



Meeting Minutes  
Printed : 12/27/2018 3:38 PM PST

**April 23, 2018 Regular Board Meeting**  
**04/23/2018 09:00 AM**  
1535 W. Jefferson  
Room # 122  
Phoenix, AZ 85007



## Arizona State Board of Education

### Agenda

#### NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, April 23, 2018, at 9:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122**, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007. A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 12th day of April, 2018.

Arizona State Board of Education

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams".

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

9:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM, PRAYER AND ROLL CALL

## Attendees

---

### Voting Members

Lucas Narducci, President  
Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President  
Diane Douglas, Superintendent  
Calvin Baker, Board Member  
Jill Broussard, Board Member  
Christine Burton, Board Member  
Dr. Rita Cheng, Board Member  
Michele Kaye, Board Member  
Janice Mak, Board Member  
Jared Taylor, Board Member

---

### 1. BUSINESS REPORTS

#### A. President's Report

Senator Kimberly Yee provided an update to the Board regarding computer science.

##### 1. Computer Science Resolution

#### B. Superintendent's Report

##### 1. Update on Department's Activities

Superintendent Douglas provided an update on the Department's activities.

#### C. Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

1. Information on schedule for educator certification rulemaking
2. Update from Board Staff

### 2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Bailey Hershberger, representing Phoenix Union High School District, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak form but did not address the Board.

Bruce Luna, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak form but did not address the Board.

Mark Plitzuweit, representing EdKey Inc., & Sequoia Schools, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak form but did not address the Board.

### 3. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made to approve 3A - 3E.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Diane Douglas - Yes  
Calvin Baker - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes  
Jared Taylor - Yes

- A. Consideration to approve the contract with Arizona State Board of Education and the United States Department of Agriculture for the Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Program.
- B. Approval of Structured English Immersion course trainers and training programs
- C. Consideration to Award Mathematics and Science Partnerships Program Funding to Five Local Education Agencies
- D. Approval of appointment to the WestEd Board of Directors
  - 1. (c) Approval of appointment to the WestEd Board of Directors - Supporting Documents
- E. Approval to sunset the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC)

#### **4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Jennifer Reynolds, representing Mommy Lobby, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak form but did not address the Board.

Dr. Mark Joranstaad, representing Arizona Schools Administrators, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak form but did not address the Board.

#### **5. GENERAL SESSION**

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding setting cut scores for the A-F School Accountability letter grades for K-8 and 9-12 traditional schools, including the non-typical grade configuration schools, for the 2016-2017 school year

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board adopt cut scores for 2016-2017 letter grades for the K-8, 9-12 and Hybrid models as presented and to direct the Department of Education to issue 2016-2017 letter grades for schools.

Superintendent Douglas explained her no vote.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Diane Douglas - No  
Calvin Baker - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Jared Taylor - Yes

- 1. (c) Attachment: Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding setting cut scores for the A-F School Accountability letter grades for K-8 and 9-12 traditional schools, including the non-typical grade configuration schools, for the 2016-2017 school year
- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding changes to the 2017-2018 A-F Accountability System

It is recommended that the Board direct staff to gather public feedback on the specific options to the 2017-2018 A-F Accountability System as outlined in the attachment and to bring a summary of the public feedback and modeling to the May 21, 2018, State Board of Education meeting.

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Diane Douglas - No

Calvin Baker - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open the following Menu of Assessments and statewide assessment items for public comment: 1) revised Menu of Assessments Policy; 2) Technical Assistance for Vendors and the Field; 3) Additional Items for Consideration; and 4) Menu of Assessments and Statewide Assessment Timeline

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board open the following items for public comment and to bring back finalized items for adoption at the May Board Meeting: 1) revised Menu of Assessments Policy; 2) Technical Assistance for Vendors and the Field; 3) Additional Items for Consideration; and 4) Menu of Assessments and Statewide Assessment Timeline.

Motion made by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Motion seconded by: Jared Taylor

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

- D. Presentation and discussion on the Revised Arizona Early Learning Standards

Nicol Russell, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

- E. Presentation and discussion on the delay of The Multi-State Alternate Assessment (MSAA) for Spring 2018

Audra Ahumada, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

The Board recessed at 10:40 a.m. and reconvened at 10:51 a.m.

