. Hunter White**

Hunter White, representing the Student Advisory Board, addressed the Board.

**C. Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Williams did not provide updates to the Board.

**2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

**Kathy Visser, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Dr. Kathy Boltz, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Allison Wilkes, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Celinda Toone, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Lynn Fox-Embrey, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Kelly Pichitino, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Rebekah Cross, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Christine Emanuel, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Patricia Stevens, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Velia Aguirre, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Marcus Garcia, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

Angela Rusch, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Amanda Adams, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Julie Smith, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Charity Hantla, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form.

Sophia Braham, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form.

Sujean Wilson, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Coco Lovejoy, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

### 3. CONSENT AGENDA

*Member Welborn joined the Board Meeting at 10:23am.*

Member Burton has requested to pull Item 3A. All other items will be taken in a single motion.

A motion was made to approve items 3B through 3E.

**Motion Passed: 9-0**

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

#### A. Receipt of the Empowerment Scholarship Account (ESA) FY22 Quarter 2 Report

A motion was made to table Item 3A to March to allow the Department to update their ESA Q2 Report and respond to the written and verbal comments made by ESA families.

Member Burton explained their YES vote.

President Narducci explained their YES vote.

Member Baker explained their YES vote.

Superintendent Hoffman explained their NO vote.

**Motion Passed: 9-1**

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - No

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**B. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base**

**C. Approval of Structured English Immersion Endorsement Coursework for Harrison Middleton University**

**D. Approval of the Arizona Online Instruction (AOI) application of Douglas Unified School District**

**E. Approval of appointment to the Professional Practices Advisory Committee (PPAC)**

#### **4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

N/A

#### **5. GENERAL SESSION**

**A. Presentation and discussion on the state Accountability System for District Letter Grades**

Wendy Davy, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

This item was information and discussion only.

**B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open public comment on the draft Social Media and Cell Phone Use Best Practices for Educators**

*The Board took a five-minute break from 11:29 - 11:35am.*

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

It is recommended the Board open public comment on the draft Social Media and Cell Phone Use Best Practices for Educators.

Member Baker made comments.

President Narduci made comments.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

**C. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the recommendation to deny the Parent's/Guardian's, M.A.J.'s, appeal and affirm the Arizona Department of Education (Department's) termination of the Empowerment Scholarship Account (ESA) for Appeal Case No. 00225**

On February 2, 2022, the OAH recommended that the State Board of Education deny the Parent's/Guardian's, M.A.J.'s, ESA appeal number 00225, and affirm the Department's termination.

Motion passed 7-2.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - No

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - No

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**1. J.M.J., student by and through the Parent/Guardian, M.A.J., ESA Appeal Case No. 00225 Supporting Documents**

**D. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals**

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

**6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

N/A

**7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

*Superintendent Hoffman left the Board Meeting at 12:04pm*

**A motion was made to approve items 7A1 through 7A10, and 7B1.**

**Motion passed 8-0.**

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes



Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

**A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:**

**1. Pat Chacon, Case no. C-2021-013113**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Pat Chacon and that all states and territories be so notified.

**a. Pat Chacon, Case no. C-2021-013113 - Supporting Documents**

**2. Richard Cross, Case no. C-2021-012936**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Richard Wesley Cross and that all states and territories be so notified.

**a. Richard Cross, Case no. C-2021-012936 - Supporting Documents**

**3. Nathaniel DeSantiago, Case no. C-2020-001244**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Nathaniel DeSantiago and that all states and territories be so notified.

**a. Nathaniel DeSantiago, Case no. C-2020-001244 - Supporting Documents**

**4. Robert Fogltance, Case no. C-2018-000711 and 2018-000830**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Robert Fogltance and that all states and territories be so notified.

**a. Robert Fogltance, Case no. C-2018-000711 and 2018-830 - Supporting Documents**

**5. Joan Katz, Case no. C-2021-012700**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Joan Katz and that all states and territories be so notified.

**a. Joan Katz, Case no. C-2021-012700 - Supporting Documents**

**6. Richard Swanson, Case no. C-2021-012951**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Richard Swanson and that all states and territories be so notified.

