



March 24, 2025 Regular Board Meeting

03/24/2025 - 09:00 AM

1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower

3rd Floor Boardroom

Phoenix, AZ 85007

MEETING MINUTES

Arizona State Board of Education

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education and to the general public that the Board will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, March 24, 2025 at 9:00 A.M.**

The **Monday, March 24, 2025** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. This means that the public has the opportunity to participate in-person or virtually.

Please note the location of the **Monday, March 24, 2025** State Board of Education meeting: 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, 3rd Floor Boardroom, Phoenix, AZ 85007. The public will have physical access to the meeting location 30 minutes before the Board meeting, at 8:30 A.M.

A copy of the meeting agenda is attached. The Board reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Board may participate telephonically or virtually.

Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Board may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A) (2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A) (3), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The **Monday, March 24, 2025** State Board of Education meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. Please see below on how to access the meeting and provide public comment on agenda items, regardless of the chosen access method.

Accessing the State Board of Education Meeting Virtually

To watch the State Board meeting online:

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)
- Visit azsbe.az.gov
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click “ok”
- When the meeting starts, you will see a “live” video. If you do not see this, and the meeting’s start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A>

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board’s office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

Procedure for Submitting a Public Comment (Please read through each option carefully):

Advance registration is required to provide verbal public comment. **The deadline to submit a written comment and/or to register for a verbal public comment is Thursday, March 20, 2025 at 12:00pm.** Individuals that attempt to register or submit a written comment after the deadline will not be provided the opportunity to give public comment at the meeting.

By registering, you are submitting a request to speak form and Board staff will call on you to speak during the appropriate public comment agenda item. The name in which you register **MUST** match the name on the account when signing into the meeting to speak virtually.

Please review the Board's agenda to determine at which public comment agenda item (#2, #4, #6, or #8) you will be called.

All Board policies in regard to public comment at meetings apply to in-person and virtual public comments. Public comments are limited to three minutes unless the time limit is adjusted by the Board President at the start of the meeting.

Virtual Public Comment:

Please use this link to register for a **Virtual** public comment: https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_rbUDzg1OQ2uRKCuDm-1FAg

In-Person Public Comment:

Please use this link to register for an **In-Person** public comment: <https://forms.gle/dQZWj1RZpMEvSmSX8>

Written Comment:

Written comments for the meeting will be accepted by:

- email inbox@azsbe.az.gov
- fax to (602) 542-3046
- USPS to 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, Suite 300, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Written comments will not be read into the record, however, staff will post all written comments received by the deadline on the Board's agenda by **Friday, March 21, 2025 at 5:00 PM.**

If you need assistance with registering or do not have internet access to register for a virtual comment, please contact the Board's office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

DATED AND POSTED this 14th day of March, 2025.

Arizona State Board of Education

By: 

Sean Ross

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

9:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Attendees

Katherine Haley, President

Dr. Scott Hagerman, Vice President

Tom Horne, Superintendent (*left at 3:15pm*)

Dr. Jacqui Clay, Board Member (*left at 10:25am, returned at 10:26am, left at 12:45pm, returned at*

12:45pm, returned at 1:11pm)

Dr. Daniel Corr, Board Member (left at 2:28pm, returned at 2:29pm)

Dr. Lupita Hightower, Board Member

Dr. Kathy Wiebke, Board Member

Karla Phillips-Krivickas, Board Member (arrived at 9:06am, returned at 11:13am)

Julia Meyerson, Board Member - Virtual

Jason Catanese, Board Member (arrived at 9:24am)

1. BUSINESS REPORTS

Board Meeting Called to Order at 9:03am.

A. President's Report

President Haley presented the Superintendent's report to the Board and welcomed Member Hightower and Member Wiebke.

Member Phillips-Krivickas joined the Board Meeting at 9:06am.

Superintendent Horne welcomed the new Board Members.

B. Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Horne presented the Superintendent's report to the Board.

1. Milken Educator Award for Arizona - Jeff Martin

Superintendent Horne presented the Milken Educator Award to Jeff Martin.

C. Executive Director's Report

1. State Board Students of the Month for March 2025

Executive Director Ross presented the Student of the Month.

The nominated student, Roopesh Nagarajan, made comments to the Board.

Member Catanese joined the Board Meeting at 9:24am.

Executive Director Ross presented the Student of the Month.

The nominated student, Saturino Felix Pajkos, made comments to the Board.

2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Raymond Thiry, representing Arizona State University, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Justin Price, representing Elfrida Elementary School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Superintendent Dr. Roman Soltero, representing Ajo School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

Member Clay recused herself from Agenda item 3H.

