



## March 25, 2024 Regular Board Meeting

**03/25/2024 - 09:00 AM**

1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower

3rd Floor Boardroom

Phoenix, AZ 85007

### MEETING MINUTES

---

#### Arizona State Board of Education

##### Agenda

#### NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, March 25, 2024, at 9:00 A.M.**

The **Monday, March 25, 2024**, State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. This means that the public has the opportunity to participate in-person or virtually.

Please note the location of the **Monday, March 25, 2024**, State Board of Education meeting: 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, 3rd Floor Boardroom, Phoenix, AZ 85007. The public will have physical access to the meeting location 30 minutes before the Board meeting, at 8:30 A.M.

A copy of the meeting agenda is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically or virtually.

Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>(<http://azsbe.az.gov>)

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A) (3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The Monday, March 25, 2024, State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. Please see below on how to access the meeting and provide public comment on agenda items, regardless of the chosen access method.

#### Accessing the State Board of Education Meeting Virtually

To watch the State Board meeting online:

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit [azsbe.az.gov](http://azsbe.az.gov)
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click "ok"
- When the meeting starts, you will see a "live" video. If you do not see this, and the meeting's start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>(<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>)

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

#### Procedure for Submitting a Public Comment (Please read through each option carefully):

Advance registration is required to provide verbal public comment. **The deadline to submit a written comment and/or to register for a verbal public comment is Thursday, March 21, 2024, at 12:00pm.** Individuals that attempt to register or submit a written comment after the deadline will not be provided the opportunity to give public comment at the meeting.

By registering, you are submitting a request to speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak during the appropriate public comment agenda item.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine at which public comment agenda item (#2, #4, #6, or #8) you will be called.

All Board policies in regard to public comment at meetings apply to in-person and virtual public comments. Public comments are limited to two minutes unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting. The Board may require speakers on the same side with no new comments to select a spokesperson or spokespeople.

#### Virtual Public Comment:

Please use this link to register for a **Virtual** public comment: [https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN\\_uyGMPJrGRm21dOVya7MNDg](https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_uyGMPJrGRm21dOVya7MNDg)(<https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com//SU/YIDJGqoZPFU5182ZBvelwQ==>)

**In-Person Public Comment:**

Please use this link to register for an In-Person public comment: <https://forms.gle/voRUyFNNzCgktKpn8>(<https://forms.gle/voRUyFNNzCgktKpn8>)

**Written Comment:**

Written comments for the meeting will be accepted by:

- email [inbox@azsbe.az.gov](mailto:inbox@azsbe.az.gov)
- fax to (602) 542-3046
- USPS to 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, Suite 300, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

If you need assistance with registering or do not have internet access to register for a virtual comment, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

DATED AND POSTED the 15th day of March 2024.

Arizona State Board of Education

By: 

Sean Ross  
Executive Director  
(602) 542-5057

9:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

**Attendees**

---

Dr. Daniel Corr, President - Virtual  
Katherine Haley, Vice President  
Tom Horne, Superintendent - Virtual  
Jenny Clark, Board Member (*left the meeting at 9:55am, returned to the meeting at 9:57am*)  
Dr. Scott Hagerman, Board Member - Virtual  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas, Board Member (*left the meeting at 10:53am, returned to the meeting at 10:56am*)  
Julia Meyerson, Board Member  
Jason Catanese, Board Member (*left the meeting at 10:30am, returned to the meeting at 10:33am, returned to the meeting at 11:31am after the Board's break*)  
Anna Tovar, Board Member

---

**1. BUSINESS REPORTS**

*Board Meeting called to order at 9:05am.*

**A. President's Report**

None.

**B. Superintendent's Report**

Superintendent Horne presented the Superintendent's Report.

**1. Presentation of Milken Educator Award Winners for Arizona**

Superintendent Horne presented the Milken Educator Awards.

**2. Presentation of the Arizona educators who have been named as finalists for the Presidential Awards for Excellence in Mathematics and Science Teaching (PAEMST)**

Superintendent Horne presented the PAEMST Educator Awards.

