



MEETING MINUTES

Arizona State Board of Education

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, April 26, 2021 at 10:00 A.M.**

The **April 26, 2021** State Board of Education meeting will be held virtually.

A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically.

Agenda materials are available online at
<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/4ZwqeeEQC9x6DOQvi8FGHQ==>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A) (3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The **April 26, 2021** State Board of Education meeting will be held virtually. Please see below on how to access the meeting and provide public comment on agenda items.

Methods on Accessing the State Board of Education Meeting

To watch the State Board meeting via computer or a smartphone with a data plan:

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit azsbe.az.gov



- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click “ok”
- When the meeting starts, you will see a “live” video. If you do not see this, and the meeting’s start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>
(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/xdH6GgaHzBdDTRUXaOlilA==>)

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board’s office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

Procedure for Submitting Public Comment:

For individuals wishing to submit public comment (Agenda Items #2, #4, #6 and #8)

Written Comment:

Written comments for the meeting will be accepted by:

- email inbox@azsbe.az.gov
(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/YhrEghWngpFB0plus4VUf5yDQ==>)
- fax to (602) 542-3046
- USPS to 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, Suite 300, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

The deadline to submit a written comment will be Friday, April 23, 2021 at 12:00 PM.

Written comments received after the deadline will not be posted and will not be provided to members.

Written comments will not be read into the record, however, staff will post all written comments received by the deadline on the Board's agenda by **Friday, April 23, 2021 at 5:00 PM.**

Verbal Comment:

Individuals must register to submit a verbal comment at the meeting. Please use the link below to register.

The deadline to register for a verbal comment will be Friday, April 23, 2021 at 12:00 PM.

By registering, you are submitting a request to speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

Individuals who register after the noon deadline on **April 23, 2021** will not be provided the



opportunity to give verbal public comment at the meeting.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine at which public comment agenda item (#2, #4, #6, #8) you will be called. The name in which you register **MUST** match the name on the account when signing into the meeting to speak. Prior to the meeting, you may need to download the Zoom application to your device and create an account to ensure name matching. Board staff will only call speakers once and then will move on to the next speaker. If you miss your turn, Board staff will attempt again at the end of the list. The order in which names are called will be in the order in which the registrations are received.

All Board policies in regard to public comment at in-person meetings are transferable to verbal public comment for virtual meetings. Verbal public comments are limited to three minutes unless adjusted by the State Board President at the start of the meeting.

Please use this link to register:

https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_v9Ezd2VBTKqoJgggdU956g
(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/joxriFTE9XslshplusPa7CqTepxA==>)

If you need assistance with registering, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

If you do not have internet access to register for a virtual comment, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

DATED AND POSTED this 15th day of April 2021.

Arizona State Board of Education

By:

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams", written over a horizontal line.

Alicia Williams

Executive Director



(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Voting Members

Calvin Baker, Board Member
Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President
Patricia Welborn, Board Member
Jill Broussard, Board Member
Christine Burton, Board Member
Michele Kaye, Board Member
Janice Mak, Board Member
Lucas Narducci, President
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Dr. Robert Robbins, Board Member
Armando Ruiz, Board Member

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

President Narducci did not have any updates to report. However, he did express his gratitude towards Board members, parents, school administrators, staff, and students for all their hard work during this past year.

B. Superintendent's Report

1. Department of Education Updates

Superintendent Hoffman provided updates and encouraged school leaders and administrators to keep following CDC guidelines by requiring masks on school campuses and buses.

2. Educator Recognition: Arizona History Teacher of the Year

Katherine Reddy was recognized as the National History Teacher of the Year 2020.

The following schools were recognized as the 2020 Civic Engagement School Awardees

- Carson Jr. High
- Chandler High School



- Red Mountain High School
- Santa Maria Middle School
- Shepherd Jr. High
- Skyline High School

3. Student Advisory Council Report

There was no Student Advisory Council Report given.

C. Executive Director's Report

1. Update on State Board of Education activities

Executive Director Williams provided updates on State Board of Education activities.

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Rita Bulthaupt, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

Member Burton requested that items 3H and 3I be pulled for discussion.

A motion was made to approve items 3A-3G and 3J-3L.

Motion made by: Dr. Robert Robbins

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

- Calvin Baker - Yes
- Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
- Patricia Welborn - Yes
- Jill Broussard - Yes
- Christine Burton - Yes
- Michele Kaye - Yes
- Janice Mak - Yes
- Lucas Narducci - Yes
- Kathy Hoffman - Yes
- Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes
- Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the Prescott College Dual Early Childhood and Early Childhood Special Education educator preparation program leading to educator certification

B. Approval of the Prescott College Bachelor of Arts, Post-Baccalaureate Certificate, Master of Education-Mild to Moderate Special Education educator preparation program leading to educator certification



C. Approval of the Classroom-Based Alternative Educator Preparation Program Scoring Rubric

D. Approval of the Alternative Educator Preparation Program Scoring Rubric

E. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base

F. Approval of additional tests for target languages in the Seal of Biliteracy Program

G. Approval of Structured English Immersion (SEI) Endorsement Coursework

H. UPDATED - Approval to refer cases to the Attorney General's Office of Collections - UPDATED

A motion was made to table items 3H & 3I until the next Board meeting, and that the Department of Education provides the Board with a presentation and additional procedural information for each case while keeping parents and students' names anonymous.

