



Meeting Minutes

Printed : 7/1/2019 10:56 AM MST

June 24, 2019 Regular Board Meeting

06/24/2019 10:00 AM

1535 W. Jefferson

Room # 122

Phoenix, AZ 85007

Arizona State Board of Education

AMENDED Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, June 24, 2019, at 10:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122**, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007. A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 20 day of June, 2019.

Arizona State Board of Education

By:

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams", written over a horizontal line.

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PRAYER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Voting Members

Calvin Baker, Board Member
Patricia Welborn, Board Member
Christine Burton, Board Member by phone
Michele Kaye, Board Member
Lucas Narducci, President
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Armando Ruiz, Board Member by phone

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

President Narducci informed the Board that he did not have updates to report.

B. Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Hoffman recognized Susan Griffon, from Phoenix Union High School District, she also recognized Caitlyn Drake, from the Arizona Department of Education, and concluded by providing updates on Department activities.

1. Educator Recognition
2. Department Staff Recognition
3. Update on Department activities

C. Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Williams provided updates on Board staff activities and on the upcoming Board retreat.

1. Update on Board staff activities
2. Update on Board Retreat

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Marcia Cox, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Nichole Cohen, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Mark Del Maestro, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Dr. Mark Joraanstad, representing the Arizona School Administrators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Christine Accurso, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

3. CONSENT AGENDA

Member Welborn pulled item 3E for discussion.

Member Kaye pulled item 3I for discussion.

A motion was made to approve items 3A-3D and 3F, 3G, 3H, 3J, 3K, and 3L from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. Approval of the Arizona State University Special Education educator preparation program leading to educator certification
- B. Approval of the University of Phoenix Elementary Education educator preparation program leading to educator certification
- C. Approval of the American College of Education Educational Leadership educator preparation program leading to educator certification
- D. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver
- E. Approval of ACT and SAT Cut Score Recommendations

Audra Ahumada, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Matt Strom, representing Queen Creek Unified School District, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board approve the recommended Menu of Assessments Cut Scores for ACT and SAT.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - No

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- F. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds
- G. Approval of the contract with the Arizona State Board of Education and the United States Department of Agriculture for the Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Program
- H. Approval of the contract with the Association State Public Health Nutritionist's Mini Collaboration Improvement and innovation Network (COIIN): Farm to Early Care Education (ECE) Project
- I. AMENDED - Approval of the Funding Summary and School Awards for the FY 2020 School Safety Program - AMENDED

Melissa Conner, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Callie Kozlak, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Member Kaye made a motion that the Board approve the FY2020 School Safety Program Funding Summary based on 114 previously approved sites and the FY2020 School Safety Program Awardees.

Deputy Director Baden suggested that the Arizona Department of Education bring a recommendation on how to spend the additional money to the August Board meeting.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - No
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- J. Approval of the Special Education Advisory Panel's proposed new members, renewing members, and those with role changes
- K. Approval of appointment to the Professional Practices Advisory Committee
 - 1. Resume and Application of Appointee - Supporting Documents
- L. Approval of the hearing officer's recommendations to deny the appeal for certification for reasons that do not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct for Thomas Romano, Case No. 2019-001

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

The Board recessed at 11:30 a.m. and reconvened at 11:39 a.m.

Executive Director Williams noted that all comments made electronically were provided to State

Board members prior to the Board meeting.

Senator Sylvia Allen, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Representative Kelly Townsend, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Superintendent Diane Douglas, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Marcia Cox, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Karen Lambourne, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Angelina Ridenour, representing Purple for Parents, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Michael Clark, representing Center for Arizona Policy, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Tammy S. for Glen Spencer, representing Aunt Rita's Foundation, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Christine Sbacea, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Marlene Hinton, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Catherine Barrett, representing Purple for Parents, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Nichole Cohen, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Pat Lister, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Frank Lister, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Brad Bilski, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Sharon Moss, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Scott Weinberg, representing Purple for Parents, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Ashley Davis, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Lesa Antone, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and

addressed the Board

Forest Moriarty, representing Purple for Parents, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Jennifer Reynolds, representing Mommy Lobby Arizona, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Kristen Williamson, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Madeline Adelman, representing GLSEN Phoenix, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Velvet Jones, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Anna Varney, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Holly Brimhall, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Julie Spilsbury, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Jamie Snow, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Jasan Val Cruz, representing Arizona Coalition to End Sexual & Domestic Violence, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Maren Butcher, representing Big Ocean Women, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Gina Rey, representing Mommy Lobby Arizona, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Lisa Fink, representing Mommy Lobby Arizona, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Kristi Bencomo, representing Mommy Lobby Arizona, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Julie Mills, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Dolores Austin, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Linda Rizzo, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Kurt Rohrs, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Gayle Coletto, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and

addressed the Board

Michelle Ballantyne, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Janette Hansen, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Christine Hitchcock, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Betty Breeden, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Cara Palmer, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Holly Ray, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Rustin Pearce, representing LD 25 Republican Party, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

The Board recessed at 1:50 p.m. and reconvened at 1:55 p.m.