**a. Richard Swanson, Case no. C-2021-012951 - Supporting Documents**

**7. Glendon Templeton, Case no. C-2021-012343**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Glendon Templeton and that all states and territories be so notified.

a. **Glendon Templeton, Case no. C-2021-012343 - Supporting Documents**

**8. Lisa Vuyovich, Case no. C-2020-002324**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Lisa Vuyovich and that all states and territories be so notified.

a. **Lisa Vuyovich, Case no. C-2020-002324 - Supporting Documents**

**9. Christopher Weeks, Case no. C-2021-004730**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Christopher Weeks and that all states and territories be so notified.

a. **Christopher Weeks, Case no. C-2021-004730 - Supporting Documents**

**10. Andrew Chapman, Case no. C-2020-000675**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender of any and all certificates held by Andrew Chapman and that all states and territories be so notified.

a. **Andrew Chapman, Case no. C-2020-000675 - Supporting Documents**

**B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:**

**1. James Kenneth Williams, Case no. C-2021-012937**

It is recommended that, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, the State Board of Education permanently revoke any and all certificates held by James Kenneth Williams and that all states and territories be so notified.

a. **James Kenneth Williams, Case no. C-2021-012937- Supporting Documents**

**8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

**Jim Baker, representing Gilbert Public Schools, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and submitted written comments.**

**Stephen M. Weiss, representing Karp & Weiss P.C., submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and submitted written comments.**

**Rajani Rastogi, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and submitted written comments.**

**Sydney Oshinski, representing Tait & Hall, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Alexis Brooks, representing Tait & Hall, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Ryan Tait, representing Tait & Hall, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

**Gregory N. Patterson, representing Andale Advertising, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.**

Shawn Rustad, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Craig Luketich, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kelly Stout, representing Dobson High School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

David Hines, representing Arizona Interscholastic Association, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Rob Gilmore, representing Lexington Life Academy, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Richard Baniszewski, representing Hamilton High School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Braxton Baniszewski, representing Hamilton High School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Manny Palomarez, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Patrick Sylvestre, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form.

Christopher J Legg, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jordan W Legg, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Steve Belles, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Phil Gonzales, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Rodger Schenks, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Brad Cesmat, representing Sports360az, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Christopher Varela, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Travis Lockhart, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Ken James, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Dr. Camille Casteel, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Nancy Spilsbury, representing Basha High School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lisa Knipp, representing Basha High School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

## 9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

### A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

A motion was made to approve items 9A1 through 9A4 in a single motion.

Motion approved 8-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Yes

#### 1. Timothy Dargon, Case no. C-2021-012463

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Negotiated Settlement Agreement, with conditions, for Timothy Dargon, and that all states and territories be so notified.

##### a. Timothy Dargon, Case no. C-2021-012463 - Supporting Documents

#### 2. Justin Hager, Case no. C-2020-000039

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Negotiated Settlement Agreement, with conditions, for Justin Hager, and that all states and territories be so notified.

##### a. Justin Hager, Case no. C-2020-000039 - Supporting Documents

#### 3. Barbara Haidet, Case no. C-2021-000570

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Negotiated Settlement Agreement, with conditions, for Barbara Haidet, and that all states and territories be so notified.

##### a. Barbara Haidet, Case no. C-2021-000570 - Supporting Documents

#### 4. Nicole Turilli, Case no. C-2020-000711

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Negotiated Settlement Agreement, with conditions, for Nicole Virginia Turilli, and that all states and territories be so notified.

**a. Nicole Turilli, Case no. C-2020-000711 - Supporting Documents**

**B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificates of Taeyana Altaha, Case no. C-2021-004897, for a period of 3 years**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to suspend any and all teaching certificate(s) of Taeyana Altaha, for a period of three years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**1. Taeyana Altaha, Case no. C-2021-004897 - Supporting Documents**

**C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificates of Melissa Ohman, Case nos. C-2019-000421 and C-2019-318**

Do I have a motion to adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke any and all teaching certificate(s) held by Melissa Ohman, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified?