Motion passed
10-0; Superintendent Hoffman abstained

Motion made by: Christine Burton
Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:
Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Abstain
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

I. Approval to refer Case Number: 001F to the Attorney General's Office for Criminal Investigation

A motion was made to table items 3H & 3I until the next Board meeting, and that the Department of Education provides the Board with a presentation and additional procedural information for each case while keeping parents and students' names anonymous.

Motion passed
10-0; Superintendent Hoffman abstained

Motion made by: Christine Burton
Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn



Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Abstain
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

J. Approval of the hearing officer's recommendations to deny the appeal for certification for reasons that do not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct for Rita Bulthaupt, Case No. 2021-006

K. Approval of appointments to the WestEd Board of Directors

L. Approval of Arizona Online Instruction (AOI) applications

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Executive Director Williams informed the Board that written comments were received and were included in Board material.

Julie Batt, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kayla Svedin, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but did not address the Board.

Patricia Stevens, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but did not address the Board.

Catherine Moore, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but did not address the Board.

Natasha Bricker-Lion, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but did not address the Board.

Brenda Johnson, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form but did not address the Board.

5. GENERAL SESSION



A. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion, and possible action on the Empowerment Scholarship Account (ESA) Handbook for School Year 2021-2022 - UPDATED

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

Whitney Marsh, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board review and adopt the Empowerment Handbook for the 2021/2022 school year.

Motion made by: Michele Kaye

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures regarding A.A.C. R7-2-615.01 Special Education Endorsements

It is recommended that the Board close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-615.01 Special Education Endorsements.

Motion passed 11-0

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes



**C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-602.01
Induction Program Standards for New Teachers**

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-602.01 Induction Program Standards for New Teachers

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

D. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals.

6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Kayla Svedin, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board. This request to speak was originally in agenda item #4.

7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 7A1-7A5 and 7B-7D.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes



Patricia Welborn - Yes
Jill Broussard - Yes
Christine Burton - Yes
Michele Kaye - Yes
Janice Mak - Yes
Lucas Narducci - Yes
Kathy Hoffman - Yes
Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes
Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

- 1. William Giller, Case no. C-2020-000170**
 - a. William Giller, Case no. C-2020-000170 - Supporting Documents
- 2. Edward Moore, Case no. C-2021-000202**
 - a. Edward Moore, Case no. C-2021-000202- Supporting Documents
- 3. Denise Nunley, Case no. C-2021-000220**
 - a. Denise Nunley, Case no. C-2021-000220 - Supporting Documents
- 4. Craig Santilli, Case no. C-2020-002323**
 - a. Craig Santilli, Case no. C-2020-002323 - Supporting Documents
- 5. Thomas Williams, Case no. C-2020-000096**
 - a. Thomas Williams, Case no. C-2020-000096 - Supporting Documents

B. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-534.04(C), held by:

- 1. James W. Ochse, Case no. C-2020-001209**
 - a. James W. Ochse, Case no. C-2020-001209 - Supporting Documents

C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Petition for Determination under A.R.S. 41-1093.04, for Corne Lombard, Case no. SBE-P001

- 1. Corne Lombard, Case no. SBE-P001**



D. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates held by Gwen Sherwood, Case no. C-2021-000203 for breach of condition of prior settlement agreement

1. Gwen Sherwood, Case no. C-2021-000203 - Supporting Documents

8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve 9A1-9A7.

Motion passed 11-0.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

1. Gustavo Enriquez, Case no. C-2020-02610

a. Gustavo Enriquez, Case no. C-2020-02610 - Supporting Documents

2. Stephen Gill, Case no. C-2019-000778

a. Stephen Gill, Case no. C-2019-000778 - Supporting Documents

3. Jessica Probst, Case no. C-2020-002567

a. Jessica Probst, Case no. C-2020-002567 - Supporting Documents

4. Tyler Robertson, Case no. C-2020-001789



a. Tyler Robertson, Case no. C-2020-001789 - Supporting Documents

5. Nathaniel Rolwes, Case no. C-2019-000262

a. Nathaniel Rolwes, Case no. C-2019-000262 - Supporting Documents

6. Lorenzo G. Sanchez, Case no. C-2020-001986

a. Lorenzo G. Sanchez, Case no. C-2020-001986 - Supporting Documents

7. Jill Strawbridge, Case no. C-2019-000157

a. Jill Strawbridge, Case no. C-2019-000157 - Supporting Documents

10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Executive Director Williams reminded Board members to be on the lookout for surveys regarding future mini-meeting dates.

Member Welborn requested an update on the data pertaining to the AzMerit/AzM2 testing.

The meeting adjourned at 11:48 a.m.