



Arizona State Board of Education  
A-F Appeals Committee

**NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to members of the State Board of Education A-F Appeals Committee, and to the general public, that the Committee will hold a meeting open to the public on **Monday, November 20, 2017 at 2:00 p.m. at Arizona Department of Education, Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, Arizona 85007**. A copy of the agenda is attached. The Committee reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more Committee members may participate telephonically.

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.02 (H), the Committee may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3), the Committee may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice concerning any item on the agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 10<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2017.

By: \_\_\_\_\_

  
Alicia Williams  
Executive Director  
(602) 542-5057

**AGENDA**  
A-F Appeals Committee  
Monday, November 20, 2017  
2:00 p.m.  
Arizona Department of Education, Room 122  
1535 W. Jefferson  
Phoenix, AZ 85007

2:00 p.m. **CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

1. Presentation and discussion regarding:
  - a. The duties and responsibilities of the Committee including, policies and procedures governing the process by which a school may appeal its A-F Accountability Plan letter grade;
  - b. Information on A-F Accountability Plan letter grade appeals filed with the State Board of Education.
2. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding letter grade appeals that are outside the scope of the A-F Appeals Committee
3. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the evaluation of letter grade appeals within the scope of the A-F Appeals Committee
4. **CALL TO THE PUBLIC:** This is the time for the public to comment. Members of the Committee may not discuss items that are not specifically identified on the agenda. Therefore, pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.01(H), action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date
5. **FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS.** The Executive Director, staff or a member of the Committee may discuss future meeting dates and direct staff to place matters on a future agenda

Adjourn

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

**Issue:** Presentation and discussion regarding: a) the duties and responsibilities of the Committee including, policies and procedures by which a school may appeal its A-F Accountability Plan letter grade; and b) information on A-F Accountability Plan letter grade appeals filed with the State Board of Education.

Action/Discussion Item

Information Item

**Background and Discussion**

On June 26, 2017, the Board created and appointed members to the A-F Appeals Committee. At the same meeting, the Board adopted policies and procedures governing A-F appeals.

Included in the policies and procedures are grounds for an appeal which are limited to the following:

1. Environmental Issues or Events;
2. School or Community Emergency;
3. School Tragedy; or
4. Other similar substantive events.

The Committee does not have authority to evaluate appeals based on conditions including, but not limited to the following:

1. Opposition to accountability formulae (e.g. Growth should not be weighted as such; non-FAY students who pass AzMERIT should be counted, etc.);
2. Demographic make-up of student population (e.g. School has an above average percentage of ELL students);
3. Data within the control of the school/LEA at any point in time (e.g. Test records not corrected via Common Logon, ADE, or Pearson);
4. Individual student characteristics (e.g. This student was often tardy or absent from his Math and Reading classes); and
5. Statistical computations

Pursuant to the policies and procedures, the window to file an appeal was open from the afternoon of Thursday, September 28, 2017, to Friday, October 6, 2017 at 5:00 P.M. During the window, the Board received 71 appeals.

Below is a brief summary of the appeals:

- 60 cited events or factors that are not within the scope of the A-F Appeals Committee:

**Contact Information:**

Alicia Williams, Executive Director, State Board of Education  
Catcher Baden, Deputy Director, State Board of Education

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

<b>Event or Factor Cited</b>	<b>Frequency</b>
Bonus points included in cut score determination	9
CCRI data issues	7
Disagreement with calculation methods and/or the system	7
Teacher shortage or a lack of a teacher	6
Student absences	4
Forwarded to ADE for data and coding validation	24
Miscellaneous, including issues with transition from SAIS to AzEDS	11

- 11 schools cited events within the Committee's scope:

<b>Event or Factor Cited</b>	<b>Frequency</b>
Building issues	3
Flooding	3
Technological challenges	2
School tragedy or other mitigating event	4

24 appeals (including 1 substantive appeal) were forwarded to the Arizona Department of Education as part of the data and coding validation period.

Attached:

- A-F Appeals Committee Structure
- A-F Appeals Policies and Procedures
- Spreadsheet of A-F Appeals

**Recommendation to the Committee**

This item is presented to the Committee for information only, and no action is requested.

## **A-F SCHOOL ACCOUNTABILITY APPEALS COMMITTEE**

Consistent with A.R.S. § 15-241(I), the Board is charged with providing an appeals process for the review of A-F school letter grades. The Board shall establish an appeals process to allow a school or local education agency to appeal the school's or local education agency's final letter grade based on mitigating factors identified by the Board.

### **MISSION STATEMENT**

The mission of the A-F School Accountability Appeals Committee is to implement an appeals process for schools and local education agencies appealing their school letter grades based on mitigating factors pursuant to state law.