Veronica Corcoran, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Jodee Huish, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Marisol Garcia, representing Arizona Education Association, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Dorene Haley, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Tory Roberg, representing Secular Coalition for Arizona, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Roberta Stapley, representing Family Dynamics International, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Alma Engel, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Nicholas Martin, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Cipprian Jivcu, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Merissa Hamilton, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Chris King, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Sean Rickert, representing Pima Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Dr. Mark Joraanstad, representing the Arizona School Administrators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Rebecca McHood, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but was not present and did not address the Board

Kary Perez, representing Purple for Parents, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but was not present and did not address the Board

Jennifer Lewis, representing LD 12 Rita District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but was not present and did not address the Board

Paul Parisi, representing 4Tucson, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but was not present and did not address the Board

Dr. Bob Branch, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but was not present and did not address the Board

Dr. Anne Hawkins, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but was not present and did not address the Board

5. GENERAL SESSION

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures on R7-2-303 Sex Education

The Board held discussion around possible action to open rulemaking procedures on R7-2-303 Sex Education.

No motion was made for this item.

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures on Article 10 and Article 11 School District Procurement

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking procedures on Article 10 and Article 11 regarding School District Procurement.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

6. STUDY SESSION: Presentation and discussion regarding A-F component scoring and an A-F Accountability model for school districts

Item 6 was tabled for the August Board meeting.

7. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

8. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 8A1-8A4, 8B and 8C.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Laurie Brown, Case no. C-2018-199

a. Laurie Brown, Case no. C-2018-199 - Supporting Documents

2. Sarah Eary, Case no. C-2016-594

a. Sarah Eary, Case no. C-2016-594 - Supporting Documents

3. Susan Haskell, Case no. C-2017-535

a. Susan Haskell, Case no. C-2017-535 - Supporting Documents

4. Andrew Hensley, Case no. C-2018-390

a. Andrew Hensley, Case no. C-2018-390 - Supporting Documents

B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1307(A), held by:

1. Larry Canepa, Case no. C-2018-284

a. Larry Canepa, Case no. C-2018-284 - Supporting Documents

C. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by Ted Komada, Case no. C-2018-032

1. Ted Komada, Case no. C-2018-032

a. Ted Komada, Case no. C-2018-032 - Supporting Documents

9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Tori Carrasco, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

10. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

Superintendent Hoffman pulled item 10A5 for discussion.

A motion was made to approve items 10A1-10A4 and 10A6-10A8.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Kathy Hoffman

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Elynn Colaianni, Case no. C-2018-311
 - a. Elynn Colaianni, Case no. C-2018-311 - Supporting Documents
2. David Cox, Case no. C-2017-597
 - a. David Cox, Case no. C-2017-597 - Supporting Documents
3. Terrence Culver, Case no. C-2017-307
 - a. Terrence Culver, Case no. C-2017-307 - Supporting Documents
4. James Hepting, Case no. C-2018-616
 - a. James Hepting, Case no. C-2018-616 - Supporting Documents
5. Leann Higbee, Case no. C-2018-110

Members held discussion around this item.

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Negotiated Settlement Agreement, with conditions, for Leann Higbee, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 6-1.

Superintendent Hoffman abstained from voting.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Abstain
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Leann Higbee, Case no. C-2018-110 - Supporting Documents

6. Daniel Reisenbigler, Case no. C-2019-046

a. Daniel Reisenbigler, Case no. C-2019-046 - Supporting Documents

7. Adriana Schmidlin, Case no. C-2017-837

a. Adriana Schmidlin, Case no. C-2017-837 - Supporting Documents

8. Craig Young, Case no. C-2018-416

a. Craig Young, Case no. C-2018-416 - Supporting Documents

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Nicholas Collier, Case no. C-2018-339

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and the Recommendation of the PPAC, and revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Nicholas Collier, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Nicholas Collier, Case no. C-2018-339 - Supporting Documents

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Marla Montes, Case no. C-2018-063, C-2018-063-2

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC, and revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Marla Montes, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Marla Montes, Case no. C-2018-063, C-2018-063-2 - Supporting Documents

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Christopher Richardson, Case No. C-2017-658

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC, and revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Christopher Richardson, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker
Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Christopher Richardson, Case No. C-2017-658 - Supporting Documents

- E. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to approve the application for certification(s) of Stacey Brand, Case no. C-2018-341-2R

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC, and approve the application for certification of Stacey Brand.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye
Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Stacey Brand, Case no. C-2018-341-2R - Supporting Documents

- F. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application

for certification(s) of Tori Carrasco, Case no. C-2018-653R, for a period of 3 years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC, and deny the application for certification of Tori Carrasco, and that she be prohibited from reapplying for certification for a period of three-years.

Motion passed 7-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

1. Tori Carrasco, Case no. C-2018-653R - Supporting Documents

11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Member Welborn asked that the application appeal process be reviewed by Board staff for upcoming meetings. She went on to praise President Narducci on his leadership during this Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 3:03 p.m.