A motion was made to approve items 3A through 3H.

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Dr. Lupita Hightower

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Recuse

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Lupita Hightower - Yes

Dr. Kathy Wiebke - Yes

A. Approval of the University of Arizona School Psychology EdS educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in School Psychology, Grades PreK-12

B. Approval of the Northern Arizona University Dual Early Childhood Education and Early Childhood Special Education (BSEd) educator preparation program leading to Arizona certification in Early Childhood Education, Birth – Age 8 or Grade 3, and Special Education - Early Childhood, Birth through Grade 3

C. Approval to award \$6,825,000 from the Arizona Charter Schools program (AZCSP) to nine charter schools over three years (FY 2025 – FY 2028).

D. Approval of the St. Johns Unified School District Principal Preparation Program, Site-Based Prep Program leading to Arizona certification in Administration: Principal, Grades PreK-12

E. Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) LEA and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base Support Funds

F. Approval for the attached Small School Districts to receive the indicated 2025 state aid and budget capacity due to the Capital Transportation Adjustment for Small School Districts pursuant to A.R.S. §15-963

G. Consideration to determine noncompliance with the Uniform System of Financial Records

by Ajo Unified School District and to withhold state funds pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-272

H. Consideration to determine noncompliance with the Uniform System of Financial Records by Elfrida Elementary School District and to withhold state funds pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-272

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Carmen Blackmore, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Stacey Brown, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Joshua Steimle, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jeanette Aldana Perry, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Erin Charles, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Angela Faber, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lexi Faber, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jennifer Nicholas, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lynn Fox-Embrey, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Rosemary McAtee, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Savannah Rogers, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Shawna Wolf, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and yielded her time to Stacey Brown.

Grayson Taylor, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Mary Taylor, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kevin Biesty, representing the Arizona Christian Education Coalition, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Julie Batt, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Angela Fraser, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Harmony lerley, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kelly Kenney, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Chris Lindahl, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Amanda Pappas, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Member Dr. Clay left the Board Meeting at 10:25am.

Roberta Patterson, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Member Dr. Clay returned to the Board Meeting at 10:26am.

Kathryn Villapudua, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Heidi Will, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Melissa Atwood, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Brandy Blackford, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Simone Bell, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lisa Collins, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Nichole Harpel, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and

addressed the Board.

Celinda Toone, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Corissa Valles, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Aimee Wheeler, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Nayely Cid, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Velia Aguirre, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kathy Visser, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Dianne Weaver, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Jennifer Parent, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Ivan Nogalo, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Rosie Wear, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Mark Collins, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Nina Conrad, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Alexandria Paduch, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Amanda Rich, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

The Board Meeting took a break at 10:57am.

The Board Meeting resumed at 11:10am.

Member Phillips-Krivickas returned to the Board Meeting at 11:13am.

5. GENERAL SESSION

A. Presentation and discussion of the Cochise County School Safety Consortium's school safety system

Member Dr. Clay made comments about the agenda item.

Cynthia Meyers, Outreach Manager for Cochise County Superintendent of Schools Office, presented to the Board.

Mark Dannels, Sheriff for Cochise County, presented to the Board.

Member Dr. Hightower made comments about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Wiebke made comments about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments about the agenda item.

B. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the A-F Accountability System for the 2024-2025 school year

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

Sean Smith, Chief Accountability Officer for ADE, presented to the Board.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

Sean Smith continued to present to the Board.

President Haley sought clarification and made comments about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Sean Smith provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas sought clarification and made comments about the agenda item.

Sean Smith provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Corr sought clarification about the agenda item.

Sean Smith provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Corr made comments about the agenda item.

Member Catanese made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Sean Smith provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Catanese made comments about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Hightower made comments about the agenda item.

Member Meyerson made comments about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

A motion was made to approve the statewide 2024-2025 A-F Accountability Models and Business Rules for Traditional K-8 and 9-12 schools; Non-Typical (Hybrid) Configuration; 9-12 Alternative schools; and AOI schools as outlined in the supporting documents, the omnibus business rules document for 2024-2025 as presented in the supporting documents, and the College and Career Readiness Index spreadsheets for the 2024-2025 school year as presented in the supporting documents.

Motion passed: 10-1.

Motion made by: Dr. Lupita Hightower

Motion seconded by: Dr. Scott Hagerman

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - No

Dr. Lupita Hightower - Yes

Dr. Kathy Wiebke - Yes

C. Presentation, discussion, and possible action to approve the Empowerment Scholarship Account (ESA) Handbook for school year 2025-2026 pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03 (A) (3)

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

John Ward, Executive Director of the ESA program for ADE, presented to the Board.

