

January 22, 2024 Regular Board Meeting 01/22/2024 - 09:00 AM

1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower 3rd Floor Boardroom Phoenix, AZ 85007

MEETING MINUTES

Arizona State Board of Education

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday**, **January 22**, **2024 at 9:00 A.M**.

The Monday, January 22, 2024 State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. This means that the public has the opportunity to participate in-person or virtually.

Please note the location of the **Monday, January 22, 2024** State Board of Education meeting: 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, 3rd Floor Boardroom, Phoenix, AZ 85007. The public will have physical access to the meeting location 30 minutes before the Board meeting, at 8:30 A.M.

A copy of the meeting agenda is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically or virtually.

Agenda materials can be reviewed online at http://azsbe.az.gov(https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/CxysUcZQyJ5BMs64Of1FNQ==)

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A) (3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The Monday, January 22, 2024 State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. Please see the instructions below on how to access the meeting and provide public comment on agenda items, regardless of the chosen access method.

Accessing the State Board of Education Meeting Virtually

To watch the State Board meeting online:

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit azsbe.az.gov
- In the upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click "ok"
- When the meeting starts, you will see a "live" video. If you do not see this, and the meeting's start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

Procedure for Submitting a Public Comment (Please read through each option carefully):

Advance registration is required to provide verbal public comment. The deadline to submit a written comment and/or to register for a verbal public comment is Thursday, January 18, 2024 at 12:00pm. Individuals that attempt to register or submit a written comment after the

deadline will not be provided the opportunity to give public comment at the meeting.

By registering, you are submitting a request to speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine at which public comment agenda item (#2, #4, #6, or #8) you will be called.

All Board policies in regard to public comment at meetings apply to in-person and virtual public comments. Public comments are limited to three minutes unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting.

Virtual Public Comment:

Please use this link to register for a **Virtual** public comment: https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_Sfzm9BL-QuWI0OvyfMHmZg(https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/HSFu24FtV9UcA2zo1ds6qg==)

In-Person Public Comment:

Please use this link to register for afin-Person public comment: https://forms.gle/gauH2fJc1HuqnooZ7(https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/uHft0xcEK45xBTObhSxaqw==)

Written Comment:

Written comments for the meeting will be accepted by:

- email inbox@azsbe.az.gov
- fax to (602) 542-3046
- USPS to 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, Suite 300, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

If you need assistance with registering or do not have internet access to register for a virtual comment, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

DATED AND POSTED this 12th day of January, 2024.

Arizona State Board of Education

Sean Ross

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

9:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Dr. Daniel Corr, President Katherine Haley, Vice President Tom Horne, Superintendent Jenny Clark, Board Member Dr. Jacqui Clay, Board Member Dr. Scott Hagerman, Board Member Karla Phillips-Krivickas, Board Member Julia Meyerson, Board Member Jason Catanese, Board Member - Virtual Dr. Robert Robbins, Board Member - Virtual (left the meeting at 11:47am) Anna Tovar, Board Member (joined the meeting at 9:04am)

1. Presentation of candidates and election of State Board of Education Officers for 2024

Board Meeting called to order at 9:02am.

Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

Member Tovar joined the Board Meeting at 9:04am.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross presented the results of the agenda item.

2. BUSINESS REPORTS

A. President's Report

President Dr. Corr presented the President's Report.

B. Superintendent's Report

None.

C. Executive Director's Report

1. State Board Students of the Month for January 2024

Executive Director Ross presented the first Student of the Month. The nominated student, Carlyn Farar, made comments to the Board.

Executive Director Ross presented the second Student of the Month. The nominated student, Adelle Ekpo, made comments to the Board.

3. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Dr. Viridiana Benitez, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Sarah Jedlowski, representing Stand for Children AZ, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Nicole Marquez, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Francheska Figueroa, representing AZTESOL, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Elizabeth Tietje, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Maria Cristina Ladas, representing AZ DLI Network, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

4. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made to approve items 4A through 4M.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark
Motion seconded by: Katherine Haley
Voting:
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Abstain
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Recuse
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Recuse
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Yes Anna Tovar - Yes

