



MEETING MINUTES

Arizona State Board of Education A-F Appeals Committee

Agenda

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education, the A-F Appeals Committee and to the general public that the A-F Appeals Committee will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, December 9, 2019 at 10:00 A.M. and Tuesday, December 10, 2019 at 9:00 A.M. and Wednesday, December 11, 2019 at 9:00 A.M.** at the State Board of Education, 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower Suite #300, Phoenix, AZ 85007. A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Committee will not meet on Wednesday, December 11, 2019, if all agenda items are heard on Monday, December 9, 2019 and Tuesday, December 10, 2019. The Committee reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Committee may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Committee may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 4th of December, 2019.

Arizona State Board of Education

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alicia Williams", written over a horizontal line.

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

Roll Call

1. Presentation and discussion regarding the duties and responsibilities of the Committee, including the A-F Appeals Process

Day 1: Monday, December 9, 2019

The meeting was called to order at 10:02 A.M.

Attendance

Member Christine Burton

Member Michele Kaye

Member Jill Broussard

Deputy Director Catcher Baden, State Board of Education, provided a background on the appeals process and introduced the schedule of agenda items for the Committee.

2. Presentation and discussion to consider the appeals of schools that filed an expedited appeal

The Committee pulled items from agenda item 3 on this agenda prior to discussion of this item. That discussion is in the minutes for that item.

The Committee circled back to discussion for agenda item 2 on this item after the break at 11:05 A.M. Deputy Director Baden made comments about agenda item 2A4 P.T. Coe Elementary on updating the staff recommendation to approve the appeal to a "D" rather than the "C" letter grade.

Deputy Director Baden made comments about agenda 2G11 Tortolita Middle School on updating the process for the appeal to non-expedited from expedited. The school will present on December 10, 2019.

Deputy Director Baden asked the Committee which items they would like to pull from the agenda for discussion.

Member Broussard requested to pull agenda item 2E3 San Tan Foothills High School.

Member Burton requested to pull agenda item 2C6 Skyline High School.

Member Kaye requested to pull agenda item 2A1 Toltec Elementary School and 2C5 Ashland Ranch Elementary School.

Member Broussard requested to pull agenda item 2D1 Antelope Union High School.

San Tan Foothills High School:

Member Broussard made comments about the item.

Toltec Elementary School:

The Committee discussed the item.

P.T. Coe Elementary:

The Committee discussed the item.

Ashland Ranch Elementary School:

The Committee discussed the item.

Skyline High School:
The Committee discussed the item.

Antelope Union High School:
The Committee discussed the item.

San Tan Foothills High School:
Member Broussard made comments about the item.

The Committee took a break from 11:47 A.M. to 1:01 P.M. Upon return from the break, the Committee discussed agenda item 3. That discussion is in the minutes for that item.

A. Tragedy

- 1. Toltec Elementary School**
- 2. Laguna Elementary School**
- 3. Carminati Elementary School**
- 4. UPDATED - P.T. Coe Elementary**

B. Staffing

- 1. Marionneaux Elementary School**

C. Adverse Testing Conditions

- 1. Willcox Elementary School**
- 2. Desert Star Community School**
- 3. Willcox Middle School**
- 4. Kirkland School**
- 5. Ashland Ranch Elementary School**
- 6. Skyline High School**
- 7. Desert Star Academy**
- 8. Wellton Elementary School**

D. Other

- 1. Antelope Union High School**

2. Sunrise Elementary School
3. Bullhead City Middle School
4. Fox Creek Junior High
5. Globe High School

E. Incorrect Data

1. Paulden Community School
2. Monument Valley High School
3. San Tan Foothills High School
4. Children Reaching for the Sky Elementary School
5. Pomerene Elementary
6. Mingus Union High School
7. Metro Tech High School
8. Topock Elementary School
9. Red Mesa High School
10. San Simon

F. Alternative School Self-Reporting

1. E-Institute - Surprise (Acoma)
2. Nosotros Academy
3. Insight Academy of Arizona
4. Robert L Duffy High School (aka Glendale)
5. Cornerstone Charter School
6. Educational Opportunity Center HS
7. Compass High School
8. E-Institute at Taylion
9. RSD High School

G. 3D's

1. Gililand Middle School
2. Desert Sands Middle School
3. Sanders Middle School
4. Alta E. Butler
5. Pinon Elementary School
6. Buckeye Elementary School
7. Catalina High School
8. Grijalva Elementary School
9. Dietz K-8
10. Pistor Middle School
11. UPDATED - Tortolita Middle School
12. Magee Middle School
13. Booth-Fickett Magnet K-8

3. Presentation and discussion to consider the appeals of schools that filed a non-expedited appeal

Day 1: Monday, December 9, 2019

The meeting was called to order at 10:02 A.M.

