



**August 27, 2024 Board Retreat**  
**08/27/2024 - 09:00 AM**  
1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower  
3rd Floor Boardroom  
Phoenix, AZ 85007

## MEETING MINUTES

---

### Arizona State Board of Education

#### Agenda

#### **NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a Retreat, open to the public, on **Tuesday, August 27, 2024 at 9:00 A.M.**

The **Tuesday, August 27, 2024** State Board of Education Retreat will be a hybrid-access meeting, meaning the public has the opportunity to attend in-person or virtually.

Please note the location of the **Tuesday, August 27, 2024** State Board of Education Retreat, 1700 W Washington Street, Executive Tower, 3rd Floor Boardroom, Phoenix, AZ 85007

A copy of the Retreat agenda is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically or virtually.

Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection and for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The **Tuesday, August 27, 2024** State Board of Education Retreat will be a hybrid-access meeting. Please see the information below on how to access the meeting.

#### **To watch the State Board meeting online:**

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit [azsbe.az.gov](http://azsbe.az.gov)
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon

- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click “ok”
- When the meeting starts, you will see a “live” video. If you do not see this, and the meeting’s start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board’s office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

DATED AND POSTED this 16th day of August, 2024.

Arizona State Board of Education

By:



Sean Ross

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

9:00 AM CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

**Attendees**

---

- Dr. Daniel Corr, President
- Katherine Haley, Vice President
- Tom Horne, Superintendent (*left at 10:36am, returned at 10:37am, left at 11:31am*)
- Dr. Jacqui Clay, Board Member (*left at 10:15am, returned at 10:19am, left at 11:46am, returned at 11:47am*)
- Dr. Scott Hagerman, Board Member
- Karla Phillips-Krivickas, Board Member
- Julia Meyerson, Board Member
- Jason Catanese, Board Member (*arrived at 9:07am*)
- Anna Tovar, Board Member (*left at 9:12am, returned at 9:25am*)

**1. Executive Director's Report: Overview of the retreat**

*Board Meeting called to order at 9:05am.*

Executive Director Ross presented the agenda item.

**2. Presentation and discussion on chronic absenteeism data state and nationwide, Arizona's Chronic Absenteeism Task Force, and the Chronic Absenteeism Resource Guide**

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

*Member Catanese joined the Board Meeting at 9:07am.*

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.  
Superintendent Horne made comments about the agenda item.  
Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

Lori Masseur, Early Learning Director for Read On Arizona, presented to the Board.

*Member Tovar left the Board Meeting at 9:12am.*

President Dr. Corr sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.

Lori Masseur continued to present to the Board.

*Member Tovar returned to the Board Meeting at 9:25am.*

Lori Masseur continued to present to the Board.

Superintendent Horne sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Superintendent Horne sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Superintendent Horne made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.

Superintendent Horne made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur made comments about the agenda item.  
Executive Director Ross provided clarification about the agenda item.

Superintendent Horne sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Superintendent Horne made comments about the agenda item.

Member Catanese made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Member Catanese made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Member Catanese made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Member Catanese made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.  
Member Catanese made comments about the agenda item.

Member Catanese sought clarification and made comments about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Member Catanese made comments about the agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.  
President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur made comments about the agenda item.  
President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.

Lori Masseur made comments about the agenda item.  
Member Dr. Hagerman made comments about the agenda item.  
Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Member Dr. Clay made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Lori Masseur provided clarification about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.  
President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.  
Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

### **3. Presentation and discussion of the New Pathways for Youth program and its role in assisting students from vulnerable populations in finding postsecondary success**

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

Karen Johnson, Ph.D, President and CEO of New Pathways for Youth, presented to the Board.

Superintendent Horne sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Karen Johnson, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Karen Johnson, Ph.D, continued to present to the Board.  
President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.

Karen Johnson, Ph.D, continued to present to the Board.

Vice President Haley made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Karen Johnson, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Karen Johnson, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Karen Johnson, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Catanese sought clarification about the agenda item.  
Karen Johnson, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.  
Member Catanese made comments about the agenda item.  
Karen Johnson, Ph.D, made comments about the agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.

*Member Dr. Clay left the Board Meeting at 10:15am.*

#### **4. Presentation and discussion on high school and postsecondary matriculation, completion, and success data by the Arizona State University and Helios Decision Center for Educational Excellence**

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, Director at ASU/Helios Decision Center for Educational Excellence, presented to the Board.

*Member Dr. Clay returned to the Board Meeting at 10:19am.*

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, continued to present to the Board.

Rebecca McKay, Senior Data Scientist at ASU/Helios Decision Center for Educational Excellence, presented to the Board.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, continued to present to the Board.

Vice President Haley made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Rebecca McKay provided clarification about the agenda item.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Vice President Haley made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

*Superintendent Horne left the Board Meeting at 10:36am.*

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Vice President Haley made comments about the agenda item.

*Superintendent Horne returned to the Board Meeting at 10:37am.*

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, made comments about the agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.