- A. Approval of the Arizona State University M.Ed Early Childhood Special Education educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in Special Education: Early Childhood, Birth Age 8 or Grade 3
- B. Approval of the Grand Canyon University Master of Education in Secondary Education, Humanities Emphasis, educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in Secondary Education, Grades 6-12
- C. Approval of the Grand Canyon University Master of Education in Secondary Education, STEM emphasis, educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in Secondary Education, Grades 6-12
- D. Approval of the Deer Valley Unified School District DVUSD Teacher Prep Program Early Childhood Education, Classroom-Based Prep Program leading to Arizona certification in Early Childhood Education, Birth Age 8 or Grade 3
- E. Approval of the Northern Arizona University Administration: Superintendent, Grades Prek-12 educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in Administration: Superintendent, Grades PreK-12
- F. Approval of the Northern Arizona University MEd Special Education Early Childhood Special Education with Certification educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in Special Education: Early Childhood, Birth Age 8 or Grade 3
- G. Approval of the Grand Canyon University Master of Education in School Counseling educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in School Counseling, Grades PreK-12
- H. Approval of the Capella University Master of Science (MS) in Education, Leadership in Educational Administration educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in Administration: Principal, Grades PreK-12
- I. Approval of Structured English Immersion (SEI) Course Provider(s)
- J. Approval of the Teachers of Tomorrow Elementary Education Alternative Pathway educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in Elementary Education, Grades K-8
- K. Approval of the Teachers of Tomorrow Secondary Education Alternative Pathway educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in Secondary Education, Grades 6-12
- L. Consideration to approve the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds.
- M. Approval of the appointment and removal of members from the Professional Practices Advisory Committees

5. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Walter Clarke, representing FamilyCFO LLC, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Elena Zee, representing Arizona Council on Economic Education, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Christian Sherrill, representing NGPF Mission 2030 Fund, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Melissa Taylor, representing Greater Phoenix Leadership, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Michele Bentivegna, representing Peoria Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

6. GENERAL SESSION

A. Presentation and discussion of personal finance education for high school

The Honorable Kimberly Yee, State Treasurer of Arizona, presented to the Board. Sharon Lechter, Financial Literacy Expert and Arizona Financial Literacy Task Force Member, presented to the Board.

The Honorable Kimberly Yee continued to present to the Board.

Vice President Haley made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item. Sharon Lechter provided clarification about this agenda item.

Vice President Haley sought clarification about this agenda item.

Sharon Lechter provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item. Sharon Lechter provided clarification about this agenda item. Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item. Sharon Lechter provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Clark made comments about this agenda item.

Sharon Lechter made comments made comments about this agenda item.

The Honorable Kimberly Yee made comments about this agenda item.

Member Clark made comments about this agenda item.

The Honorable Kimberly Yee made comments about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

 $\label{lem:member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item. \\$

Sharon Lechter made comments about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

B. UPDATED: Presentation and discussion of Governor Hobbs' Teacher Recruitment and Retention Taskforce 2023 Report

Erin Hart, Higher Education Policy Advisor for the Office of Governor Hobbs, presented to the Board. Justin Wing, Assistant Superintendent of Human Resources for Mesa Public Schools, presented to the Board. Dr. Melissa Sadorf, Superintendent of Stanfield Elementary District, presented to the Board.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

Superintendent Horne made comments about this agenda item.

Member Tovar made comments about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item.

Member Clark made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Erin Hart provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Clark sought clarification about this agenda item.

Erin Hart provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Clark sought clarification about this agenda item.

Erin Hart provided clarification about this agenda item.

Superintendent Horne made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Erin Hart provided clarification about this agenda item.

Superintendent Horne made comments about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

C. Presentation and discussion of Grand Canyon University's Teacher Preparation Program

Dr. Carol Lippert, Assistant Vice-President for K-12 Outreach and Support, presented to the Board.

Dr. Cherryl Paul, Assistant Vice-President for Academic Alliances, introduced herself.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano, Assistant Dean for the College of Education, introduced herself.

Dr. Carol Lippert continued to present to the Board.

Dr. Cherryl Paul presented to the Board.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano presented to the Board.

Dr. Carol Lippert continued to present to the Board.

Superintendent Horne made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Superintendent Horne sought clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item. Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson made comments about this agenda item.

Vice President Haley made comments about sought clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Vice President Haley sought clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Cherryl Paul provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Vice President Haley made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Dr. Lindy Guadiano provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item.

Member Clark made comments about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Dr. Carol Lippert made comments about this agenda item.

The Board Meeting took a break at 11:17am.

The Board Meeting returned to session at 11:30am.

D. UPDATED: Presentation and discussion of Arizona's Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21st Century Act (Perkins V) Plan

Kevin Imes, State Director for CTE, presented to the Board.

Jessica Mueller, Research and Data Analyst for the State Board of Education, made comments about the agenda item.

Kevin Imes continued to present to the Board.

Jessica Mueller made comments about the agenda item.

Kevin Imes continued to present to the Board.

Vice President Haley sought clarification about the agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about the agenda item.

Vice President Haley made comments about the agenda item.

Kevin Imes made comments about the agenda item.

Vice President Haley made comments about the agenda item.

Kevin Imes continued to present to the Board.

Member Dr. Clay sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay sought clarification about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes made comments about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes made comments about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Robbins left the Board Meeting at 11:47am.

Member Dr. Clay made comments about this agenda item.

Member Dr. Hagerman made comments about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes made comments about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes made comments about this agenda item.

