



**January 23, 2023 Regular Board Meeting**

**01/23/2023 10:00 AM**

1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower  
2nd Floor Conference Room  
Phoenix, AZ 85007

---

**Arizona State Board of Education**

**AMENDED Agenda**

**NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, January 23, 2023 at 10:00 A.M.**

The **Monday, January 23, 2023** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. This means that the public has the opportunity to participate in-person or virtually.

Please note the location of the **Monday, January 23, 2023** State Board of Education meeting: 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, 2nd Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, AZ 85007

A copy of the meeting agenda is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically or virtually.

Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A) (3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The **Monday, January 23, 2023** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. Please see below on how to access the meeting and provide public comment on agenda items, regardless of the chosen access method.

**Accessing the State Board of Education Meeting Virtually**

**To watch the State Board meeting via computer or a smartphone with a data plan/Wi-Fi:**

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit [azsbe.az.gov](https://azsbe.az.gov)
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click “ok”
- When the meeting starts, you will see a “live” video. If you do not see this, and the meeting’s start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board’s office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

**Procedure for Submitting a Public Comment (Please read through each option carefully):**

**Written Comment:**

Written comments for the meeting will be accepted by:

- email [inbox@azsbe.az.gov](mailto:inbox@azsbe.az.gov)
- fax to (602) 542-3046
- USPS to 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, Suite 300, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

**The deadline to submit a written comment will be Friday, January 20, 2023 at 12:00 PM.**

Written comments received after the deadline, including those that are mailed but not received by staff, will not be posted and will not be provided to members.

Written comments will not be read into the record, however, staff will post all written comments received by the deadline on the Board's agenda by **Friday, January 20, 2023 at 5:00 PM.**

**Virtual Verbal Comment:**

Individuals must register to submit a virtual verbal comment at the meeting.

Please use the link below to register.

**The deadline to register for a virtual verbal comment will be Friday, January 20, 2023 at 12:00 PM.**

By registering, you are submitting a request to speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak virtually during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

The name in which you register **MUST** match the name on the account when signing in to the meeting to speak. Prior to the meeting, you may need to download the Zoom application to your device and create an account to ensure name matching. Board staff will only call speakers once and then will move on to the next speaker. If you miss your turn, Board staff will attempt again at the end of the list. The order in which names are called will be in the order in which the registrations are received.

Individuals who register after the noon deadline on **Friday, January 20, 2023** will not be provided

the opportunity to give virtual verbal public comment at the meeting.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine at which public comment agenda item you will be called.

All Board policies in regard to public comment at in-person meetings are transferable to virtual verbal public comment for meetings. Virtual verbal public comment is limited to three minutes, unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting.

Please use this link to register for a **virtual** verbal public comment:

[https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN\\_Lb--rLkDRr6eZiIX0gdT9A](https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_Lb--rLkDRr6eZiIX0gdT9A)

### **In-Person Verbal Public Comment:**

Individuals must register in advance to submit an in-person verbal comment at the meeting.

No requests to speak will be accepted on the morning of the meeting.

Please use the link below to register.

**The deadline to register for an in-person verbal comment will be Friday, January 20, 2023 at 12:00 PM.**

By registering, you are submitting a request-to-speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

By registering, you are also informing Board staff that you will be present in-person at the meeting to provide your public comment. Staff will not switch your registration to virtual if you fail to attend the meeting in-person.

Board staff will only call speakers one time. If a speaker is not ready and available to comment at that time, staff will move on to the next speaker. If you miss your turn, Board staff will attempt again at the end of the list. The order in which names are called will be in the order in which the registrations are received.

Individuals who register after the noon deadline on **Friday, January 20, 2023** will not be provided the opportunity to give an in-person public comment at the meeting.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine at which public comment agenda item you will be called.

In-person verbal public comments are limited to three minutes, unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting.

Please use this link to register for in-person verbal comment:

<https://forms.gle/EHmVGyJVBi6kGFq8>

If you need assistance with registering, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

If you do not have internet access to register for a virtual comment, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

DATED AND POSTED this 17th day of January, 2023.

