

**Minutes**  
**State Board of Education**  
**Monday, August 23, 2010**

The Arizona State Board of Education held a regular meeting at the Arizona Department of Education, 1535 West Jefferson, Room 417, Phoenix, Arizona. The meeting was called to order at 9:05 AM.

**Members Present:**

Dr. Vicki Balentine  
Mr. Jacob Moore  
Dr. John Haeger  
Ms. Amy Hamilton  
Dr. James Horton  
Ms. Eileen Klein  
Mr. Gregory Miller  
Mr. Jaime Molera  
Ms. Diane Ortiz-Parsons  
Mr. Thomas Tyree

**Members Absent:**

Supt. Tom Horne

Pledge of allegiance and moment of silence  
Roll call

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

1. Appointment to the Career and Technical Education Advisory Committee
2. Other items as necessary

Dr. Balentine stated Mr. Tyree will represent the Board on the Career and Technical Education Committee and the Arizona Skills Commission.

The process to establish the Teacher and Principal Evaluation Task Force has begun. Dr. Balentine said the Board was tasked with completing and implementing the new framework for teacher and principal evaluations.

Dr. Balentine asked for a Study Session meeting in late September or early October to review the Move on when Ready requirements and review the Board's goals in a one to three year time line. Mr. Yanez will contact the Board members to coordinate the time and date of the meeting.

Ms. Klein was asked to provide information on the Race to the Top Phase II interview.

B. Superintendent's Report

Report provide by Ms. Margaret Dugan on behalf of Supt. Horne.

Ms. Dugan recognized the Highly Qualified Professionals Unit for the national recognition on achieving equity in teacher distribution. Ms. Dugan stated the US Department of Education was very impressed with Arizona's model and asked ADE to present at the national Title IIA conference held in June.

The Certification Outreach Unit participated in the Great Arizona Teach-In, Education Career Fair. The annual event is to recruit qualified educators in to Arizona schools. Guidance and assistance was provided for educators to become appropriately certified and highly qualified.

Ms. Dugan also recognized the Education Services and Resources Division for the 35<sup>th</sup> Annual Summer Conference held by the Career and Technical Education Unit in July. Over 1100 teachers, administrators, counselors, business and industry leaders, and high school students attended. The conference provided opportunities to learn connect and discover innovative solutions, share best practices, and network at one of CTE's highly regarded events.

Ms. Cathy Poplin, Deputy Associate Superintendent for Education and Technology was elected to be the chair of Arizona's State Educational Technology Director's Association. Ms. Dugan said Ms. Poplin will be chair of SETDA for one year.

Under the leadership of Associate Superintendent Kathy Hrabluk the K-12 Literacy Unit in conjunction with Cambium Learning, sponsored the Desert Canyon Institute. Over 600 Arizona educators attended the three day conference. National experts including leaders from Florida, Colorado and Kansas shared the latest research, evidence based strategies and sound professional development.

The Early Childhood Education Unit participated in the 19<sup>th</sup> Annual National Association of the Education of Young Children's Institute for Professional Development held in June. Staff from the Early Childhood Education Unit offered sessions on program quality improvement and using ongoing Progress monitoring tools to guide instruction.

Ms. Dugan commended the Migrant Education Program for the various summer programs such as the National Close-Up New Americans Program in Washington, D.C. and the NASA Space Camp.

#### C. Board Member Reports

Ms. Klein stated Arizona's interview for the Race to the Top Phase II application took place in Washington D.C. on August 11<sup>th</sup>. The Governor appointed the following five individuals to represent the Arizona, Ms. Eileen Klein, Mr. Jacob Moore, Mr. Vince Yanez, Dr. Karen Butterfield, Dr. Michael Cowan and Ms. Rebecca Gau supported the team as an alternate. The interview consisted of a 30 minute presentation and approximately 60 minutes of questions and answers. Ms. Klein stated the presentation was close to flawless and the answers to the panel's questions demonstrated the team had a good understanding of the application and a strong commitment on behalf of the state. Ms. Klein stated all of the materials from the interview will be available to the public on-line and the USDOE was expected to announce the winners on August 24<sup>th</sup>. Ms. Klein thanked everyone who supported the process.

Dr. Balentine asked to return to the Superintendent's report.

Ms. Ortiz-Parsons attended the NASBE New Board Members Conference held in Arlington, Virginia and stated she received valuable information; Ms. Ortiz-Parsons encouraged new members to attend next year if possible.