Vice President Haley made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

Vice President Haley sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

Vice President Haley made comments about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes made comments about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

Gina Schmitz, Director of CTE Grants, provided clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Gina Schmitz, provided clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Gina Schmitz, provided clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr sought clarification about this agenda item.

Gina Schmitz provided clarification about this agenda item.

 $\label{president Dr. Corr sought clarification about this agenda item. \\$

Gina Schmitz provided clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr sought clarification about this agenda item.

Gina Schmitz provided clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

Member Clark made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Kevin Imes provided clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

E. Presentation, discussion, and possible action to reform the State Board of Education Ad Hoc K-3 Early Literacy Advisory Subcommittee

Executive Director Ross presented this agenda item to the Board.

Vice President Haley sought clarification about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Meyerson made comments about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

Superintendent Horne made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Linda Burrows, Deputy Associate Superintendent of Academic Standards for the Department of Education, provided clarification about this agenda item.

Superintendent Horne sought clarification about this agenda item.

Linda Burrow provided clarification

Superintendent Horne made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to approve the recreation of the State Board of Education Ad Hoc K-3 Early Literacy Advisory Subcommittee.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Karla Phillips-Krivickas

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes Jason Catanese - Yes Jenny Clark - Yes Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

Anna Tovar - Yes

F. Presentation, discussion and possible action to open rulemaking procedures for A.A.C. R7-2-320, Seal of Civics Literacy

Hannah Rude, Director of K-12 Social Studies and World and Native Languages, presented to the Board.

Member Phillips-Krivickas sought clarification about this agenda item.

Hannah Rude provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Tovar made comments and sought clarification about this agenda item.

Hannah Rude provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas sought clarification about this agenda item.

Hannah Rude provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

A motion was made to open rulemaking procedures for A.A.C. R7-2-320, Seal of Civics Literacy.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Anna Tovar

Motion seconded by: Katherine Haley

Voting: Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes Jason Catanese - Yes Jenny Clark - Yes Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes Katherine Haley - Yes Tom Horne - Yes Julia Meverson - Yes Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

Anna Tovar - Yes

G. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the recommendation to deny the Parent's/Guardian's, E.S.'s, appeal and adopt the Arizona Department of Education (Department's) denial of a purchase in Empowerment Scholarship Account (ESA) for Appeal Case No. 00057

Executive Director Ross presented this agenda item to the Board.

A motion was made to adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Recommendation from the Hearing Officer to deny the Parent/Guardian's, E.S.'s, appeal 00057.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark Motion seconded by: Dr. Jacqui Clay Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present
Anna Tovar - Yes

1. J.S., student by and through the Parent/Guardian, E.S., ESA Appeal Case No. 00057 Supporting Documents

H. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the recommendation to deny the Parent's/Guardian's, I.B.'s, appeal and adopt the Arizona Department of Education (Department's) denial of a purchase in Empowerment Scholarship Account (ESA) for Appeal Case No. 00050

A motion was made to adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Recommendation from the Hearing Officer to deny the Parent/Guardian's, E.S.'s, appeal 00050.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark
Motion seconded by: Katherine Haley
Voting:
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present
Anna Tovar - Yes

1. A.B., student by and through the Parent/Guardian, I.B., ESA Appeal Case No. 00050 Supporting Documents

I. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs: The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

Federico Yanez, Project Director of Policy for the State Board of Education, presented to the Board.

President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.

Federico Yanez continued to present to the Board.

Executive Director Ross presented to the Board.

Federico Yanez continued to present to the Board.

Executive Director Ross continued to present to the Board.

Executive Director Ross sought clarification about the agenda item.

Federico Yanez provided clarification about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Federico Yanez provided clarification about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross continued to present to the Board.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas sought clarification about this agenda item.

President Dr. Corr provided clarification about this agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments about this agenda item.

7. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

None.

8. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A motion was made to approve items 8A1 through 8A15, 8B1, and 8C1 and 8C2.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Dr. Scott Hagerman

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present

Anna Tovar - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:

- 1. Jonathan Beard, Case no. C-2023-000935
 - a. Jonathan Beard, Case no. C-2023-000935 Supporting Documents
- 2. Margaret Bradley, Case no. C-2023-002366
 - a. Margaret Bradley, Case no. C- 2023-002366 Supporting Documents
- 3. Chris Gabaldon, Case no. C-2023-000709
 - a. Chris Gabaldon, Case no. C-2023-000709 Supporting Documents
- 4. Matthew Gassen, Case no. C-2023-002355
 - a. Matthew Gassen, Case no. C-2023-002355 Supporting Documents
- 5. Michael Hodges, Case no. C-2023-002189
 - a. Michael Hodges, Case no. C-2023-002189 Supporting Documents
- 6. Amy Lantz, Case no. C-2023-002360
 - a. Amy Lantz, Case no. C-2023-002360 Supporting Documents
- 7. Elizabeth Lewis, Case no. C-2023-000854
 - a. Elizabeth Lewis, Case no. C-2023-000854 Supporting Documents
- 8. Kandice Linwright, Case no. C-2023-002087
 - a. Kandice Linwright, Case no. C-2023-002087 Supporting Documents
- 9. James McSwain, Case no. C-2023-002453
 - a. James McSwain, Case no. C-2023-002453 Supporting Documents
- 10. Nicholas Murphy, Case no. C-2023-002315
 - a. Nicholas Murphy, Case no. C-2023-002315 Supporting Documents
- 11. Jodi Niblo, Case no. C-2023-002329