**C. Executive Director's Report**

**1. State Board Students of the Month for March 2024**

Executive Director Ross presented the first Student of the Month.  
The nominated student, Charlie Kanarish, made comments to the Board.

Executive Director Ross presented the second Student of the Month.  
The nominated student, Deepika Moola, made comments to the Board.

Vice President Haley made comments about this agenda item.

## 2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

David Garner, representing Osborn Maledon PA, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Sarah Jedlowski, representing Stand for Children AZ, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Georgina Monsalvo, representing Stand for Children AZ, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Daniel Hernandez, representing Stand for Children AZ, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

John Kalaras, representing Ariston U, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Michael Economides, representing Platinum Mindset Group, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Jim Bannon, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

*Member Clark left the Board Meeting at 9:55am.*

Tim Fountain, representing J.O. Combs Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

*Member Clark returned to the Board Meeting at 9:57am.*

Dr. Brendan O'Connor, representing Arizona State University, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Nicole Marquez, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

## 3. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made to approve agenda items 3A through 3I.

Member Meyerson made comments about recusing herself.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Jason Catanese

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Recuse

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Anna Tovar - Yes

**A. Approval of the hearing officer's recommendations to deny the appeal for certification for reasons that do not involve immoral or unprofessional conduct for Parul Srivastava, Case No. 2023-006**

**B. Approval for the attached Small School Districts to receive the indicated 2024 state aid and budget capacity due to the Capital Transportation Adjustment for Small School Districts pursuant to 15-963**

**C. Approval of American Sign Language Proficiency Examinations to Meet Educator Certification Requirements**

**D. Approval of the Dysart Unified School District Ready2Teach-Elementary Education, Classroom-Based Prep Program leading to Arizona certification in Elementary Education, Grades K-8**

**E. Approval to refer ESA cases to the Attorney General's Office of Collections**

**F. Approval of the Veteran's Heritage Project for use with the Seal of Civics Literacy Program**

**G. Consideration to approve the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds**

**H. UPDATED - Approval of the A-F Appeals Committee recommendations for school year 2022-2023 - UPDATED**

**I. Approval of receipt of J.S. Held quarterly report regarding the receivership of Antelope Union High School District**

## 4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Zsuzsanna Anderson, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kelly Kenney, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Whitney Marsh, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Rosemary McAtee, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Heather Rubalcava, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Bonita Scales (Jenkins), representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Erin Charles, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kelly Zuk, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kathryn Villapudua, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Monica Barnett, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Becky Greene, representing Sacred Heart Home Educators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Cynthia Anderson, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Maria Herrera, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

*Member Catanese left the Board Meeting at 10:30am.*

Harmony lerley, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

*Member Catanese returned to the Board Meeting at 10:33am.*

Michael Jetty, representing Sacred Heart Home Educators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Paige Mason, representing Personal with Paige, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kelly Pichitino, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lindsey King, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Caroline Medrano, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kevin Kevin Biesty, representing Arizona Christian Education Coalition, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Karye Perez, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Julie Scura, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Katie Trovino, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Jackie Whalen, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

## **5. GENERAL SESSION**

**The Board proceeded to agenda item 5B.**

### **A. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs: The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals**

Federico Yanez, Project Director of Policy for the State Board of Education, presented to the Board.

*The Board took a break at 11:18am.*

*The Board returned from the break at 11:30am.*

### **B. Presentation, discussion, and possible action to approve the Empowerment Scholarship Account (ESA) Handbook for school year 2024-2025 pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03 (A) (3).**

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

Superintendent Horne made comments about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

Member Catanese sought clarification about the agenda item.

VP Haley provided clarification about the agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.

Vice President Haley sought clarification about the agenda item.

Multiple Board Members provided clarification about the agenda item.

*Member Phillips-Krivickas left the board meeting at 10:53am.*

John Ward, Executive Director for the Arizona Department of Education ESA Program, presented to the Board.

*Member Phillips-Krivickas returned to the board meeting at 10:56am.*

Member Clark made comments about the agenda item.

