



**Meeting Minutes**

**Printed : 12/16/2019 1:01 PM MST**

**October 28, 2019 Regular Board Meeting**

**10/28/2019 10:00 AM**

1535 W. Jefferson

Room # 122

Phoenix, AZ 85007

---

## **Arizona State Board of Education**

### **AMENDED Agenda**

### **NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, October 28, 2019, at 10:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007.** A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(1), the Board may convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of employment and performance of an employee of the Board.

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 24th day of October, 2019.

Arizona State Board of Education

By:

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PRAYER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND ROLL CALL

## **Attendees**

---

### **Voting Members**

Calvin Baker, Board Member  
Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President  
Patricia Welborn, Board Member  
Jill Broussard, Board Member  
Christine Burton, Board Member  
Michele Kaye, Board Member  
Janice Mak, Board Member  
Lucas Narducci, President  
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Armando Ruiz, Board Member

---

## **1. BUSINESS REPORTS**

### A. President's Report

#### 1. Update on Board activities

President Narducci informed the Board that the December meeting would be moved to December 13, 2019.

### B. Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Hoffman recognized the following ADE Staff Members: Mary Medina and Celine Ramirez. Superintendent Hoffman also recognized Mike Vargas from Pinnacle High School and concluded by providing an update on the School Safety Program.

1. Updates
2. ADE Staff Member Recognition
3. Educator Recognition
4. Update on the School Safety Program

### C. Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Williams provided updates on Board staff activities and an update on the FY 2020 A-F Accountability Work.

1. Update on Board staff activities
2. Update on FY 2020 A-F Accountability Work

## **2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

## **3. CONSENT AGENDA**

A motion was made to approve all items from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. Approval of the University of Phoenix Early Childhood Education educator preparation program leading to educator certification
- B. Approval of the Northern Arizona University Dual Early Childhood Education and Early Childhood Special Education educator preparation program leading to educator certification
- C. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver
- D. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds
- E. Approval of Structured English Immersion (SEI) Course Provider
- F. Approval of the 2020 State Board of Education and State Board of Vocational and Technical Education meeting schedule
- G. Consideration to determine that Toltec Elementary School District No. 22 is in compliance with the Uniform System of Financial Records, and that previously withheld monies that resulted from the determination of noncompliance be returned to the district in the current year
- H. Appointment of Kate Wright, Associate Superintendent, to represent the Office of the Superintendent of Public Instruction on the WestEd Board of Directors
- I. AMENDED - Approval of the acceptance of \$500,000 of the Governor's WIOA funds and the award of those funds to the currently approved local providers of Adult Education

#### **4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Executive Director announced that all written comments were provided to the Board prior to the Board meeting.

Dr. Mark Joraanstad, representing Arizona School Administrators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Superintendent Dr. Deborah Dennoison, representing Mesa Public Schools, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Superintendent Sean Rickert, representing Pima Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

## 5. GENERAL SESSION

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve accountability cut scores for K-8, 9-12 and alternative schools for the 2018-2019 school year

Wendy Davy, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board approve Option 1 (FY 18 cut scores) cut scores for K-8 and 9-12 schools and approve the standard deviation method with non-reported zeros for alternative schools for the 2018-2019 school year and direct the Department of Education to release letter grades no later than November 1, 2019 as outlined in the timeline above.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to adopt the 2018-2019 accountability appeals process, procedures and timeline for a school to appeal its final letter grade

It is recommended that the Board adopt the 2018-2019 accountability appeals process, procedures and timeline as presented.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- C. AMENDED - Presentation, discussion and possible action on the State Board of Education's legislative priorities for 2020

It is recommended that the Board approve the bill language for the attached for the 2020 legislative session with the two priorities.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- D. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-619, Renewal Requirements

It is recommended the Board open rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-619, Renewal Requirements.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

- E. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-321, State Seal of Arts Proficiency Program

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-321, State Seal of Arts Proficiency Program.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- F. Update on rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-306, English Language Learner Programs

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time.

- G. Update on rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Title 7, Articles 10 and 11, School District Procurement

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time.

- H. Update on rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Title 7, Article 13, Conduct

This item is information only and no action is requested at this time.

Executive Director Williams informed the Board that this is an update to the proposed rule change with additional language within summary suspension added.