Arizona State Board of Education

By:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Sean Ross". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Sean" and the last name "Ross" clearly distinguishable.

Sean Ross

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

**1. Presentation of Candidates and Election of State Board of Education Officers for 2023**

**2. BUSINESS REPORTS**

A. President's Report

1. Recognition of Board service: Christine Burton
2. Welcome of Superintendent Horne

B. Superintendent's Report

1. Department of Education Updates

C. Executive Director's Report

1. Introduction remarks from Director Ross and introduction of Deputy Aaron Wonders

**3. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

**4. CONSENT AGENDA**

- A. Approval of the addition of the Avant Standards-based Measurement of Proficiency (STAMP) 4S – English test and the ACTFL Assessment of Performance toward Proficiency in Languages (AAPPL) – English test added to the Seal of Biliteracy Program menu of options for English proficiency.
- B. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base

- C. Receipt of the FY23 Move On When Reading Annual Report
- D. Approval to award contracts between the State Board of Education and approved Adult Education Local Providers for educational services in Program Year 2023-2024
- E. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject-Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver
- F. Approval to award eight new charter schools the Arizona Charter School Program Grant, as determined by the ADE Arizona Charter School Program team
- G. Approval of the hearing officer's recommendations to deny the appeal for certification for reasons that do not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct for Rachieda Warnton, Case No. 2022-018
- H. Receipt of the Algebra I, Algebra II, and Geometry Subject Competency Review
- I. Approval of additional oral history resources pursuant to Laws 2022, Chapter 303

## **5. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

### **6. GENERAL SESSION**

- A. Presentation and discussion of the Move On When Reading (MOWR) K-3 program, to include the discussion of the annual MOWR report
- B. Presentation, discussion, and possible action to open rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-602.02 Arizona Teacher Leader Professional Standards
- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures for A.A.C. Article 15, Empowerment Scholarship Accounts
- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding 2021-2022 A-F Accountability Appeals
- E. Presentation and discussion regarding the educator discipline report
- F. ITEM ADDED - Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals - ITEM ADDED

## **7. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

### **8. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

- A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:
  - 1. Cameron Alvarez, Case no. C-2022-001570
    - a. Cameron Alvarez, Case no. C-2022-001570 - Supporting Documents
  - 2. Randy Armstrong, Case no. C-2022-002713
    - a. Randy Armstrong, Case no. C-2022-002713 - Supporting Documents
  - 3. Michael Bolligar, Case no. C-2021-012955
    - a. Michael Bolligar, Case no. C-2022-012955 - Supporting Documents
  - 4. Mohamed El Nounw, Case no. C-2022-001006

- a. Mohamed El Nounw, Case no. C-2022-001006 - Supporting Documents
5. Tanamonic Gonzalez, Case no. C-2022-001656
  - a. Tanamonic Gonzalez, Case no. C-2022-001656 - Supporting Documents
6. Lyda Harris, Case no. C-2022-002190
  - a. Lyda Harris, Case no. C-2022-002190 - Supporting Documents
7. Angelica Head, Case no. C-2022-002148
  - a. Angelica Head, Case no. C-2022-002148 - Supporting Documents
8. Michael Irving, Case no. C-2022-000971
  - a. Michael Irving, Case no. C-2022-000971 - Supporting Documents
9. Jordan Javier, Case no. C-2022-002462
  - a. Jordan Javier, Case no. C-2022-002462 - Supporting Documents
10. Cory Kapahulehua, Case no. C-2022-002700
  - a. Cory Kapahulehua, Case no. C-2022-002700 - Supporting Documents
11. Marissa Krummel, Case no. C-2022-000646
  - a. Marissa Krummel, Case no. C-2022-000646 - Supporting Documents
12. Kristine Lindquist, Case no. C-2022-001087
  - a. Kristine Lindquist, Case no. C-2022-001087 - Supporting Documents
13. Annette Oglevee, Case no. C-2021-013247
  - a. Annette Oglevee, Case no. C-2021-013247 - Supporting Documents
14. Daniel Schulz, Case no. C-2021-012459
  - a. Daniel Schulz, Case no. C-2021-012459 - Supporting Documents
15. Brandon Shinault, Case no. C-2022-002984
  - a. Brandon Shinault, Case no. C-2022-002984 - Supporting Documents
16. Ramajana Slomic, Case no. C-2022-001821
  - a. Ramajana Slomic, Case no. C-2022-001821 - Supporting Documents
17. William Thorpe, Case no. C-2022-000842
  - a. William Thorpe, Case no. C-2022-000842 - Supporting Documents
18. Joseph Valle, Case no. C-2021-004764