Attendance

Member Christine Burton

Member Michele Kaye

Member Jill Broussard

Deputy Director Baden asked the Committee which items they would like to pull from the agenda for discussion.

Member Kaye requested to pull items 3C9 San Carlos Middle School, 3C10 Rice Elementary School, 3E1 South Verde High School, 3E2 Accelerated Learning Academy, 3C6 Linda Abril Educational Academy, and 3C7 Bostrom Alternative Center for Education.

Member Burton requested to pull item 3F7 ASU Preparatory Academy South Phoenix High School.

San Carlos Middle School and Rice Elementary School:

Donna Manuelito, Assistant Superintendent for San Carlos Unified School District, presented information to the Committee.

Wendy Davy, Chief Accountability Officer for Arizona Department of Education, Accountability and Research, presented information to the Committee.

Phoenix Union High School District - Linda Abril Educational Academy and Bostrom Alternative Center for Education:

Dr. Schavon Waggoner, Director of Professional Development, Accountability and Assessment for Phoenix Union High School District, presented information to the Committee.

ASU Preparatory Academy South Phoenix High School:

Jeni McClue, Academic Coach, Student Data Analyst, and District Test Coordinator, for ASU Preparatory Academies, presented information to the Committee.

South Verde High School:

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Committee. The Committee discussed the appeal.

Accelerated Learning Academy:

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Committee.

The Committee took a break from 10:53 A.M. to 11:05 A.M. Upon return from the break, the Committee discussed agenda item 2. That discussion is in the minutes for that item.

The Committee took a break from 11:47 A.M. to 1:01 P.M. Upon return from the break, the Committee discussed agenda item 3. The Committee will hear non-expedited presentations from schools.

San Carlos High School:

Donna Manuelito, Assistant Superintendent for San Carlos Unified School District, presented information to the Committee.

Wendy Davy, Chief Accountability Officer for Arizona Department of Education, Accountability and Research, presented information to the Committee.

Rhodes Junior High:

Patricia Christie, Principal of Rhodes Junior High School, Mesa Public Schools, presented information to the Committee.

Eliseo C Felix:

Dr. Betsy Hargrove, Superintendent of Avondale Elementary School District, presented information to the Committee.

Salt River High School:

Emily Niu, Principal of Salt River High School, presented information to the Committee.

Dr. Melody Herne, Data for Salt River Schools, presented information to the Committee.

Cynthia Clary, Acting Superintendent for Salt River Schools, presented information to the Committee.

NFL YET College Prep Academy and Aim Higher College Prep Academy:

Christina Eliserio, Chief Operating Officer for Espiritu Schools Network, presented information to the Committee.

Rosalva Lopez, School Leader for NFL YET College Prep Academy and Aim Higher College Prep Academy, presented information to the Committee.

Michael Anderson School:

Dr. Betsy Hargrove, Superintendent of Avondale Elementary School District, presented information to the Committee.

Discovery School:

David Jordan, Director of Research and Evaluation for the Glendale Elementary School District,

presented information to the Committee.

Meeting adjourned at 3:11 P.M. to reconvene at 9:00 A.M. on December 10, 2019.

Day 2: Tuesday, December 10, 2019

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 A.M.

Attendance

Member Christine Burton

Member Michele Kaye

Member Jill Broussard

Deputy Director Catcher Baden, State Board of Education, provided an introduction to the schedule of agenda items for the Committee.

George Gervin Prep Academy:

Barbara Hawkins, Superintendent of George Gervin Prep Academy, presented information to the Committee.

Tolleson Union High School:

Felipe Mandurraga, Principal of Tolleson Union High School, presented information to the Committee.

Nora Gutierrez, Superintendent of the Tolleson Union High School District, presented information to the Committee.

Dr. Michele Wilson, Assistant Superintendent of Curriculum and Instruction of the Tolleson Union High School District, presented information to the Committee.