Motion Passed 8-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**1. Melissa Ohman, Case nos. C-2019-000421 and C-2019-318 - Supporting Documents**

**D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to issue a letter of censure on the teaching certificates of Steve P. Belles, Case no. C-2017-260**

*President Narducci recused himself from the vote on this agenda item.*

A motion was made to adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law but reject the recommendation by PPAC and move to suspend any and all teaching certificates of Steve Belles, for a period of 2 years, with an additional modification to the conditions by requiring him to taking the NFHS courses: "Bullying, Hazing and Inappropriate Behaviors" and "Protecting Students from Abuse" both of which at the educator's expense and to be successfully taken, with evidence provided to the Board staff, within one year, and that all states and territories be so notified because based upon Findings of Fact #127 and #128, Mr. Belles admitted that it was his responsibility to monitor the locker rooms and admitted that he did not assign staff to monitor the locker rooms.

Member Broussard explained their NO vote.

Member Ruiz explained their YES vote.

Member Kaye explained their YES vote.

Member Baker explained their YES vote.

Motion passed 6-1.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - No

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Recuse

Kathy Hoffman - Not Present

Armando Ruiz - Yes

### **1. Steve Belles, Case no. C-202017-260- Supporting Documents**

**E. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to issue a letter of censure on the teaching certificates of Ken James and grant the application for renewal of his certificates, Case no. C-2017-485 and C-2020-00744R**

*President Narducci recused himself from the vote on this agenda item.*

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to issue a Letter of Censure of any and all teaching certificate held by Ken James, and grant Ken James' application for certification, with the additional modified condition of successful completion of the NFHS courses: "Bullying, Hazing and Inappropriate Behaviors" and "Protecting Students from Abuse" both of which at the educator's expense, with evidence provided to the Board staff, within one year, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Recuse  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

**1. Ken James, Case no. C-2017-485 and C-2020-00744R- Supporting Documents**

**F. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to issue a letter of censure on the teaching certificates of Manny Palomarez II, Case no. C-2017-1430, with conditions**

*President Narducci recused himself from the vote on this agenda item.*

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to issue a Letter of Censure on any and all teaching certificates held by Manny Palomarez II, with the condition that he speak to at least two middle school and high school teams about the bullying or hazing, and the additional modified condition of successful completion of the NFHS courses: "Bullying, Hazing and Inappropriate Behaviors" and "Protecting Students from Abuse" both of which at the educator's expense, with evidence provided to the Board staff, in a period of one year from the date of the State Board of Education meeting, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Recuse  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

**1. Manny Palomarez II, Case no. C-2017-1430 - Supporting Documents**

**G. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to issue a letter of censure on the teaching certificates of Shawn Rustad, Case no. C-2017-522**

*President Narducci recused himself from the vote on this agenda item.*

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to issue a Letter of Censure on any and all teaching certificates held by Shawn Rustad, with the additional modified condition of successful completion of the NFHS courses: "Bullying, Hazing and Inappropriate Behaviors" and "Protecting Students from Abuse" both of which at the educator's expense, with evidence provided to the Board staff, within one year, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye  
Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz  
Voting:  
Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Recuse  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

**1. Shawn Rustad, Case no. C-2017-522- Supporting Documents**

**H. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to approve the application for certification(s) of Brandon Brothers, Case no. C-2021-012096R**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to grant the application for certification of Brandon Brothers, despite evidence showing that Applicant engaged in unprofessional or immoral conduct because sufficient evidence exists that mitigates Applicant's conduct.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Armando Ruiz  
Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard  
Voting:  
Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Not Present  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

**1. Brandon Brothers, Case no. C-2021-012096R - Supporting Documents**

**10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**

Dr. Corr directed staff to work on rigorous alternatives to Algebra II.

Member Kaye encouraged the Board to consider more compressive data that impacts student outcomes.

President Narducci reminded staff to work on professionalism and ethics training at no cost to educators.

Board Meeting Adjourned at 1:21pm.