- a. Jodi Niblo, Case no. C-2023-002329 Supporting Documents
- 12. Eveline Pike De Cota, Case no. C-2023-000676
 - a. Eveline Pike De Cota, Case no. C-2023-000676 Supporting Documents
- 13. Josephine Sbrocca, Case no. C-2022-003431
 - a. Josephine Sbrocca, Case no. C-2022-003431 Supporting Documents
- 14. Erin Schimke, Case no. C-2022-003544
 - a. Erin Schimke, Case no. C-2022-003544 Supporting Documents
- 15. Halle Schliesmann, Case no. C-2023-002348
 - a. Halle Schliesmann, Case no. C-2023-002348 Supporting Documents
- B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by;
 - 1. Manuel Gavina, Case no. C-2019-000770
 - a. Manuel Gavina, Case no. C-2019-000770 Supporting Documents
- C. Approval of the summary suspension of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1309(A), held by:
 - 1. Brandon Green, Case no. C-2023-000302
 - a. Brandon Green, Case no. C-2023-000302 Supporting Documents
 - 2. Michelle Kinigson, Case no. C-2023-000682
 - a. Michelle Kinigson, Case no. C-2023-000682 Supporting Documents

9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Joseph C. Primous, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Flynn Carey, representing Mitchell Stein Carey Chapman, PC, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Lisa Bivens, representing Mitchell Stein Carey Chapman, PC, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Roard

John Karna, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Nicholas Enoch, representing Lubin & Enoch, P.C., submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

10. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Request for Rehearing or Review for the following educators:

A motion was made to approve Items 10A1 and 10A2.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark
Motion seconded by: Dr. Jacqui Clay
Voting:
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present Anna Toyar - Yes

- 1. Joseph Primous, Case no. C-2022-002448
 - a. Joseph Primous, Case no. C-2022-002448 Supporting Documents
- 2. Leo Reynoso, Case no. C-2022-003587
 - a. Leo Reynoso, Case no. C-2022-003587- Supporting Documents
- B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:

A motion was made to approve Items 10B1 through 10B7.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Scott Hagerman Motion seconded by: Karla Phillips-Krivickas Voting:
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present
Anna Toyar - Yes

- 1. James Acheampomg, Case no. C-2023-001011
 - a. James Acheampomg, Case no. C-2023-001011 Supporting Documents
- 2. Alexis Anderson-Harper, Case no. C-2022-003317
 - a. Alexis Anderson-Harper, Case no. C-2022-003317 Supporting Documents
- 3. Allison Law, Case no. C-2023-000810
 - a. Allison Law, Case no. C-2023-000810 Supporting Documents
- 4. David Lowenstein, Case no. C-2023-000977
 - a. David Lowenstein, Case no. C-2023-000977 Supporting Documents
- 5. Isaias Montano, Case no. C-2023-000560
 - a. Isaias Montano, Case no. C-2023-000560 Supporting Documents
- 6. Antoine Reeves, Case no. C-2023-001192
 - a. Antoine Reeves, Case no. C-2023-001192 Supporting Documents
- 7. Linda Sedig, Case no. C-2022-003364
 - a. Linda Sedig, Case no. C-2022-003364 Supporting Documents
- C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendations of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee for the following educators:

A motion was made to approve Items 10C1 through 10C3.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Katherine Haley Motion seconded by: Anna Tovar Voting:
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes
Jenny Clark - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Katherine Haley - Yes
Tom Horne - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Dr. Robert Robbins - Not Present
Anna Tovar - Yes

- 1. Kathleen Bailey, Case no. C-2022-000876
 - a. Kathleen Bailey, Case no. C-2022-000876 Supporting Documents
- 2. Stacia Blier, Case no. C-2022-001829
 - a. Stacia Blier, Case no. C-2022-001829 Supporting Documents
- 3. John Karna, Case no. C-2022-001659
 - a. John Karna, Case no. C-2022-001659- Supporting Documents

11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Executive Director Ross made comments about the upcoming Board Meeting on Monday, February 26th, 2024.

Member Dr. Clay expressed thanks to the Arizona Department of Education.

Board Meeting adjourned at 12:50pm.