Member Meyerson made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Rebecca McKay provided clarification about the agenda item.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Meyerson made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Rebecca McKay provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Meyerson made sought clarification about the agenda item.

Rebecca McKay provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Meyerson made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Meyerson made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Rebecca McKay provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about the agenda item.

Rebecca McKay provided clarification about the agenda item.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Meyerson made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Catanese made comments about the agenda item.

President Dr. Corr sought clarification and made comments about the agenda item.

Rebecca McKay provided clarification about the agenda item.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Hagerman made comments about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments about the agenda item.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, made comments about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.

Joe O'Reilly, Ph.D, made comments about the agenda item.

Rebecca McKay made comments about the agenda item.

President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.

## **5. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the FY 2026 State Board of Education proposed budget**

Executive Director Ross presented to the Board.

Vice President Haley sought clarification about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about the agenda item.

Vice President Haley sought clarification about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about the agenda item.

Vice President Haley sought clarification about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about the agenda item.

A motion was made to approve the FY26 proposed budget as provided and direct the Executive Director to submit the request to the Governor's Office by September 3, 2023.

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Scott Hagerman

Motion seconded by: Dr. Jacqui Clay

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Anna Tovar - Yes

*The Board Meeting took a break at 11:05am.*

*The Board Meeting resumed at 11:18am.*

## **6. Interactive activity to provide information and gather Board member feedback on the draft 2025 Strategic Plan, the A-F Accountability System, and the work of the Board's Enforcement and Investigative Units**

President Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.  
Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

State Board Staff presented to the Board Members.

*Superintendent Horne left the Board Meeting at 11:31am.*

### **Investigative Unit Breakout**

Bruce Duplanty, Deputy Director for the State Board of Education, presented to the various groups of Board Members. The Enforcement and Investigative Staffers were introduced. The process and caseload overview were identified. The current case inventory were shared. The caseload and workload for the Enforcement Action unit and associated statistics were elaborated. The identified trends were identified. Resources for Educators were identified.

Comments were made about the SBE's legal representation, the process regarding the discussion of cases, and the concerning trends involving social media and grooming. More data regarding grooming via social media would be appreciated.

Clarification sought regarding FCC/IVP. Comments made regarding a matrix regarding board practices for PPAC. Information about Driving Under the Influence (DUI) and Discipline matrix should be provided. Possible Board conditions could be provided in print. Clarification sought about whether the Board can provide best practices for cell phones and social media.

Comments were made about whether cases need a public defender. It is possible that the cases can be referred to AEA. Board Members had several questions and discussed PPAC training. Comments were made about discussing cases that are not unanimous. Comments were made about teachers who use force, especially as it relates to special education students. Reporting would be required. Discussion transpired about opening Administrative Rule for IU/EA. Concerns were mentioned about PPAC not being strict enough and wanting to feel out other options.

### **A-F Accountability Breakout**

Jessica Mueller, Research and Data Analyst for the State Board of Education, presented to the various groups of Board Members. The A-F Accountability system was introduced. The design, purpose, and process were defined. Upcoming changes regarding the accountability system were shared. The purpose and principles of the accountability system were elaborated. The specific role and responsibilities of the Board within this process were detailed. The philosophical, technical, and implementation agreements were summarized. The A-F Accountability principles, which are considered when adopting an accountability plan, were identified. The scoring indicators utilized by the A-F Accountability system were defined. The Proficiency, Growth, ELL Growth, graduation rate, CCRI, and Acceleration Readiness indicators were defined and elaborated. The five-year accountability plan, which started in SY2021-22, was shared. The various roles and responsibilities of the A-F Accountability model, among the Board, the Department, and the TAC, were identified. The A-F Accountability Appeals process and associated timeline were shared. The various types of appeals were identified.

Discussion regarding the middle school accountability model that is coming. Concerns about how to slice the differences in the growth data point. This is especially important since the student growth target is being brought back in SY2024-25. Clarification sought about the growth target. It is being debated that the 25% and 75% student growth percentiles be used for lower proficiency schools. Comments were made about how to weigh the data so that all schools have an opportunity to earn an A. Comments were made about how CCRI is used since it integrates college data into data systems to evaluate the validation of certain indicators. The CCRI does lend to high schools to consider the holistic part of a student vs. just tests. Would appreciate more drilled-down information in the CCRI data.

Would appreciate more opportunities for students to present to the Board.

Comments were made about the negative aspects of the A-F Accountability Mode. Suggestion made for a system that acknowledges what schools have without taking away what they have accomplished. Weights could be helpful for moving from minimally proficient to proficient. With the current model, not all schools can get an A. Data should be counted towards growth and it needs to be transparent for parents. Suggestion made for a Special Education indicator that will demonstrate which schools are good for this population. EL should also have an indicator and ranking for transparency. The ADE Report Cards need to be more robust and include this information and the reports for IDEA And FAPE. Bonus points for SPED enrollment are not advisable since it is not tied to an outcome.