### **POLICY STATEMENT**

The purpose of the A-F School Accountability Appeals Committee is to provide an avenue for schools and local education agencies to appeal their letter grade through a transparent and public process. Committee meetings are held open to the public. All schools and local education agencies are eligible to appeal their grade based on mitigating factors. Schools and local education agencies will be scored on a rubric for an expedited or non-expedited process depending on the school's or local education agency's specific situation.

### **RATIONALE**

The Board does not have an advisory group to consider and make recommendations regarding the appeals process for A-F school letter grades. The creation of the A-F School Accountability Appeals Committee will:

- Implement the Board policy and rubric regarding the appeals process for A-F letter grades
- Approve or deny requests to change a school or local education agency's letter grade based on mitigating factors consistent with the grading rubric

### **COMMITTEE STRUCTURE**

Membership consists of three members of the State Board of Education.

- Narducci
- Taylor
- Kaye

## State Board of Education Policies and Process for Appealing A-F Letter Grades

1. Timing of submission: Appeals of final A-F letter grades must be submitted during the embargo period. Letter grades issued under appeal will be designated as pending which will remain in place until the appeal is resolved. All appeals and supporting documentation must be submitted by 5:00pm on the last Friday of the embargo period to [inbox@azsbe.az.gov](mailto:inbox@azsbe.az.gov)
2. Notification of receipt: Applicants submitting an appeal will be notified via email from the Board within 72 hours of the application that all materials were successfully submitted. If an applicant does not receive notification, contact [inbox@azsbe.az.gov](mailto:inbox@azsbe.az.gov) and resubmit with a copy of a date-stamped email of the original submission.
3. Format of submission: Schools and LEAs seeking to appeal a letter grade must use the designated SBE Letter Grade Application form. Schools and LEAs may request either an expedited appeal (document review only) or a non-expedited appeal (document review and appearance before the Committee). Appearances before the Committee will be limited to fifteen minutes.
4. Supporting evidence: Supporting evidence for the appeal must be submitted with the application to be considered by the Committee. Supporting evidence may include, but is not limited to, benchmark assessment data showing an upward trend until the substantive event, a longitudinal demonstration of decreased instructional time due to attendance (ADM/ADA), media reports conferring the reason for appeal, or additional narrative from stakeholders.

*a. Example A and Possible Evidence*

At the beginning of the school year, the main road into town is washed out and must undergo months of repair, impacting transportation to and from school by about an hour each way; the school sees a significant decline in attendance rates as well as instructional time due to an added two hours of commuting time for many students. Prior year proficiency rates were significantly higher than the current year rates with no substantial changes in staffing or administration. The school also provides attendance data to support the decreased instructional time beyond their control.

*b. Example B and Possible Evidence*

A fatal car accident on the second morning of AzMERIT testing at an elementary school prohibited students from being dropped off on time to start testing. Students who witnessed the accident or the presence of emergency

responders requested counseling. Many tests were unfinished and not scored, which decreased test participation. While the school has earned a “B” in the past two years, it received a “C” and many of their younger students performed lower than expected. The school submits written and signed accounts of the incident by parents and teachers. The school also submits a police report verifying the date and time of the accident which impacted students’ performance on the day of testing. The school submits benchmark assessment data to indicate that these same students scored much better on district-wide standardized assessments prior to the incident.

5. Grounds for appeal: Grounds for appeal are limited to:
  - a. Environmental Issues or Events
  - b. Adverse Testing Conditions
  - c. School or Community Emergency
  - d. School Tragedy
  - e. Other similar substantive events
  
6. Considerations by the Committee: The Committee will consider whether the grounds for appeal were:
  - a. Unrelated to school/student performance
  - b. Outside the school’s control
  - c. Timing reasonably related to student performance
  - d. Substantial cause of overall school performance

In addition, the Committee will consider whether the school took reasonable steps to minimize the impact of the event on assessment outcomes or if the opportunity did not exist for the school/LEA to minimize impact on students. The Committee will consider all submitted longitudinal school-level and student-level data if applicable and relevant.

7. Non substantive events: The Committee **will not** evaluate appeals based on conditions including, but not limited to:
  - a. Opposition to accountability formulae (e.g. Growth should not be weighted as such; non-FAY students who pass AzMERIT should be counted, etc.).
  - b. Demographic make-up of student population (e.g. School has an above average percentage of ELL students).
  - c. Data within the control of the school/LEA at any point in time (e.g. Test records not corrected via Common Logon, ADE, or Pearson).
  - d. Individual student characteristics (e.g. This student was often tardy or absent from his Math and Reading classes).
  - e. Statistical computations

8. Incomplete applications: Incomplete applications will not be reviewed and will be denied without further review.
9. Public Records: All appeals submitted may be subject to public records requests.
10. Rubric: The same rubric will be used to evaluate all appeals.
11. The Committee will make recommendations to the Board based on its decisions.