- F. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

A motion was made to have staff draft a succinct letter in support of increased funding and additional funding for education, and have the draft circulated among the Board members prior to the release of the statement.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr  
Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Diane Douglas - Not Present  
Calvin Baker - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Jared Taylor - Yes

1. (c) Monthly Legislative Update Attachment

G. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures for the following rules:

A motion was made to close rulemaking procedures for R7-2-606 regarding proficiency assessments, as well as close rulemaking procedures for R7-2-611 regarding special education teaching certificates.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor  
Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Diane Douglas - Yes  
Calvin Baker - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Jared Taylor - Yes

1. R7-2-606 regarding Proficiency Assessment
2. R7-2-611 regarding Special Education Teaching Certificates

## **6. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

Item #6A1 was removed from the consent agenda due to Member Kaye having a conflict of interest.

A motion was made to approve consent agenda items 6A2 through 6A4.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr  
Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Diane Douglas - Yes  
Calvin Baker - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Jared Taylor - Yes

- A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Benjamin Hewitt, Case no. C-2018-026

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the voluntary surrender for any and all certificates held by Benjamin Hewitt, and that all states and territories be so notified.<

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Michele Kaye - Recuse

Janice Mak - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

a. (c) Benjamin Hewitt, Case no. C-2018-026 - Supporting Documents

2. Hanadie Khorchid, Case no. C-2017-824

a. (c) Hanadie Khorchid, Case no. C-2017-824 - Supporting Documents

3. Adrienne Perry, Case no. C-2017-050

a. (c) Adrienne Perry, Case no. C-2017-050 - Supporting Documents

4. Brian Scritchfield, Case no. C-2017-566

a. (c) Brian Scritchfield, Case no. C-2017-566 - Supporting Documents

**7. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

Dr. Cheng returned at 11:07 a.m.

A motion was made to approve items #7A1, #7A2, #7A3, #7A7 and #7A8.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Diane Douglas - No

Calvin Baker - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Linda Archuleta, Case no. C-2017-217

a. (c) Linda Archuleta, Case no. C-2017-217 - Supporting Documents

2. Kimberly Burrow, Case no. C-2017-821R

a. (c) Kimberly Burrow, Case no. C-2017-821R - Supporting Documents

3. Monica Dreager, Case no. C-2016-115

a. (c) Monica Dreager, Case no. C-2016-115 - Supporting Documents

4. Yama Elham, Case no. C-2017-551R

A motion was made to deny the Negotiated Settlement Agreement for Yama Elham.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Diane Douglas

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

a. (c) Yama Elham, Case no. C-2017-551R - Supporting Documents

5. Nicole Krum, Case no. C-2015-182

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Negotiated Settlement Agreement for Nicole Krum.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Diane Douglas - No

Calvin Baker - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

a. (c) Nicole Krum, Case no. C-2015-182 - Supporting Documents

6. Dragana Kulisic, Case no. C-2018-040

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Negotiated Settlement Agreement for Dragana Kulisic.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - No

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

a. (c) Dragana Kulisic, Case no. C-2018-040 - Supporting Documents

7. Bernadette Rosthenhausler-Espinoza, Case no. C-2017-218

a. (c) Bernadette Rosthenhausler-Espinoza, Case no. C-2017-218 -  
Supporting Documents

8. Sarah Shipe, Case no. C-2017-457

a. (c) Sarah Shipe, Case no. C-2017-457 - Supporting Documents

B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Selina Graves, Case no. C-2016-258, for a period of three-years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend of any and all of Ms. Graves' teaching certificates for a period of three years.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Diane Douglas - Yes  
Calvin Baker - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Jared Taylor - Yes

1. (c) Selina Graves, Case no. C-2016-258 - Supporting Documents

C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Maura Huntington, Case no. C-2015-216, for a period of three-years

Maura Huntington, representing herself, addressed the Board.

It is recommended that the State Board of Education accept the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Recommendation of the PPAC and suspend for three years any and all certificates held by Maura Huntington, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Diane Douglas - Yes  
Calvin Baker - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Jared Taylor - Yes

1. (c) Maura Huntington, Case no. C-2015-216 - Supporting Documents

D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification(s) of Amy Rodas, Case no. C-2016-436R, for a period of 4 years, 11 months and 29 days.



Amy Rodas, representing herself, addressed the Board.

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC and deny the application for certification of Amy Rodas, and that she be prohibited from reapplying for a period of 5 years and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Diane Douglas

Voting:

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

1. (c) Amy Rodas, Case no. C-2016-436R - Supporting Documents

## **8. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**

Executive Director Williams recognized Executive Assistant Wesley.

All Board members were reminded to notify the board staff if they would like to attend any of the upcoming conferences.

Member Mak made comments regarding Science and Social Studies Standards.

Superintendent Douglas made comments regarding Science and Social Studies Standards and the Teacher Walk-out.

Meeting adjourned at 11:37 a.m.