Mr. Moore stated it was an honor and privilege to be one of the five members to represent Arizona thanked everyone involved in preparing for the RTTT interview.

Mr. Miller stated he attended the Rodell Foundation Conference and commended the foundation for their hard work.

Dr. Horton also attended the Career and Technical Education conference and stated he was very impressed with the committee's hard work to establish the specific criteria and standards for each of the career and technical fields. Dr. Balentine asked if the CTE Advisory Committee and the Skills Commission could provide an official update.

D. Director's Report

Mr. Yanez thanked the team involved to prepare for the RTTT interview.

Mr. Yanez stated the Board would need to address in a future meeting the graduation requirements rule due to the approved CCSS. The changes would affect the class of 2014-2015.

Mr. Yanez requested to pull items 4L and 4M

Dr. Haeger left the room at 9:08 AM and returned at 9:28 AM

2. CONSENT AGENDA

- A. Consideration to approve State Board of Education minutes for:
  - 1. June 28, 2010
  - 2. June 28, 2010 – Executive Session
  
- B. Consideration to approve contract abstracts:
  - 1. Learn & Serve America Grant FY 2010-2011
  - 2. Learn & Serve America Grant FY 2010-2011
  - 3. AZ ESA Professional Development Project
  - 4. 2011 Migrant Education Program additional allocations
  - 5. 2011 Migrant Education Program (PASS Program)
  - 6. ARRA Title IID Discretionary Sub-Grantee Approval
  - 7. Intel® Teach Affiliate Program 2010 Grant Amendment
  - 8. Title I Even Start Continuation Funds
  - 9. 21<sup>st</sup> Century Community Learning Center Grant Awards Cycle 9
  - 10. Title IID Discretionary Sub-Grantee Approval
  
- C. Consideration to accept funds from the Qwest Foundation, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-204
  
- D. Consideration to accept the recommendations of the Career Ladder Advisory Committee and approve the following Career Ladder programs for fiscal year 2010 - 2011:
  - 1. Agua Fria UHSD
  - 2. Amphitheater USD
  - 3. Apache Junction UHSD
  - 4. Catalina Foothills USD
  - 5. Cave Creek USD
  - 6. Chandler USD
  - 7. Crane ESD
  - 8. Creighton ESD
  - 9. Dysart USD
  - 10. East Valley Institute of Technology
  - 11. Flagstaff USD

12. Flowing Wells USD
13. Ganado USD
14. Kyrene ESD
15. Litchfield ESD
16. Mesa USD
17. Patagonia UHSD
18. Peoria USD
19. Safford USD
20. Santa Cruz Valley UHSD
21. Scottsdale USD
22. Show Low USD
23. Sunnyside USD
24. Tanque Verde USD
25. Tolleson ESD
26. Window Rock USD

- E. Consideration to accept the voluntary surrender of the teaching Credentials for the following individuals:
1. Tyler A. Townley
  2. Douglas W. Ballance
  3. Geoffrey D. Warren
- F. Presentation, discussion and consideration to accept the finding of fact, conclusions of law and recommendations of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee and deny the teacher certification application for James Stroup, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-534.01
- G. Consideration to authorize the Arizona Agriculture Youth Organization license plate fund, pursuant to A.R.S § 15-791 Mr. Yanez
- H. Consideration to appoint the following individuals to the Data Systems Task Force, pursuant to HB 2733 Mr. Yanez
- I. Consideration to approve school district applications for the Arizona On-Line Instruction program, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-808 Mr. Yanez
- J. Consideration to appoint task force members for the purpose of developing the teacher and principal evaluation framework, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-203(A)(38) – SB 1040 Mr. Yanez

*Dr. Balentine and Mr. Molera did not vote due to item B.*  
*Mr. Moore moved to approve the consent agenda as amended*  
*Motion second by Mr. Tyree*  
*Motion Passes*

3. CALL TO THE PUBLIC  
 No requests to speak

#### 4. GENERAL SESSION

##### A. Presentation and discussion regarding the 2009 Arts Education Census

Dr. Butterfield stated this would be the first time the results for the 2009 Arts Education Census would be presented, thanked the team who worked on the project and introduced Ms. Lynn Tuttle.

Ms. Tuttle stated 22 schools participated in a survey as well as a subset of charter schools. Ms. Tuttle provided information on the key findings per grade level including the numbers of students that currently have no access to an arts program or class. Music and visual arts have the strongest representation of arts course work.

