



Meeting Minutes
Printed : 12/27/2018 3:45 PM PST

October 22, 2018 Regular Board Meeting
10/22/2018 09:00 AM
1535 W. Jefferson
Room # 122
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Arizona State Board of Education

AMENDED Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **October 22, 2018, at 9:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122**, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007. A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, to consider records exempt by law from public inspection, including the receipt and discussion of information that is required to be maintained as confidential by state or federal law.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 17 day of October, 2018.

Arizona State Board of Education

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams", written over a horizontal line.

By:

Alicia Williams
Executive Director
(602) 542-5057

Attendees

Voting Members

Lucas Narducci, President by phone
Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President
Diane Douglas, Superintendent
Calvin Baker, Board Member
Dr. Rita Cheng, Board Member by phone
Patricia Welborn, Board Member
Jill Broussard, Board Member by phone
Christine Burton, Board Member
Michele Kaye, Board Member
Janice Mak, Board Member
Jared Taylor, Board Member

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

1. Member Welborn Update on K-3 Literacy Ad Hoc

Member Welborn provided an updated on the K-3 Literacy Ad Hoc Committee.

B. Superintendent's Report

1. Update on Department Activities

Superintendent provided updates on the Arizona Department of Education activities.

C. Executive Director's Report

1. Update on A-F Letter Grades Appeals

Executive Director Williams informed the Board that the Board Staff has received 18 appeals and the deadline is October 25, 2018, at 5:00 p.m.

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Brandon Watkins, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Craig Mussi, representing Glendale Union High School District, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Sara Tilton, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made to approve the Consent Agenda with the exception of item 3B and item 3D.

The motion passed unanimously.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Jared Taylor - Yes

- A. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver
- B. Approval of the Release of Early Literacy Grant Funds for Eligible Schools

It is recommended that the Board approve the release of Early Literacy Grant funds for eligible schools as presented in this item.

Member Kaye recused herself due to a conflict of interest.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Yes
Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Recuse
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Jared Taylor - Yes

- C. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds
- D. Receipt of the 120 day fiscal management report from Simon Consulting, L.L.C., as receiver for Murphy Elementary School District

Peter Davis, representing Simon Consulting, addressed the Board.

This item is for information only and no action is requested at this time.
- E. Approval of the 2019 State Board of Education and State Board for Vocational and Technological Education meeting schedule
- F. Approval of the revised 2017-2018 A-F Appeals policies and procedures

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Sara Torres, representing the Arizona Science Teachers Association, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Rana Singh Sodhi, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jaswant Sachdev, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Anaik Sachdev, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Scarlett Jung, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lori Jung, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Eldred Spain, representing the Arizona Interfaith Movement, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Anjleen Gumer, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Charlotte Rogers, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jennifer Rogers, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Chiraag Sachdev, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Elizabeth Hobson, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jennifer Reynolds, representing Mommy Lobby Arizona, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Williams Reimers, representing the Arizona Council for Social Studies, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Tory Roberg, representing Secular Coalition for Arizona, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Ron Gray, representing Northern Arizona State University, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board and provided written document.

Margaret Wilch, representing Tucson Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Michele Bentivegna, representing Peoria Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Elizabeth Lantka, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lisa Fink, representing Mommy Lobby Arizona, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Marisol Garcia, representing Arizona Education Association, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Barbara Gray, representing Thomas R. Brown Foundation, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

The Board recessed at 10:29 a.m. and reconvened at 10:40 a.m.

5. GENERAL SESSION

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Arizona Computer Science Standards

Item 5A was discussed after item 5B.

The Board recessed at 12:14 p.m. and reconvened at 12:24 p.m.

Dr. Cheng exited the meeting

Jonathan Moore, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Sarah Sleasman, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Karl Griffor, representing Cochise County Community College, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board adopt the academic standards for Computer Science for implementation by the 2020-2021 school year as presented in this item.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Not Present

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to adopt either: 1) the Hillsdale Program Guide, Scope and Sequence; or 2) the revised Arizona History and Social Science Standards and the revised Arizona Science Standards

Item 5B was moved ahead of item 5A at the request of Superintendent Douglas.

Jonathan Moore, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Tammy Waller, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Sarah Sleasman, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

Superintendent Douglas motioned that the Arizona State Board of Education adopt the Hillsdale Barney Charter School Standards to include: an additional public review to address the considerations that were raised during the October 22 Board meeting, with clear expectations for World Religions, foreign language options and board approved explicit phonics, reading, and writing and math instructional programs that are allowed by the Board for the 2019-2020 school year, to be transition time for districts and teachers to implement them in the classroom by the 2020-2021 school year and the motion be decided by a roll call vote by the Board.

The motion failed due to a lack of a second.