Janelle Wood, ESA Parent Handbook Committee Facilitator for ADE, presented to the Board.

Member Dr. Corr made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Corr made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.

President Haley made comments about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.

Janelle Wood made comments about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.
Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.
John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.
President Haley provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Clay made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.
John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.
Member Dr. Clay made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.
John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Hightower made comments about the agenda item.

Member Catanese made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.
Janelle Wood provided clarification about the agenda item.
John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.
Member Catanese made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.
Janelle Wood made comments about the agenda item.
John Ward made comments about the agenda item.
Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.
John Ward provided clarification about the agenda item.

A motion was made to adopt the March 19th Final Amended ESA Handbook FY26 for the 2025-2026 school year.

Motion failed for lack of a second.

Motion made by: Tom Horne
Motion seconded by: N/A

Motion Catanese sought clarification about the agenda item.
President Haley provided clarification about this agenda item.

D. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs: The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals

Federico Yanez, Project Director of Policy for the State Board of Education, presented to the Board.

*Member Dr. Clay left the Board Meeting at 12:45pm.
Member Dr. Clay returned to the Board Meeting at 12:45pm.*

Federico Yanez continued to present to the Board.

Superintendent Horne made comments about the agenda item.
Federico Yanez continued to present to the Board.

Member Dr. Corr sought clarification about the agenda item.
Federico Yanez provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Dr. Hightower made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.
Federico Yanez provided clarification about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments and sought clarification about the agenda item.
Federico Yanez provided clarification about the agenda item.
Executive Director Ross provided clarification and made comments about the agenda item.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments about the agenda item.
Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda item.

*The Board Members took a break at 12:57pm.
The Board Meeting resumed at 1:09pm.*

6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

None.

7. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

Member Dr. Clay returned to the Board Meeting at 1:11pm.

A motion was made to approve items 7A1 through 7A7, 7B1 and 7B2, 7C1 and 7C2, 7D1 and 7D2.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Scott Hagerman

Motion seconded by: Dr. Kathy Wiebke

Voting:

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Katherine Haley - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Dr. Lupita Hightower - Yes

Dr. Kathy Wiebke - Yes

A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates or right to work in an

Arizona District or Charter School for the following individuals:

1. Roberto Alvarez-Ordonez, Case no. C-2024-916502
 - a. Roberto Alvarez-Ordonez, Case no. C-2024-916502 - Supporting Documents
2. Christopher Balliet, Case no. C-2024-906646
 - a. Christopher Balliet, Case no. C-2024-906646 - Supporting Documents
3. Cynthia Chattin, Case no. C-2024-904194
 - a. Cynthia Chattin, Case no. C-2024-904194 - Supporting Documents
4. Mariza Juarez, Case no. C-2023-000309
 - a. Mariza Juarez, Case no. C-2023-000309 - Supporting Documents
5. Toulouse Lebron, Case no. C-2024-000117
 - a. Toulouse Lebron, Case no. C-2024-000117 - Supporting Documents
6. Milton Means, Case no. C-2024-000393
 - a. Milton Means, Case no. C-2024-000393 - Supporting Documents
7. Stark, Richard, Case no. C-2023-002207
 - a. Richard Stark, Case no. C-2023-002207 - Supporting Documents

B. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550(A) or permanently revoke the right to work in an Arizona District or Charter School, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550(C) for the following individuals:

1. Jessica Marie Kramer, Case No. 2023-002198
 - a. Jessica Marie Kramer, Case No. 2023-002198 - Supporting Documents
2. Joshua Kroeker, Case No. 2024-905873
 - a. Joshua Kroeker, Case No. 2024-905873 - Supporting Documents

C. Approval of the revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-534.04(C), for the following individuals:

1. Scott Mosman, Case no. C-2024-909733

a. Scott Mosman, Case no. C-2024-909733 - Supporting Documents

2. Lizette Wancho-Saucedo, Case no. C-2024-000949

a. Lizette Wancho-Saucedo, Case no. C-2024-000949 - Supporting Documents

D. Approval of summary suspension of any and all certificates, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1309(A), for the following individuals:

1. Jason Kenneth Imhoff, Case no. C-2024-906642

a. Jason Kenneth Imhoff, Case no. C-2024-906642 - Supporting Documents

2. Diana M. Pirvu, Case no. C-2023-002461

a. Diana M. Pirvu, Case no. C-2023-002461- Supporting Documents

8. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Patrick Mannion, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Edmondo Rabina, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Michelle Swartz, representing CUSD, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jody Jordan, representing CUSD80, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Tony Alcala, representing Chandler School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Sara Stark, representing Stark Law, P.C., submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Charisia Arnold, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kathleen Brantingham, representing Udall Shumway PLC, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lesley Cain, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Shannon Carnahan, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Camille Casteel, representing herself submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Tessa Chadwick, representing Casteel High School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Christy Cunico, representing Chandler Unified, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Payton Cunico, representing Casteel High School, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Julie Davis, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