Mr. Tyree asked for further information on the budget available for the arts community. Ms. Tuttle stated she did not have the information but would gather the data requested and report the information to the Board.

Mr. Molera asked if Ms. Tuttle had any request for action by the Board or a request for advocacy, Ms. Tuttle encouraged Board members to be part to be part of the committee that oversees arts education. Mr. Molera stated the Board would like to have more concrete recommendations. Ms. Tuttle stated she would work with Mr. Yanez and bring the recommendations to the Board.

A copy of the power point presentation and handouts can be provided by the State Board office upon request.

##### B. Presentation and discussion regarding the 2010 AIMS Results

Dr. Robert Franciosi reviewed the trends for the four AIMS subject areas; reading, writing, science, and mathematics. The trends presented provided information over the past six years starting in 2005.

In 2010 the results for reading reflect steady increase in most grades. The results for writing were impacted due to the eliminating the test in grades three, four and eight. The results only reflect grades five, six and seven. Science is only administered in three grades, this assessment started in 2008 and there has also been a steady cline. Results for the math portion of the assessment reflect a decline in all grades tested. The decline could be due to the 2010 amendments to the test which made it more difficult. Further detail information was provided for the math assessment such as the five strands assessed.

##### C. Presentation and discussion regarding AIMS Augmentation survey results for 2010

Dr. Franciosi provided information on the total number of students who passes the AIMS assessment by augmenting their scores.

As required by the Board a survey was conducted to determine how many students augmented their scores and 245 out of 297 schools responded to the survey. A graph of the number of students who used augmentation was provided.

Dr. Balentine asked what the current percentage is on the scale score, Mr. Yanez stated the percentage for this school year is 5%.

##### D. Presentation, discussion and consideration to approve specific additions to the Common Core State Standards in Mathematics and English Language Arts

Dr. Knuck provided a summary of the results of the Common Core State Standards survey. The survey

comments and the protocol for responding to the comments concerning the gaps were also reviewed. The results per survey were presented, this included the comments that required no action and the comments that prompted action and as a result changes were made. Dr. Knuck stated the Board was provided a list of the recommended changes.

The English Language Arts Additions are as follows:

- Reading standards for informational text K-5  
Addition of reading information and functional text in kindergarten and addition of reading functional text in grades 1-5
- Reading standards for informational text 6-12  
Addition of reading informational and functional text
- Writing standards K-5  
Addition of functional writing
- Writing standards 6-12  
Addition of functional writing
- Writing standards for literacy in history/social studies, science and technical subjects 6-12  
Addition of functional writing
- Writing standards K-5  
Addition of writing multiple sentences about a topic leading to writing paragraphs in grades 1-5

The Mathematics additions are as follows:

- Fourth grade operational and algebraic thinking  
Addition of problem solving based on the multiplication principle of counting (builds foundation for probability in middle grades; determined as gap in CCSS)
- Sixth grade number system  
Addition of conversions between expressions for positive rational numbers (explicit emphasis on multiple representations determined as gap in CCSS)
- High school discrete mathematics  
Addition of 4 standards supporting 4<sup>th</sup> credit courses in Discrete Mathematics and Modeling (standards were part of 2008 Mathematics Standard grades 11-12)

Dr. Haeger asked what the involvement of the state's Universities has been; Dr. Knuck stated higher education has been very involved throughout the whole process. Intel Math has also been part of the process.

Ms. Ortiz-Parsons and Ms. Hamilton said it was very helpful to include the sample information and thanked Dr. Knuck for all of the work presented.

Ms. Hamilton asked if the information will be posted online and if so when, Dr. Knuck stated early November is the target time to roll out the information.

*Dr. Horton moved to adopt the proposed additions to the Common Core State Standards in Mathematics and English Language Arts, as presented.*

*Ms. Ortiz-Parsons Second the motion*

*Motion passes*

- E. Presentation, discussion and consideration to approve the new assessment tool for Early Childhood Education

Ms. Kathy Hrabluk stated the federal government is requesting a new system to collect data for early childhood assessments and said Ms. Amy Corriveau would provide further information.

Ms. Corriveau said the proposed tool would enable ADE to submit accurate and reliable data for the federal reports and meet the new requirements that reliable preschool data be posted by each school district serving children with disabilities. The new tool also allows ADE to meet the requirements of the Office of Special Education Programs. Ms. Corriveau said upon completion of a rigorous review process the Early Childhood Assessment Review team identified one approved assessment tool. The vendor Teaching Strategies GOLD was chosen based on their receipt of the highest score using the rubric. The rubric and scope of work was created in the Spring of 2010.