A motion was made to approve the Arizona History and Social Science Standards and revised Arizona Science Standards with the ASTA revisions.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Diane Douglas - No

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - No

Jill Broussard - No

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Jared Taylor - No

- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures for the following:

A motion was made to close rulemaking procedures for R7-2-809, R7-2-810, R7-2-1003, R7-2-1004, R7-2-1014, R7-2-1093, and R7-2-1112.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor
Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Not Present
Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Jared Taylor - Yes

1. R7-2-809 regarding the Emergency Administration of Auto-Injectable Epinephrine
 2. R7-2-810 regarding the Emergency Administration of Inhalers
 3. R7-2-1003, R7-2-1004, R7-2-1014, R7-2-1093, R7-2-1112 governing school district and nonexempt charter school procurement
- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures on R7-2-201 and R7-2-206 regarding Certification Denial Appeals for Applications that Do Not Involve Allegations of Immoral or Unprofessional Conduct

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking procedures for R7-2-201 and R7-2-206 regarding Certification Denial Appeals for Applications that Do Not Involve Allegations of Immoral or Unprofessional Conduct

Motion made by: Janice Mak
Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Not Present
Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Jared Taylor - Yes

- E. AMENDED Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the scope of work for the Menu of Assessments' Request for Proposal AMENDED

Member Taylor made a motion, seconded by Member Baker, to move into Executive Session to discuss the scope of work for the Menu of Assessments.

The motion passed unanimously and the Board convened into Executive Session.

A motion was that the Board direct the Arizona Department of Education investigate those issues discussed in executive session and finalize the request for proposal and release the request for proposal to the public.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor
Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Yes
Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Jared Taylor - Yes

1. (c) Draft Scope of Work - Supporting Document

6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve all items in the Consent Agenda.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Jared Taylor

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Yes
Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Jared Taylor - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Bryant Alvarado, Case no. C-2017-489
 - a. (c) Bryant Alvarado, Case no. C-2017-489 - Supporting Documents
2. Shara Brinkley, Case no. C-2017-342
 - a. (c) Shara Brinkley, Case no. C-2017-342 - Supporting Documents
3. Welles Geary, Case no. C-2016-044
 - a. (c) Welles Geary, Case no. C-2016-044 - Supporting Documents
4. Christopher Harris, Case no. C-2017-470
 - a. (c) Christopher Harris, Case no. C-2017-470 - Supporting Documents
5. Travis Moore, Case no. C-2017-014
 - a. (c) Travis Moore, Case no. C-2017-014 - Supporting Documents
6. Kelsey Norman, Case no. C-2017-312
 - a. (c) Kelsey Norman, Case no. C-2017-312 - Supporting Documents

B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:

1. Michael Hatfield, Case no. C-2018-247
 - a. (c) Michael Hatfield, Case no. C-2018-247 - Supporting Documents
2. Jesus Hernandez, Case no. C-2018-361
 - a. (c) Jesus Hernandez, Case no. C-2018-361 - Supporting Documents
3. Anthony Martinez, Case no. C-2017-623
 - a. (c) Anthony Martinez, Case no. C-2017-623 - Supporting Documents

8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 9A1, 9A2, and 9A3.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Debra Berndt, Case no. C-2018-244

a. (c) Debra Berndt, Case no. C-2018-244 - Supporting Documents

2. Christine Hayes, Case no. C-2017-299

a. (c) Christine Hayes, Case no. C-2017-299 - Supporting Documents

3. Jeremy Wescott, Case no. C-2017-280

a. (c) Jeremy Wescott, Case no. C-2017-280 - Supporting Documents

B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to Revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Neida Moncada, Case no. C-2015-206

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to Revoke the teaching certificate of Neida Moncada, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Jared Taylor

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

1. (c) Neida Moncada, Case no. C-2015-206 - Supporting Documents

C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification(s) of Benjamin Carrillo, Case no. C-2018-094R, for a period of 3 years

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to deny the application for certification of Benjamin Carrillo, with the condition that he be prohibited from reapplying for a period of three years, and all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

1. (c) Benjamin Carrillo, Case no. C-2018-094R - Supporting Documents

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification(s) of Ryan Van Lieu, Case no. C-2018-229R, for a period of 1 year

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and alter the the Recommendation of the PPAC to deny the application for certification of Ryan Van Lieu, with the condition that he be prohibited from reapplying for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Jared Taylor

Motion seconded by: Diane Douglas

Voting:

Diane Douglas - Yes

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Jared Taylor - Yes

1. (c) Ryan Van Lieu, Case no. C-2018-229R - Supporting Documents

- E. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the teaching certificate(s) of Sonya (Williams) Harper, C-2017-598 & C-2017-598R, as well as deny her application for certification with the condition that she be prohibited from reapplying for a period of 4 years

1. (c) Sonya (Williams) Harper, C-2017-598 & C-2017-598R - Supporting Documents

10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Member Baker made comments regarding the A-F Accountability System and the Menu of Assessments.

Superintendent Douglas made comments regarding ESSA.

Member Mak made comments regarding the effects of Move on When Reading.

Member Kaye requested information regarding changes in n-count.

Member Burton had two requests for the Arizona Department of Education for the January 2019 meeting.

President Narducci & Dr. Corr requested that Executive Director Williams work on finalizing a date for the December Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned 1:55 p.m.