David Ellingson, representing Future City Arizona, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Eli Enger, representing Udall Shumway PLC, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Frank Fletcher, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Francine Frank, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Craig Gilbert, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

John Giles, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jennifer Hewitt, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Terry Locke, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Katey McPherson, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Frank Narducci, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Amy Oneal, representing Chandler Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jayson Phillips, representing CUSD, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Jenna Shear, representing Chandler Unified, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Lindsey Valentine, representing CUSD, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Bridget Vega, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Denise Lowell-Britt, representing Udall Shumway, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Braelyn Woodworth, representing Chandler Schools, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Shelamae Woodworth, representing Chandler Schools, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Kayla Shosho, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Christine Ellis, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

David Lockhart, representing himself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Member Dr. Corr left the Board Meeting at 2:28pm.

Member Dr. Corr returned to the Board Meeting at 2:29pm.

Kacey Stahl, representing herself, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Bill Richards, representing the State, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.

Katie Nash, representing the Arizona Education Association, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

Edmundo Robaina, representing Yen Pilch Robaina & Kresin PLC, submitted a Call to the Public

Request to Speak Form, but did not address the Board.

9. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS

Member Dr. Corr sought clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16. Bill Richards provided clarification about the agenda items.

Member Dr. Corr sought clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16. Bill Richards provided clarification about the agenda items.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Eli Enger, representing Udall Shumway PLC, provided clarification about the agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Kathleen Brantingham, representing Udall Shumway PLC, provided clarification about the agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Eli Enger, representing Udall Shumway PLC, made comments about the agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Dr. Clay sought clarification and made comments about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Eli Enger sought clarifications about what was asked.

Dr. Clay provided clarifications and made comments about what was being requested.

Eli Enger provided clarifications about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Dr. Clay made comments and sought clarifications about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the question posed.

Bill Richards provided clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

A motion was made to move the Board into Executive Session.

Motion passed: 10-0.

Motion made by: Jason Catanese

Motion seconded by: Dr. Jacqui Clay

Voting:

Katherine Haley - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Tom Horne - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Dr. Lupita Hightower - Yes

Dr. Kathy Wiebke - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes

The Board moved into Executive Session at 2:55pm.

*Superintendent Horne left the Executive Session at 3:12pm.
Superintendent Horne left the Board Meeting at 3:15pm.*

The Board returned from Executive Session at 3:41pm.

Executive Director Ross took attendance. The Board has a quorum.

A motion was made to pull agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Scott Hagerman

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Katherine Haley - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Tom Horne - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Dr. Lupita Hightower - Yes
Dr. Kathy Wiebke - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes

A motion was made to approve items 9A1 through 9A4, 9B1 through 9B3, 9B5, 9B7 through 9B10, 9B12, 9B14, 9B15 and 9C.

Motion passed: 9-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Dr. Jacqui Clay

Voting:

Katherine Haley - Yes
Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes
Tom Horne - Not Present
Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes
Dr. Lupita Hightower - Yes
Dr. Kathy Wiebke - Yes
Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes
Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes
Julia Meyerson - Yes
Jason Catanese - Yes

Executive Director Ross sought clarification about the agenda items in the motion.
President Haley provided clarification about the agenda items in the motion.

Dr. Corr made comments about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Executive Director Ross made comments about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.
Member Dr. Hightower made comments about recusing herself from agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the recusal within the context of agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Dr. Clay made comments about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Member Meyerson made comments and sought clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Member Dr. Wiebke made comments about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Member Phillips-Krivickas made comments and sought clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Member Catanese made comments and sought clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Member Dr. Wiebke sought clarification about agenda 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.
Executive Director Ross provided clarification about agenda 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Member Meyerson sought clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.
President Haley provided clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.
Executive Director Ross provided clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Member Dr. Corr sought clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.
President Haley provided clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.
Executive Director Ross provided clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

Member Catanese sought clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.
Executive Director Ross provided clarification about agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, 9B13, and 9B16.

A motion was made for the State Board of Education to reject the findings of fact and

conclusions of law and the recommendations of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee (PPAC) for agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, and 9B13 and recommend sending agenda items 9B4, 9B6, 9B11, and 9B13 back to the PPAC for individual hearings.