Mr. Moore asked if there has been collaboration of First Things First, Ms. Corriveau stated the ADE has received collaboration from First Things First throughout the process.

*Mr. Moore move to award the Early Childhood assessment contract to Teaching Strategies GOLD*

*Motion second by Dr. Haeger*

*Motion passes*

Dr. Balentine asked to move to item K

- F. Presentation, discussion and consideration to accept the finding of fact, conclusions of law and recommendations of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee and grant the teacher certification application for Dexter Brown

Mr. Charles Easaw provided a summary of the PPAC case for Mr. Dexter Brown and stated Mr. Brown was present for questions.

The mitigating factor found by the PPAC was that the issue at Boys Town occurred in 1996 and there have been no related issues before or after.

The aggravating factors found are failure to disclose employment related allegations/findings to the state of Washington causing his application to be denied and letters of warning from Boys Town schools.

On July 13, 2010 the PPAC re-reviewed Mr. Brown's case and by a vote of 4 to 1 the PPAC recommended that the State Board approve Mr. Brown's application for certification.

*Mr. Miller moved to accept the finding of fact, conclusions of law and recommendations of the PPAC and grant the teacher certification application for Dexter Brown*

*Motion second by Mr. Moore*

*Motion passes*

- G. Presentation, discussion and consideration to accept the recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee and deny the applications for certification for Crystal Harris

Mr. Easaw stated Ms. Harris and her counsel received the notice of the meeting and were provided an overview of the PPAC case. Ms. Harris was not present.

An overview of the case was provided and the following are the aggravating factors found by the PPAC:

- The performance improvement plan due to unsatisfactory performance in January 2007
- Several allegations related to performance
- The November 2006 seriousness of breach of confidential information

Mitigating factors found by the PPAC:

- Children walking without shoes during a fire drill had removed their shoes prior to leaving the classroom and there was no time to put shoes back on

- The student who was dropped was slapping, biting, pinching, and kicking the applicant
- Letters of recommendation from professional staff were positive toward applicant
- Completion of masters degree since incident

By a vote of 5 to 0 the PPAC recommended that the State Board of Education deny Ms. Harris' application for certification.

*Mr. Molera moved to accept the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendations of the PPAC and deny the application for certification for Crystal Harris*

*Motion second by Mr. Tyree*

Ms. Klein asked if Ms. Harris holds any teaching certificates currently, Mr. Easaw stated the motion would deny both certificates held by Ms. Harris.

*Motion passes*

- H. Presentation, discussion and consideration to accept the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee and grant the teacher certification application for Ramon A. Salazar

Mr. Easaw stated Mr. Salazar received notification of the Board meeting and provided a summary of the case.

The mitigating factors found are:

- Letters of recommendation, in particular a letter from the high school principal from Mr. Salazar's current job
- Domestic Violence charges were dropped on March 11, 2009
- Candor exhibited before the committee

The PPAC found the following aggravating factors:

- He should have suggested the student go to counseling
- Blurred the boundary line between students and teachers

By a vote of 4 to 0 the PPAC recommended the State Board grant Mr. Salazar's application for certification.

Ms. Klein asked if the domestic violence incident was related or involved the student, Mr. Easaw stated the incident was not related.

Mr. Tyree asked if the content of the text messages was provided as part of the investigation. Mr. Easaw stated the content of the messages were not part of the investigation.

Mr. Moore stated the letter provided by the Superintendent was considered by the PPAC, Mr. Easaw stated the PPAC was provided with the letter but did not discuss the letter.

Mr. Molera asked if the item could be tabled in order to receive the specific information on the language needed to make the motion.

*Mr. Molera move to accept the PPAC's findings of fact*

*Second by Mr. Miller*

*Motion passes*

*Mr. Molera moved to revise the PPAC's conclusions of law to read as follows:*

*The conduct of Ramon Salazar as delineated above constitutes immoral or unprofessional conduct pursuant to A.R.S. section 15-534 (C) or (D) specifically the applicants conduct*



1. *Violates AACR 7-2-1308 (B) (15) which is engaging in conduct that would discredit the teaching profession*
2. *Makes the applicant unfit to teach and has an adverse effect on or within the school community*

*Motion second by Ms. Klein*

*Mr. Molera moved to deny Ramon Salazar's application for teacher certification*

*Second by Ms. Klein*

*Motion passes*

- I. Presentation, discussion and consideration accept the proposed settlement agreement and suspend the teaching certificates held by Nathan Stewart

Mr. Easaw provided a summary of the case and stated Mr. Stewart received notification of the meeting and the overview materials but was not present for the meeting.