Comments were made about which data proves improvement in student outcomes. Comments about whether the Accountability system reflects the whole student and incorporates everything at the school. Discussion regarding whether the SBE can encourage and celebrate school's improvements. A more positive relationship is needed with the public by fostering a culture of achievement. The public and communities cannot celebrate achievements if they cannot understand the data.

### **Strategic Plan**

Sean Ross, Executive Director for the State Board of Education, presented to the Board. The various Board priorities, associated goals, and potential levers were identified. The first priority is Postsecondary Access, Matriculation, and Persistence. The goal is to increase postsecondary access, matriculation, and persistence for all students, especially students from vulnerable populations. The potential levers include the A-F Accountability system, legislative action, data analysis, spotlighting, and convening. The second priority is Early Literacy. The goal is for all students reading at or above grade-level by the end of third grade. The potential levers are A-F Accountability system, rulemaking, educator preparation approval, legislative actions, and advocacy. The third priority is Special Education. The goal is to increase opportunities and educational outcomes for special education students. The potential levers are rulemaking, A-F Accountability system, and legislative actions. The fourth priority is Teacher Recruitment and Retention. The goal is to recruit and retain effective educators so that all students have access to a high-quality educational environment. The potential levers include data analysis, educator preparation programs, and guidance. The previous year's legislative agenda was shared. The proposed details for a future agenda were identified. The purpose of the Board's Research plan was identified. The proposed topics include Special Education, Teacher Recruitment and Retention, Early Literacy, Postsecondary Access, Matriculation, and Persistence.

Comments were made about how the Board is the bridge to the Governor's Office. Clarification sought on what next steps the Board wishes to undertake. Comments were made about concerns regarding recruitment and retention. In part, educators are burnt out due to being required to wear multiple hats: lunch-duty, bus-driver, detention, etc. Comments were made about tackling teacher standards since it is time for some innovative out-of-the-box updates. Comments were made about hearing from teachers and school HR Departments to gain from insight from the field about what support is needed. Student teaching process needs to be updated so prospective teachers don't have to pay to learn/work to gain teaching experience. This relates directly to how some teachers are hired in a school district that is completely different from the demographic. Paraprofessionals, cafeteria staff, and other classified workers deserve better wages. Graduation requirements are important as well. Students need support in classes that make them struggle. Comments were made about the constant criticism the Board receives regarding issues that the Board is not statutorily responsible for. Comments were made about having "TED" come to talk. Discussion transpired about the FAFSA being a gatekeeper for schools and how the Board could spotlight the FAFSA. Two other topics of discussion include early literature and postsecondary as it relates to dual enrollment.

Comments regarding CTE Advocacy and Legislation were made. Doubtful that legislation understands



CTE since there is a disconnect between email communication and dispensing information to the community. Comments were made about a lunch and learn session. Questions were made about how to leverage this information. It was stated that e-cap issues/funding are also concerning. Schools have communicated that the e-cap is checked, it is a 4-year deal, and every student should look at this twice. Comments were made that this is a funding issue and needs to stay on everyone's radar. Another topic of interest is SPED. Quite a bit of work was accomplished with the ad-hoc committee. The educator preparation approval is preferred since it allows schools to see what others are doing. The next topic of interest is Teacher Recruitment and Retention. Comments regarding Teacher Recruitment and Retention were made. A suggestion was made to invite Joe to speak about high school graduation rates and share the best practices utilized by the high school with the strongest graduation rate. This is not something the Board has traditionally done. Comments were made that the success of Nogales was shared within their network. It was pointed out that the level in the Prep Approval is unique to the Board. Discussion regarding an article about teacher burnout. Topics from the previous group were shared and the current group. Board Members were in agreement about changes regarding student teaching. A request was made to be provided with a list of education legislation outcomes.

Comments regarding Teacher Recruitment and Retention were made. The Board receives an annual report of compiled information. Clarification was sought about what the metric goal is supposed to be. The annual report will have this information and there can't be a metric without the basics. Clarification was sought on the Board's role and how to make changes without lowering standards. Comments were made about how some schools are hiring from other countries. Need to find a way to institute change without creating more barriers. Comments regarding Early Literature and Special Education were made. Progress is being tracked via the existing adhoc groups. Comments regarding Postsecondary Matriculation were made. The highlights encompass what has already been completed by the Board. To complete more work on this topic, the Board can partner with someone like HELIOS to identify best practices from schools that have high graduation rates, FAFSA completion, etc. This topic is important for educator preparation and to build long-term relationships. ASU could be a good partner as well. There can be a disconnect between theory and practice. More people need to be invited to present to the Board. This information needs to be combined and taken back to the educator preparation programs.

## **7. Summary of the Board's Retreat, next steps and future agenda items**

President Dr. Corr made comments of thanks to everyone.

*Member Dr. Clay left the Board Meeting at 11:46am.*

Executive Director Ross made comments about agenda item 6.

*Member Dr. Clay returned to the Board Meeting at 11:47am.*

Executive Director Ross made comments about agenda item 6 and the next Board Meeting.

*Board Meeting adjourned at 12:48pm.*