a. Joseph Valle, Case no. C-2021-004764 - Supporting Documents

19. Jeff Van Handel, Case no. C-2016-000202

a. Jeff Van Handel, Case no. C-2016-000202 - Supporting Documents

20. Shawn Watson, Case no. C-2022-002044

a. Shawn Watson, Case no. C-2022-002044 - Supporting Documents

21. Sheri Whinery, Case no. C-2022-002979

a. Sheri Whinery, Case no. C-2022-002979 - Supporting Documents

B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:

1. Mark Lindrud, Case no. C-2022-003087

a. Mark Lindrud, Case no. C-2022-003087 - Supporting Documents

2. Joshua Silverthorn, Case no. C-2021-009267

a. Joshua Silverthorn, Case no. C-2021-009267 - Supporting Documents

C. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-534.04(C), held by:

1. Hernandez Cortez Evans, Case no. C-2022-000968

a. Hernandez Cortez Evans, Case no. C-2022-000968 - Supporting Documents

2. Russell Zysett, Case no. C-2022-001935

a. Russell Zysett, Case no. C-2022-001935 - Supporting Documents

D. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1307(A), held by:

1. Michelle Bauer, Case no. C-2022-001373

a. Michelle Bauer, Case no. C-2022-001373- Supporting Documents

2. Benjamin Turk, Case no. C-2022-001724

a. Benjamin Turk, Case no. C-2022-001724 - Supporting Documents

E. Approval of the Summary Suspension of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1309, held by:

1. Florencia Cruz Sustar, Case no. C-2022-001743

a. Florencia Cruz Sustar, Case no. C-2022-001743 - Supporting Documents

## **9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

## **10. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Marciela Nunez, Case no. C-2022-002108

a. Marciela Nunez, Case no. C-2022-002108 - Supporting Documents

2. Shaun Reynolds, Case no. C-2022-001578

a. Shaun Reynolds, Case no. C-2022-001578 - Supporting Documents

3. Liora Sitelman, Case no. C-2022-000916

a. Liora Sitelman, Case no. C-2022-000916 - Supporting Documents

4. Juan Villafane, Case no. C-2022-001453

a. Juan Villafane, Case no. C-2022-001453 - Supporting Documents

5. Christopher Whittaker Case no. C-2022-001158

a. Christopher Whittaker Case no. C-2022-001158 - Supporting Documents

B. Presentation discussion and possible action on the complaint against Joshua G. Bahen, Case no. C-2021-011934

1. Joshua Bahen, Case no. C-2021-011934 - Supporting Documents

C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the certificates of Parker Baty, Case no. C-2021-012273, for a period of three years

1. Parker Baty, Case no. C-2021-012273 - Supporting Documents

D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the certificates of Todd Cheesman, Case no. C-2021-012782, for a five years

1. Todd Cheesman, Case no. C-2021-012782 - Supporting Documents

E. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificates of Mark Ewy, Case no. C-2021-012968, for a a period of two years

1. Mark Ewy, Case no. C-2021-012968 - Supporting Documents

F. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the certificates of Stephanie Voss, Case no. C-2022-000558, for a period of five years

1. Stephanie Voss, Case no. C-2022-000558 - Supporting Documents

## **11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**