Mr. Easaw stated subsequent to the filing of the complaint, discussions were undertaken to negotiate a settlement in lieu of a hearing. These negotiations resulted in the proposed settlement agreement which provides for a five-year suspension of certification, effective October 27, 2005 and ending October 27, 2010. Additionally in the event Mr. Stewart should reapply for certification in Arizona the State Board of Education will initiate a review hearing pursuant to A.R.S. 15-534(D).

The PPAC reviewed the proposed settlement agreement and recommended the State Board accept the agreement as presented.

*Moved to accept the proposed settlement agreement and suspend the teaching certificates held by Nathan Stewart*

*Motion second by Mr. Miller*

*Motion passes*

- J. Presentation, discussion and consideration to accept the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee and suspend the teaching certificates held by Travis Koppenhafer

Mr. Easaw stated Mr. Koppenhafer was not present; he lives out of state but did receive notification of the meeting. A summary of the PPAC case was provided.

After a review of Mr. Koppenhafer's actions of unprofessional conduct by a vote of 5 to 0 the PPAC recommended that the State Board suspend any and all teaching certificates held by Mr. Koppenhafer for a period of six months or until he submits proof of completing a Board staff approved anger management class.

Mr. Tyree asked if the applicant had a history of incidents, Mr. Easaw stated no history was found.

*Ms. Klein moved to accept the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the PPAC and suspend the teaching certificates held by Travis Koppenhafer*

*Motion second by Mr. Miller*

*Motion passes*

*Ms. Klein moved to suspend the teaching certificates for Travis Koppenhafer for 6 months with the requirement of providing proof of completing a Board staff approved anger management class and the requirement he appear before the State Board of Education in order to be reinstated*

*Motion second by Mr. Tyree*

*Motion passes*

Dr. Balentine requested a 10 minute break.

Board recessed at 12:14PM

Meeting reconvened at 12:22 PM

K. Presentation and discussion regarding the final report from the  
Performance Based Compensation System Task Force

Ms. Jan Amator introduced Ms. Moira Volk, Chair and Mr. John Kelly, Co-Chair of the Performance Based Compensation System Task Force.

Ms. Volk provided information on the process and history of the task force. A list of the task force responsibilities was also provided and an overview of the 2010 task force report.

Ms. Volk presented the 2006-2009 PBC Systems Plan Submission Rates which reached 97% by year 4. The first year reviewed only 75% of the plans were submitted and the submissions differed widely from district to district. The second year although the quality of the plans improved there was a decrease in submissions, only 67% were reported. By the third year of review submissions increased to 93% and the documentation received was more uniform. The feedback from districts reflected willingness to improve. The highest percentage was in year 4 with a 98% submission.

A review of the task force charges was provided and Ms. Volk stated the task force did not fulfill the charge of evaluating performance based compensation systems. This charge was not fulfilled because there were no requirements for districts to submit specified data, the task force was not a compliance committee and the districts could modify elements of the PBC plans. Ms. Volk said subsection C(1) did not coordinate with elements outlined in A.R.S. 15-977 C.

The following charges were met by the task force:

- Provided school districts with report at their review period
- Provided school district with feedback on off-year review of requested
- Provided summary of findings to House and Senate annually since 2006

The conclusions of ARS 15-920.01 (C) are as follows:

- Further study needed to assess impact of PBC systems on student achievement
- Continuation of yearly review recommended to determine if PBC systems are maintaining or improving

Examples of a good PBC plan and recommendations for PBC systems PBC elements were provided.

The recommendations for charter schools are:

- Charter schools not required to submit PBC plans
- Task force supports a comprehensive look at all PBC plans across Arizona
- Task force recommends charter schools to participate in yearly evaluation
- Charter schools could also benefit from review process that focuses on quality as well as innovation

The overarching goal of PBC systems is to improve student achievement.

Mr. Moore asked if the PBC Committee felt the need to continue, Ms. Volk stated the committee could continue to support and provide information.

Request to speak related to item 4K

- Mr. Joe Thomas, AEA Vice President. Mr. Thomas stated AEA has an extensive history of being in support of performance based compensations. AEA has also supported proposition 301 and the bill that created the task force.