Member Tovar made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Tovar sought clarification about the agenda item.  
John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Tovar made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Member Tovar made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
John Ward sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Member Tovar made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Tovar made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Member Tovar made comments about the agenda item.

Vice President Haley made comments about the agenda item.  
Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.  
Vice President Haley made comments about the agenda item.

A motion was made that the State Board of Education adopt the SY2023-24 ESA Parent Handbook as the ESA Handbook for SY2024-25.

Motion passed: 8-1.

Motion made by: Tom Horne

Motion seconded by: Jenny Clark

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Tom Horne - Yes  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Anna Tovar - No

**The Board proceeded to agenda item 5A.**

## **6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

*Member Catanese returned to the Board Meeting at 11:31am.*

Nikkol Krug, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

## **7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

A motion was made to approve items 7A1 through 7A15, 7B1 through 7B3, 7C1, 7D1 and 7E1 and 7E2.

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Anna Tovar

Motion seconded by: Jenny Clark

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes  
Jason Catanese - Yes  
Jenny Clark - Yes  
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes  
Katherine Haley - Yes  
Tom Horne - Yes  
Julia Meyerson - Yes  
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes  
Anna Tovar - Yes

### **A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:**

#### **1. Charles Ashe, Case no. C-2024-000095**

a. Charles Ashe, Case no. C- 2024-000095 - Supporting Documents

#### **2. Ralph Battaline, Case no. C-2023-000989**

a. Ralph Battaline, Case no. C-2023-000989 - Supporting Documents

#### **3. Shawn Boomer, Case no. C-2023-002288**

a. Shawn Boomer, Case no. C-2023-002288 - Supporting Documents

#### **4. Sherry Cutrer, Case no. C-2023-000685**

a. Sherry Cutrer, Case no. C-2023-000685- Supporting Documents

#### **5. Kaitlyn Goodell, Case no. C-2023-002887**

- a. Kaitlyn Goodell, Case no. C-2023-002887- Supporting Documents
- 6. Patrick Green, Case no. C-2022-003303
  - a. Patrick Green, Case no. C-2022-003303 - Supporting Documents
- 7. Erin Jackson, Case no. C-2023-002243
  - a. Erin Jackson, Case no. C-2023-002243 - Supporting Documents
- 8. David Kimball, Case no. C-2023-002880
  - a. David Kimball, Case no. C-2023-002880- Supporting Documents
- 9. Sergio Lopez, Case no. C-2024-000106
  - a. Sergio Lopez, Case no. C-2024-000106 - Supporting Documents
- 10. Oscar Medina, Case no. C-2023-002968
  - a. Oscar Medina, Case no. C-2023-002968 - Supporting Documents
- 11. Benjamin Minor, Case no. C-2023-002961
  - a. Benjamin Minor, Case no. C-2023-002961 - Supporting Documents
- 12. Amanda Russell, Case no. C-2023-002906
  - a. Amanda Russell, Case no. C-2023-002906 - Supporting Documents
- 13. Peggy Staton, Case no. C-2023-002751
  - a. Peggy Staton, Case no. C-2023-002751- Supporting Documents
- 14. Joseph Volkman, Case no. C-2023-002294
  - a. Joseph Volkman, Case no. C-2023-002294- Supporting Documents
- 15. Wendy Yasko, Case no. C-2024-000093
  - a. Wendy Yasko, Case no. C-2024-000093- Supporting Documents
- B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:
  - 1. Elijah Brown-Thomas, Case no. C-2023-002286
    - a. Elijah Brown-Thomas, Case no. C-2023-002286- Supporting Documents
  - 2. Nicholas Brozina, Case no. C-2022-002449
    - a. Nicholas Brozina, Case no. C-2022-002449 - Supporting Documents
  - 3. Melissa Didiana, Case no. C-2021-013065
    - a. Melissa Didiana, Case no. C-2021-013065 - Supporting Documents
- C. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-534.04(C), for the following individuals:
  - 1. Michael Clawson, Case no. C-2023-001561
    - a. Michael Clawson, Case no. C-2023-001561 - Supporting Documents
- D. Approval of the non-issuance and/or revocation of any and all educator certificates and/or right to work in an Arizona district or charter school, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1307(A), held by:
  - 1. Philip Anton, Case no. C- 2024-000050
    - a. Philip Anton, Case no. C- 2024-000050 - Supporting Documents
- E. Approval of the summary suspension of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1309(A), held by:
  - 1. Ryan Baron, Case No. C-2024-000042
    - a. Ryan Baron, Case No. C-2024-000042 - Supporting Documents
  - 2. Ivan Martinez-Arce, Case no. C-2023-002959