Motion passed: 8-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Dr. Kathy Wiebke

Voting:

Katherine Haley - Yes

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Tom Horne - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Dr. Lupita Hightower - Recused

Dr. Kathy Wiebke - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - Yes

Julia Meyerson - Yes

Jason Catanese - Yes

A motion was made for the State Board of Education to reject the findings of fact and conclusions of law and the recommendations of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee (PPAC) for agenda item 9B16.

Motion Passed: 5-3.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Dr. Kathy Wiebke

Voting:

Katherine Haley - No

Dr. Scott Hagerman - Yes

Tom Horne - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Dr. Lupita Hightower - Recused

Dr. Kathy Wiebke - Yes

Dr. Jacqui Clay - Yes

Karla Phillips-Krivickas - No

Julia Meyerson - No

Jason Catanese - Yes

Member Meyerson explained her vote.

Executive Director Ross made comments about the voting result.

President Haley sought clarification about the voting result.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about the voting result.

President Haley sought clarification about the voting result.

Executive Director Ross provided clarification about the voting result.

Executive Director Ross made comments to clarify the voting result.

Victoria Bergin, Assistant Attorney General to the Board, made comments to clarify the voting result.

Executive Director Ross made comments to clarify the voting result.

A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for the following individuals:

1. Richard Jones, Case no. C-2024-000153

a. Richard Jones, Case no. C-2024-000153- Supporting Documents

2. Elisa Maldonado, Case no. C-2024-001081

a. Elisa Maldonado, Case no. C-2024-001081 - Supporting Documents

3. Angela Marin, Case no. C-2023-002845

a. Angela Marin, Case no. C-2023-002845 - Supporting Documents

4. Yedid Musni, Case no. C-2022-001506

a. Yedid Musni, Case no. C-2022-001506 - Supporting Documents

B. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendations of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee for the following individuals:

1. Manal Aljoborri Martinez, Case no. C-2022-000447

a. Manal Aljoborri Martinez, Case no. C-2022-000447 - Supporting Documents

2. David R. Canales, Case no. C-2024-904816

a. David R. Canales, Case no. C-2024-904816 - Supporting Documents

3. Christine Colburn-Bulinski, Case no. C-2022-003599

a. Christine Colburn-Bulinski, Case no. C-2022-003599 - Supporting Documents

4. Jeff Filloon, Case no. C-2022-00345

a. Jeff Filloon, Case no. C-2022-00345 - Supporting Documents

5. Angela M Foley, Case no. C-2022-003214
 - a. Angela M Foley, Case no. C-2022-003214 - Supporting Documents
6. Craig Gilbert, Case no. C-2022-003467
 - a. Craig Gilbert, Case no. C-2022-003467 - Supporting Documents
7. Charles Henderson III, Case no. C-2024-000569
 - a. Charles Henderson III, Case no. C-2024-000569 - Supporting Documents
8. Benjamin M Hewitt, Case no. C-2024-002216
 - a. Benjamin M Hewitt, Case no. C-2024-002216 - Supporting Documents
9. Brock G Higley, Case no. C-2024-000704
 - a. Brock G Higley, Case no. C-2024-000704 - Supporting Documents
10. Andrew C Phelan III, Case no. C-2023-002408
 - a. Andrew C Phelan III, Case no. C-2023-002408 - Supporting Documents
11. Jayson Phillips, Case no. C-2022-003464
 - a. Jayson Phillips, Case no. C-2022-003464 - Supporting Documents
12. Lisa Reid, Case no. C-2024-001861
 - a. Lisa Reid, Case no. C-2024-001861 - Supporting Documents
13. Ryan Ridenour, Case no. C-2022-003470
 - a. Ryan Ridenour, Case no. C-2022-003470 - Supporting Documents
14. Tracey A. Stewart, Case no. C-2023-002840
 - a. Tracey A. Stewart, Case no. C-2023-002840 - Supporting Documents
15. Leigh Ann Thomas, Case no. C-2024-000716
 - a. Leigh Ann Thomas, Case no. C-2024-000716 - Supporting Documents
16. Shelamae Woodworth, Case no. C-2022-003462

a. Shelamae Woodworth, Case no. C-2022-003462- Supporting Documents

C. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Request for a hearing, pursuant to A.A.C. R7-2-1307 (C) and A.A.C. R7-2-706 for Ramon Ramirez, Case no. C-2024-000836 and 2025-010710

1. Ramon Ramirez, Case no. C-2024-000836 and C-2025-010710 - Supporting Documents

10. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Executive Director Ross made comments about the next Board Meeting.

Board Meeting adjourned at 4:09pm.