Board returned to item 4F

- L. Presentation, discussion and consideration to open rulemaking procedures for proposed rules R7-2-609 and R7-2-610 regarding course options for Elementary and Secondary certificates

**Item Pulled**

- M. Presentation, discussion and consideration to open rulemaking procedures for proposed rules R7-2-601 and R7-2-604 regarding Definitions and Professional Preparation Programs

**Item Pulled**

- N. Presentation, discussion and consideration to close the rulemaking record and adopt proposed rules R7-2-616 (F) (G) and (H) regarding Interim Supervisor Certificates PreK-12, Interim Principal Certificates PreK-12 and Interim Superintendent Certificates PreK-12

Ms. Jan Amator stated the Board opened the rulemaking process on May 24, 2010. The effect of the amendments would be to delineate specific courses that must be included if an applicant is applying for certification under the R7-2-609.B.2.11. The purpose of these changes is to tighten the requirements to include courses that are essential to the core fundamentals of teaching at both the elementary and secondary levels.

A public hearing was held on June 23, 2010 and no public comment was received. Ms. Amator requested the Board close the rulemaking and adopt the proposed amendments, effective October 1, 2010.

*Mr. Miller moved to close the rulemaking record and adopt proposed rules R7-2-616 (F) (G) and (H), regarding Interim Supervisor Certificates PreK-12, Interim Principal Certificates PreK-12 and Interim Superintendent certificates PreK-12*

*Motion second by Mr. Tyree*

*Motion passes*

- O. Presentation, discussion and consideration to authorize staff to make the necessary arrangements with the Office of Administrative Hearings to consider the petition filed by the ADE regarding the Clifton Unified School District, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-241

Mr. Yanez stated the Board is represented by the Solicitor General's office for this matter.

Under Arizona's school accountability system the State Board of Education may intervene in the operations of a failing school if, after a hearing, the Board determines that the school failed to properly implement its school improvement plan. Mr. Yanez provided a summary of A.R.S. 15-241 (W).

On August 12, 2010 the Arizona Department of Education filed a petition with the Board and the petition asserts that Clifton High School has failed to implement its school improvement plan and requests that the Board appoint a governmental nonprofit or private organization to fully manage and make all academic and financial decisions concerning the high school in accordance with A.R.S. 15-241 (W). The hearing in this matter would be to determine:

1. Whether the school failed to implement its improvement plan; and
2. What action is appropriate under A.R.S. 15-241 (W).

Mr. Yanez said the Board may conduct the hearing itself or utilize the services of the Office of Administration Hearings (OAH). Should the Board refer this matter to OAH the hearing would be conducted by an administrative law judge (ALJ). The findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the ALJ would be forwarded to the Board for final action.

Mr. Yanez requested that the Board authorize staff to make necessary arrangements with the Office of Administrative Hearings to proceed with the consideration of the petition filed by the ADE regarding the Clifton Unified School District.

Mr. Molera asked why the OAH was not considered for the Roosevelt School District hearing. Mr. Yanez stated procedural issues were a factor.

*Mr. Molera moved to authorize staff to make the necessary arrangements with the Office of Administrative Hearings to consider the petition filed by the ADE regarding the Clifton Unified School District, pursuant to A.R.S. 15-241*

*Motion second by Mr. Miller*

*Motion passes*

- P. Presentation, discussion and consideration to accept the proposed settlement agreement and expire the substitute teaching certificate held by Dr. James M. Houston. The Board may convene in executive session, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 A(3) and (4), to receive legal advice and/or consult with and instruct counsel on the Board's position in this matter. The Board may, in general session, take action to authorize Board counsel to act on the Board's behalf in this matter in accordance with instruction given in executive session

Dr. Balentine asked if the members had no particular need to convene in Executive Session the item could be addressed in general session and Mr. Yanez and Mr. Easaw could proceed with an overview of the item.

Mr. Easaw stated the Investigations Unit had documented evidence Dr. Houston received the certified notice of the hearing. An overview of the settlement agreement was provided.

*Dr. Balentine moved to deny the proposed settlement agreement to expire the substitute teaching certificate held by Dr. James M. Houston*

*Motion second by Mr. Molera*

*Motion passes*

## 5. ADJOURN

*Dr. Haeger moved to adjourn*

*Motion second by Ms. Ortiz-Parsons*

*Motion passes*

Meeting adjourned at 12:35 PM