**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

**Issue:** Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding letter grade appeals that are outside the scope of the A-F Appeals Committee.

- Action/Discussion Item                       Information Item

**Background and Discussion**

Pursuant to the policies and procedures governing A-F appeals, grounds for an appeal are limited to the following:

1. Environmental Issues or Events;
2. School or Community Emergency;
3. School Tragedy; or
4. Other similar substantive events.

The Committee does not have authority to evaluate appeals based on conditions including, but not limited to:

1. Opposition to accountability formulae (e.g. Growth should not be weighted as such; non-FAY students who pass AzMERIT should be counted, etc.);
2. Demographic make-up of student population (e.g. School has an above average percentage of ELL students);
3. Data within the control of the school/LEA at any point in time (e.g. Test records not corrected via Common Logon, ADE, or Pearson);
4. Individual student characteristics (e.g. This student was often tardy or absent from his Math and Reading classes); and
5. Statistical computations.

60 schools cited events or factors that are outside the scope of the A-F Appeals Committee.

<b>Event or Factor Cited</b>	<b>Frequency</b>
Bonus points included in cut score determination	9
CCRI data issues	7
Disagreement with calculation methods and/or the system	7
Teacher shortage or a lack of a teacher	6
Student absences	4
Forwarded to ADE for data and coding validation	23
Miscellaneous, including issues with transition from SAIS to AzEDS	11

**Recommendation to the Committee**

It is recommended the A-F Appeals Committee determine the 60 appeals listed in the attachment cited events or factors that are outside the scope of the A-F Appeals Committee and will therefore not be evaluated by the A-F Appeals Committee.

**Contact Information:**

Alicia Williams, Executive Director, State Board of Education  
Catcher Baden, Deputy Director, State Board of Education

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

**Issue:** Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the evaluation of letter grade appeals within the scope of the A-F Appeals Committee.

Action/Discussion Item                       Information Item

**Background and Discussion**

On June 26, 2017, the Board created and appointed members to the A-F Appeals Committee. At the same meeting, the Board adopted policies and procedures governing A-F appeals.

Included in the policies and procedures are grounds for an appeal which are limited to the following:

1. Environmental Issues or Events;
2. School or Community Emergency;
3. School Tragedy; or
4. Other similar substantive events.

Pursuant to the policies and procedures, the window to file an appeal was open from the afternoon of September, 28, 2017, to Friday, October 6, 2017 at 5:00 P.M. During the window, the Board received 71 appeals.

Of the 71 appeals, 11 cited events or factors that are within the scope of the policies and procedures by which a school may appeal its letter grade.

School	Event or Factor Cited
Clove Campbell Elementary	Flooding
Copper Ridge School	Teacher was sick just prior and during testing
Cordova Elementary School	Flooding
Country Gardens Charter School	Road closures and air conditioning issues
Desert Horizon Elementary School	School tragedy
Flagstaff High School	Threatening Notes
Helen Keeling Elementary	Building issues
LM Prince School	Flooding and construction
Mary C O Brien Elementary School	Technical assessment difficulties (also forwarded to ADE for data/coding validation)
Montessori Academy	Technical assessment difficulties
Sinagua Middle School	School tragedy and other

**Contact Information:**

Alicia Williams, Executive Director, State Board of Education  
Catcher Baden, Deputy Director, State Board of Education

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

---

The Board is currently in the process of finalizing the 2016-2017 letter grades by validating the data and coding and engaging in a review and revision process of the 2016-2017 letter grades, the Accountability System and the business rules.

**Recommendation to the Committee**

It is recommended the A-F Appeals Committee delay the review and evaluation of the 11 substantive appeals listed until the Board finalizes the 2016-2017 letter grades.

