



October 23, 2023 Regular Board Meeting

10/23/2023 - 09:00 AM

1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower

3rd Floor Boardroom

Phoenix, AZ 85007

MEETING MINUTES

Arizona State Board of Education

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, October 23, 2023 at 9:00 A.M.**

The **Monday, October 23, 2023** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. This means that the public has the opportunity to participate in-person or virtually.

Please note the location of the **Monday, October 23, 2023** State Board of Education meeting: 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, 3rd Floor Boardroom, Phoenix, AZ 85007. The public will have physical access to the meeting location 30 minutes before the Board meeting, at 8:30 A.M.

A copy of the meeting agenda is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically or virtually.

Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.gov>(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/CxysUcZQyJ5BM64Of1FNQ==>)

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A) (3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The **Monday, October 23, 2023** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. Please see below on how to access the meeting and provide public comment on agenda items, regardless of the chosen access method.

Accessing the State Board of Education Meeting Virtually

To watch the State Board meeting online:

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit azsbe.gov
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click "ok"
- When the meeting starts, you will see a "live" video. If you do not see this, and the meeting's start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/xdH6GgaHzBdDTRUXaOliiA==>)

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

Procedure for Submitting a Public Comment (Please read through each option carefully):

Advance registration is required to provide verbal public comment. **The deadline to submit a written comment and/or to register for a verbal public comment is Thursday, October 19, 2023 at 12:00pm.** Individuals that attempt to register or submit a written comment after the

deadline will not be provided the opportunity to give public comment at the meeting.

By registering, you are submitting a request to speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine at which public comment agenda item (#2, #4, #6, or #8) you will be called.

All Board policies in regard to public comment at meetings apply to in-person and virtual public comments. Public comments are limited to three minutes unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting.

Virtual Public Comment:

Please use this link to register for a **Virtual** public comment: https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_tRvXf-37T6WVvsU8CZcUqA(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/9KRrvqUH0LXEaTvDAITtdQ==>)

In-Person Public Comment:

Please use this link to register for an **In-Person** public comment: <https://forms.gle/MeXbf9m62M3KxqYC6>(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/1slshC11mSwdKRHMVtplusMOgdUQ==>)

Written Comment:

Written comments for the meeting will be accepted by:

- email inbox@azsbe.az.gov
- fax to (602) 542-3046
- USPS to 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, Suite 300, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

If you need assistance with registering or do not have internet access to register for a virtual comment, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

DATED AND POSTED this 13th day of October, 2023.

Arizona State Board of Education

By:



Sean Ross

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

9:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Dr. Daniel Corr, President
Katherine Haley, Vice President
Tom Horne, Superintendent
Jenny Clark, Board Member
Dr. Jacqui Clay, Board Member - Virtual

Dr. Scott Hagerman, Board Member - Virtual
Julia Meyerson, Board Member
Jason Catanese, Board Member - Virtual
Anna Tovar, Board Member
Karla Phillips-Krivickas, Board Member (*joined the meeting at 9:05am*)

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

Meeting called to order at 9:01am.

A. President's Report

President Dr. Corr presented the President's Report, welcomed the Ann Tovar to the State Board of Education, and invited her to introduce herself.

Member Tovar introduced herself to the Board.

B. Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Horne presented the Superintendent's Report.

Member Phillips-Krivickas joined the meeting at 9:05am.

C. Executive Director's Report

1. State Board Students of the Month for October 2023

Shannon Etz, title, made comments about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross presented the first Student of the Month.
The nominated student, Markayla Shirley, made comments to the Board.

Executive Director Ross presented the second Student of the Month.
The nominated student, Sarah Israel, made comments to the Board.

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Sarah Jedlowski, representing Stand for Children AZ, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Rodrigo Guerrero, representing Stand for Children AZ, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made to approve items 3A through 3K.

Motion passed: 10-10.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Katherine Haley

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Anna Tovar - Yes

A. Approval of the CTE Hospitality Management Program for 0.5 credit in high school Economics

B. Approval to award additional ADE-Adult Education Grant allocations to currently approved Adult Education providers to increase the delivery of educational services in Program Year 2023-2024

C. Approval of appointments to the State Board of Education Certification Advisory Committee

D. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver

E. Approval of the acceptance by ADE of the Salt River Project Grant Award

F. Approval of Seal of Biliteracy Assessment for American Sign Language

G. Approval of the Edgenuity personal finance course for the Seal of Personal Finance Program

H. UPDATED: Approval to refer cases to the Attorney General's Office of Collections

I. Consideration to approve the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds.

J. Determination that Piñon Unified School District is in compliance with FY22 audit reporting requirements

K. Approval of the appointment and removal of members from the Professional Practices Advisory Committees

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Matthew Strom, representing Mesa Public Schools, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jessica Makowske, representing Western School of Science and Technology, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kelly Powell, representing Arizona Charter Schools Association, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Dr. Mark Joraanstad, representing Arizona School Administrators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

5. GENERAL SESSION

A. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding accountability cut scores for Traditional, Hybrid, Alternative and Arizona Online Instruction (AOI) schools for the 2022-2023 school year - UPDATED

Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

Sean Smith, Chief Accountability Officer for the Department of Education, made comments about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to approve the 2022-2023 Accountability cut scores as presented and direct the Department of Education to release the public file with school and LEA letter grades prior to November 1, 2023.

Motion passed: 10-10.

Motion made by: Dr. Jacqui Clay

Motion seconded by: Julia Meyerson

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Anna Tovar - Yes

B. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion and possible action to adopt the 2022-2023 accountability appeals process and procedures for a school to appeal its final letter grade - UPDATED

Jessica Mueller, Research and Data Analyst for the State Board of Education, presented to the Board.

Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

Jessica Mueller, continued to present to the Board.

Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to adopt the 2022-2023 accountability appeals process, procedures and timeline as presented.

Motion passed: 10-10.

Motion made by: Jason Catanese
Motion seconded by: Dr. Jacqui Clay
Voting:
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Anna Tovar - Yes

C. UPDATED: Presentation, discussion, and possible action to create the State Board of Education Ad Hoc Special Education Evaluations Advisory Subcommittee - UPDATED

Executive Director Ross presented to the Board.

Member Clark made comments about this agenda item.
Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay sought clarification about this agenda item.
Executive Director Ross sought clarification about this agenda item.
Rico Yanez, Project Director of Policy for the State Board of Education, provided clarification about this agenda item.
Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.
Member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to approve the creation of the State Board of Education Ad Hoc Special Education Evaluations Advisory Subcommittee.

Motion passed: 10-10.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark
Motion seconded by: Anna Tovar
Voting:
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Anna Tovar - Yes

6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

None.

7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 7A1 through 7A5.

Motion passed: 10-10.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark
Motion seconded by: Katherine Haley
Voting:
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Anna Tovar - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Joseph Benesch, Case no. C-2023-001147
 - a. Joseph Benesch, Case no. C-2023-001147 - Supporting Documents
2. Heather De La Garza, Case no. C-2022-000711
 - a. Heather De La Garza, Case no. C-2022-000711 - Supporting Documents
3. James Dillon, Case no. C-2022-001083
 - a. James Dillon, Case no. C-2022-001083 - Supporting Documents
4. Miles Huff, Case no. C-2023-002099
 - a. Miles Huff, Case no. C-2023-002099 - Supporting Documents
5. Brandon Wingert, Case no. C-2023-001919
 - a. Brandon Wingert, Case no. C-2023-001919 - Supporting Documents

8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Vernon Nicholas, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Flynn Carey, representing Mitchell Stein Carey Chapman, PC, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lisa Bivens, representing Mitchell Stein Carey Chapman, PC, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Shirley Reimer, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Savana Wright, representing Richards & Moskowitz PLC, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Morgan Bigelow, representing Lubin & Enoch, P.C., submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

Superintendent Horne sought clarification about an agenda item within 9.
Executive Director Ross provided clarification that the agenda item is 9B2.

A motion was made to approve items 9A1 through 9A4.

Motion passed: 10-10.

Motion made by: Katherine Haley

Motion seconded by: Jenny Clark

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Anna Tovar - Yes

1. Jerry Cook, Case no. C-2023-000729

a. Jerry Cook, Case no. C-2023-000729 - Supporting Documents

2. Gregory Duke, Case no. C-2022-003255

a. Gregory Duke, Case no. C-2022-003255 - Supporting Documents

3. Kimberlina O'Hara, Case no. C-2021-012958

a. Kimberlina O'Hara, Case no. C-2021-012958 - Supporting Documents

4. Paul Cruz Uribe, Case no. C-2022-000626

a. Paul Cruz Uribe, Case no. C-2022-000626 - Supporting Documents

B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendations of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee for the following educators:

Superintendent Horne sought clarification about agenda item 9B2.
Executive Director Ross provided clarification about agenda item 9B2.
Superintendent Horne requested that agenda item 9B2 be removed.

A motion was made to approve items 9B1 and 9B3 through 9B5.

Motion passed: 10-10.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Karla Phillips-Krivickas

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Anna Tovar - Yes

1. Carmen Watts-Clayton, Case no. C-2021-000569

a. Carmen Watts-Clayton, Case no. C-2021-000569 - Supporting Documents

2. Shirley Reimer, Case no. C-2022-000624

Superintendent Horne requested that this agenda item be tabled for the next board meeting.
Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

Member Clark sought clarification about this agenda item.
Deputy Director Wonders provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item.
Executive Director Ross provided clarification about this agenda item.

A motion was made to table agenda item 9B2 until the December 2023 Board Meeting.

Motion passed: 8-2.

Motion made by: Tom Horne

Motion seconded by: Karla Phillips-Krivickas

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - No

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - No

Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Anna Tovar - Yes

a. Shirley Reimer, Case no. C-2022-000624 - Supporting Documents

3. Molly Ann Kirkpatrick, Case no. C-2022-002458 and C-2022-003351

a. Molly Ann Kirkpatrick, Case no. C-2022-002458 and C-2022-003351 - Supporting Documents

4. Kristin Dougherty, Case no. C-2021-011838

a. Kristin Dougherty, Case no. C-2021-011838 - Supporting Documents

5. Coral Ceiley-Jackson, Case no. C-2022-000795

a. Coral Ceiley-Jackson, Case no. C-2022-000795 - Supporting Documents

C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to grant or deny the request for a hearing of Evelyn Andrade, Case no. C-2022-002379

A motion was made to deny Educator Evelyn Andrade's Request for a Hearing.

Motion passed: 10-10.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Dr. Scott Hagerman

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Anna Tovar - Yes

1. Evelyn Andrade, Case no. C-2022-002379 - Supporting Documents

D. Presentation, discussion and possible action to grant or deny the request for a rehearing of Vernon Nicholas, Case no. C-2022-000828

A motion was made to deny Educator Vernon Robertson Nicholas's Request for Rehearing and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed: 10-10.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Tom Horne

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Anna Tovar - Yes

1. Vernon Nicholas, Case no. C-2022-000828 - Supporting Documents

10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

President Dr. Corr made comments about the next Board Meeting in December.

Executive Director Ross extended thanks to the Board Members.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.
Member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item.

Board Meeting adjourned at 10:32 am.