- I. EXECUTIVE SESSION - Presentation and discussion regarding Statewide Assessment Request For Proposal (RFP) Scope of Work Feedback. Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

*The Board recessed at 11:00 a.m and convened at 11:10 a.m. into Executive Session for Items 5I and 5J.*

The Board exited Executive Session at 12:24 p.m.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- J. EXECUTIVE SESSION -Discussion and consideration of the employment and performance of the Board's Executive Director. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(1), the Board may convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of this item.

The Board convened into Executive Session for Items 5I and 5J and exited Executive Session at 12:24 p.m.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

## **6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

## **7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

A motion was made to approve items 7A1-7A10 and 7B.

Motion made by: Patricia Welborn

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

1. Patrick Carel, Case no. C-2018-332
  - a. Patrick Carel, Case no. C-2018-332 - Supporting Documents
2. Kirk Hinsey, Case no. C-2018-831
  - a. Kirk Hinsey, Case no. C-2018-831 - Supporting Documents
3. Georgia Howardell, Case no. C-2018-104
  - a. Georgia Howardell, Case no. C-2018-104
4. Aaron Kermes, Case no. C-2017-317
  - a. Aaron Kermes, Case no. C-2017-317 - Supporting Documents
5. Meggie Maack, Case no. C-2019-551
  - a. Meggie Maack, Case no. C-2019-551 - Supporting Documents
6. Brian Machardy, Case no. C-2018-673
  - a. Brian Machardy, Case no. C-2018-673 - Supporting Documents
7. Victoria Martin, Case no. C-2018-826

- a. Victoria Martin, Case no. C-2018-826 - Supporting Documents
- 8. Corie C. Mecsey, Case no. C-2017-390
  - a. Corie C. Mecsey, Case no. C-2017-390-Supporting Documents
- 9. Jesus Rodriguez Jr., Case no. C-2019-003
  - a. Jesus Rodriguez Jr., Case no. C-2019-003 - Supporting Documents
- 10. Kyle Sawyer, Case no. C-2018-727
  - a. Kyle Sawyer, Case no. C-2018-727 - Supporting Documents
- B. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1307(A), held by:
  - 1. Melanie L. Mosiman, Case No. 2019-119
    - a. Melanie L. Mosiman, Case No. 2019-119 - Supporting Documents

## **8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

## **9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

A motion was made to approve items 9A1-9A7.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:
  - 1. Shelton Amerman, Case no. C-2018-283
    - a. Shelton Amerman, Case no. C-2018-283 - Supporting Documents
  - 2. Allison Arriaga, Case no. C-2019-395
    - a. Allison Arriaga, Case no. C-2019-395 - Supporting Documents
  - 3. Robin Birkmann, Case no. C-2018-573

- a. Robin Birkmann, Case no. C-2018-573 - Supporting Documents
  4. Elizabeth Good, Case no. C-2019-068
    - a. Elizabeth Good, Case no. C-2019-068 - Supporting Documents
  5. Marianne M. LaFrenierre, Case no. C-2019-166
    - a. Marianne M. LaFrenierre, Case no. C-2019-166-Supporting Documents
  6. Michael Logue, Case no. C-2019-079
    - a. Michael Logue, Case no. C-2019-079-Supporting Documents
  7. Megan McKenna, Case no. C-2019-354
    - a. Megan McKenna, Case no. C-2019-354 - Supporting Documents
- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee for:

1. Amy Curtis FKA Griggs, C-2019-042

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to suspend any and all certificate(s) held by Amy Curtis, for a period of one year, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Patricia Welborn

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

- a. Amy Curtis FKA Griggs, C-2019-042 - Supporting Documents

2. Louis Fernando Espinosa Jr., C-2017-364

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Louis Fernando Espinosa Jr., and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Armando Ruiz

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Louis Fernando Espinosa Jr., C-2017-364 - Supporting Documents

3. Stephanie Garza A.K.A. Herrera, C-2018-696

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Stephanie Garza, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Christine Burton

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes  
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Patricia Welborn - Yes  
Jill Broussard - Yes  
Christine Burton - Yes  
Michele Kaye - Yes  
Janice Mak - Yes  
Lucas Narducci - Yes  
Kathy Hoffman - Yes  
Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Stephanie Garza A.K.A. Herrera, C-2018-696 - Supporting Documents

**10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**

Executive Director Williams announced a reminder that the December Board meeting will occur on Friday, the 13th, and that Board members can expect to receive appeals committee recommendations for accountability appeals on the evening of December 11th, Wednesday.

Meeting adjourned 12:29 p.m.

---

Chairperson

---

Secretary