Entry ID	Name of School	Final Letter Grade Request	Mitigating Factor Cited	Data/Coding Review	Within Scope of Appeals Committee
5187	Aguila Elementary School	C	Other		N
5096	Aire Libre Elementary School	A	Other		N
5637	Alchesay	D	Other		N
140440	Antelope Union High School	C	Environmental Issues; Other		N
6089	Bagdad Middle/Senior High School	Unknown	Other	Y	N
81110	Bales Elementary	B or Above	Adverse Testing Conditions; Other		N
89571	Betty H. Fairfax	C	Other		N
5645/5646	Blue Ridge Elementary School	D	Adverse Testing Conditions; Other	Y	N
87473	Buckeye Elementary	Whatever is yielded after removing impacted classrooms and their data	Adverse Testing Conditions; Other	Y	N
5424	Buckeye Union High School	C	Environmental Issue or Events; Other	Y	N
5808	Canyon Del Oro High School	B	Environmental Issues or Events		N
5948	Casa Grande Union High School	C	Other		N
78847	Cesar Chavez High School	C	Other		N
79012	Clove Campbell Elementary	B	Environmental Issue or Events; Adverse Testing Conditions; School or Community Emergency; Other		Y
79639	Copper Ridge School	A	Other		Y
90028	Copper Trails Schools	A	Environmental Issues or Events; Adverse Testing Conditions; Other		N
5386	Cordova Elementary School	B	Environmental Issues or Events; Adverse Testing Conditions		Y
79102	Country Gardens Charter Schools	C	Environmental Issues or Events; Adverse Testing Conditions		Y
5418	Desert Horizon Elementary School	C	School Tragedy		Y
5348	Eliseo C Felix School	C	Environmental Issues or Events; Adverse Testing Conditions; Other		N
530879	Fine Arts Academy	NR	Environmental Issues or Events; Adverse Testing Conditions; Other		N
4842	Flagstaff Arts and Leadership Academy	A	Other	Y	N
4819	Flagstaff High School	A	Environmental Issues or Events; Adverse Testing Conditions; School or Community Emergency; Other		Y
4207	Flagstaff Junior Academy	B	Other	Y	N
5167	Fountain Hills High School	B	Other	Y	N
78585000	George Gervin Youth Center	NR	Adverse Testing Conditions		N
5795	Helen Keeling Elementary	C	Environmental Issues; Adverse Testing Conditions		Y
5106	Horizon High School	A	Other		N
90035	Imagine Prep Coolidge	1 Consolidated Grade	Other		N
5086	Indian Bend Elementary School	B	Other		N
5844 and 948673	Indian Oasis Elementary Primary and Intermediate Schools	B	Other		N
89572	Jasinski Elementary	Whatever is yielded after removing impacted classrooms and their data	Adverse Testing Conditions; Other		N
10878	Keystone Montessori	?	Other	Y	N
5398	Kyrene Akimel A-Al Middle School	B	Other		N
5297	Kyrene Altadena Middle School	A	Other		N
78923	Kyrene de la Estrella	A	Other		N
5310	Kyrene de la Mariposa School	A	Other		N
89616	Leading Edge Academy East Mesa	A	Other	Y	N
5360	Littleton Elementary School	C	Environmental Issues or Events; Other		N
5797	LM Prince School	D	Environmental Issues or Events; Adverse Testing Conditions		Y
5324	Madison #1	A	Other	Y	N
91935	Madison Highland Prep	NR	Other		N
89622	Madison Traditional Academy	A	Other	Y	N
5893	Mary C O Brien Elementary School	A	Adverse testing conditions; Other	Y	Y
6248	Metrotech	B	Other	Y	N
5347	Michael Anderson Elementary School	B	Environmental Issues or Events; Adverse Testing Conditions; Other		N
6127	Mingus Union High School	B	Other		N
80011	Montessori Academy	B	Adverse Testing Conditions		Y
79729	Mountain Trail Middle School	B	Other		N
5482	New School for the Arts and Academics	?	Other	Y	N
80986	New School for the Arts and Academics Middle School	C	Other	Y	N
5077	North Ranch Elementary School	A	Other		N
89918	Paragon Science Academy	A	Other	Y	N
79205	Paramount Academy	C	Other		N
79268	Pinnacle High School	A	Other		N
8135	Prescott High School	B	Other	Y	N
5141	Queen Creek High School	A	Other	Y	N
4760	San Simon School	N/A	Other	Y	N
89907	San Tan Foothills High School	B	Other	Y	N
10849	Sequoia Charter Secondary School	F	Other	Y	N
5104	Shea Middle School		Other		N
90191	Sinagua Middle School	C	Adverse Testing Conditions		Y
79127	Sonoran Science Academy	A	Other	Y	N
4451	Stanfield Elementary School	C or D Whatever Grade is yielded after removal of impacted student data	Adverse Testing Conditions; Other		N
87471	Sundance Elementary School	B or Above	Other		N
5907	Superior Unified School District	C	Other	Y	N
4376	Topock Elementary School	B	Other		N
90859	Trivium Preparatory Academy	A	Other	Y	N
4800	Valley Union High School	B	Other		N
5100	Vista Verde Middle School	C	Other		N
5453	Westview High School	B	Other		N