a. Ivan Martinez-Arce, Case no. C-2023-002959 - Supporting Documents

## 8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Richard Huntley, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lou Caputo, Assistant Attorney General for the State Board of Education, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Morgan Bigelow, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

## 9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

### A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for the following individuals:

A motion was made to approve items 9A1 through 9A7.

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Anna Tovar

Motion seconded by: Karla Phillips-Krivickas

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Anna Tovar - Yes

#### 1. Andrews Asiedu, Case no. C-2023-000790

a. Andrews Asiedu, Case no. C-2023-000790 - Supporting Documents

#### 2. Deanna Johnson, Case no. C-2023-002308

a. Deanna Johnson, Case no. C-2023-002308 - Supporting Documents

#### 3. Erin Quigley, Case no. C-2023-000248

a. Erin Quigley, Case no. C-2023-000248 - Supporting Documents

#### 4. Kendall Spohr, Case no. C- 2023-000141

a. Kendall Spohr, Case no. C- 2023-000141 - Supporting Documents

#### 5. Hal Tait, Case no. C-2022-002650

a. Hal Tait, Case no. C-2022-002650 - Supporting Documents

#### 6. Chance Weir, Case no. C-2023-000247

a. Chance Weir, Case no. C-2023-000247 - Supporting Documents

#### 7. Joshua Zatzoff, Case no. C-2023-001132

a. Joshua Zatzoff, Case no. C-2023-001132- Supporting Documents

### B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendations of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee for the following individuals:

A motion was made to approve items 9B1 through 9B12.

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Jenny Clark

Motion seconded by: Jason Catanese

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Jenny Clark - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Anna Tovar - Yes

1. Andrew Briones, Case no. C-2023-000263
  - a. Andrew Briones, Case no. C-2023-000263 - Supporting Documents
2. Brandon Brothers, Case no. C-2023-001091
  - a. Brandon Brothers, Case no. C-2023-001091- Supporting Documents
3. Brooks Charlton, Case no. C-2022-003221
  - a. Brooks Charlton, Case no. C-2022-003221 - Supporting Documents
4. Terrance James Geneeha, Case no. C- 2023-001622
  - a. Terrance James Geneeha, Case no. C- 2023-001622 - Supporting Documents
5. James Gustafson, Case no. C-2022-003260
  - a. James Gustafson, Case no. C-2022-003260 - Supporting Documents
6. Richard Huntley, Case no. C-2021-013009
  - a. Richard Huntley, Case no. C-2021-013009- Supporting Documents
7. Cord Ivanyi, Case no. C-2022-001128
  - a. Cord Ivanyi, Case no. C-2022-001128 - Supporting Documents
8. Carrie Kiesgen, Case no. C-2022-003344
  - a. Carrie Kiesgen, Case no. C-2022-003344 - Supporting Documents
9. Jestin Manson, Case no. C-2023-000407
  - a. Jestin Manson, Case no. C-2023-000407- Supporting Documents
10. Jacob Samora, Case no. C-2022-002163
  - a. Jacob Samora, Case no. C-2022-002163 - Supporting Documents
11. Bethany Stoian, Case no. C-2023-001135
  - a. Bethany Stoian, Case no. C-2023-001135 - Supporting Documents
12. Dei Yoon, Case no. C-2022-002690
  - a. Dei Yoon, Case no. C-2022-002690 - Supporting Documents

**10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**

Executive Director Ross made comments about the next Board Meeting on Monday, April 22nd, 2024 at 9am.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the incoming Deputy Director for the State Board of Education.

Vice President Haley made comments about the agenda item.

*Board Meeting adjourned at 11:42am.*