Eric Kistler, Principal Software Engineer for the Tolleson Union High School District, presented information to the Committee.

Morristown Elementary School:

Greg Sackos, Superintendent of the Morristown Elementary School District, presented information to the Committee.

Millennium High School and Verrado High School, Agua Fria High School District:

Tom Huffman, Executive Director of Educational Services for the Agua Fria High School District, presented information to the Committee.

Sean Smith, Director of Data and Assessment for the Agua Fria High School District, presented information to the Committee.

Deputy Director Baden asked the Committee if they wished to hold any discussion on Amphitheater High School and Beaver Dam High School in the off chance they do not show up for the non-expedited presentation.

The Committee held discussion for Beaver Dam High School.

The Committee took a break from 10:34 A.M. to 10:59 A.M. Upon return from the break, the Committee continued agenda item 3.

Creighton School and Loma Linda School, Creighton Elementary School District:

Dr. Donna Lewis, Superintendent for Creighton Elementary School District, presented information to the Committee.

The Committee took a break from 11:25 A.M. to 12:44 P.M. Upon return from the break, the Committee continued agenda item 3.

TIA West:

Miguel Montemayor, Principal for TIA Broadway, presenting on behalf of Valerie Enriquez, Principal of TIA West, presented information to the Committee.

Copper Rim Elementary School:

Brian Peace, Principal of Copper Rim Elementary School, presented information to the Committee.

Baboquivari High School:

Tanya Suydam, Principal of Baboquivari High School, presented information to the Committee.

Stanfield Elementary School:

Adriana Garcia, Principal of Stanfield Elementary School, presented information to the Committee.

Tortolita Middle School:

Kristin Reidy, Assistant Superintendent of Educational Services, Marana Unified School District, presented information to the Committee.

The Committee took a break from 2:05 P.M. to 2:20 P.M. Upon return from the break, the Committee discussed recommendations for agenda items 2 and 3. That discussion is in the minutes for item agenda 4.

A. Tragedy

1. Kino Junior High School

2. Westwood Elementary School

3. Sierra 2-8 School

4. Ironwood Elementary School

5. La Cima Middle School

B. Staffing

1. Rhodes Junior High

2. Cooley Middle School

3. Smith Junior High

4. Eliseo C Felix

5. Desert Mirage Preparatory Academy DBA Discover U

C. Other

1. Sequoia Deaf School

2. Arizona Autism Charter School, Upper Campus
3. Salt River High School
4. Aim Higher College Prep Academy
5. NFL YET College Prep Academy
6. Ponderosa High School
7. Michael Anderson School
8. San Carlos High School
9. San Carlos Middle School
10. Rice Elementary School
11. Open Doors Community School
12. Creighton School
13. Loma Linda School
14. Discovery School

D. Incorrect Data

1. Mission Heights Preparatory High School
2. Winslow High School
3. George Gervin Prep Academy
4. Morristown Elementary School
5. Tolleson Union High School
6. Beaver Dam High School
7. Millennium High School
8. Verrado High School
9. Amphitheater High School

E. Alternative School Self-Reporting

1. South Verde High School
2. Accelerated Learning Academy
3. South Pointe High School
4. West Phoenix High School
5. The Learning Institute
6. Linda Abril Educational Academy
7. Bostrom Alternative Center for Education

F. 3D's

1. Castle Dome Middle School
2. Kino Junior High School
3. TIA West
4. Apollo Middle School
5. Copper Rim Elementary School
6. Challenger Middle School
7. ASU Preparatory Academy South Phoenix High School
8. High Desert Middle School
9. Baboquivari High School
10. UPDATED - Stanfield Elementary School

4. Presentation, discussion and possible action to recommend approval or denial of A-F letter grade appeals

The Committee began discussion of this agenda item on Day 2 at 2:20 P.M.

Day 2: Tuesday, December 10, 2019

Attendance

Member Christine Burton

Member Michele Kaye

Member Jill Broussard

Deputy Director Baden, State Board of Education, provided an introduction to the schedule of agenda items for the Committee.

Deputy Director Baden asked the Committee which items they would like to pull from the agenda for discussion.

Member Burton asked for clarification on the staff recommendations for San Carlos Unified School District.

Member Kaye provided information on the need to recuse herself from the vote on recommendation for 3B5 Desert Mirage Preparatory Academy DBA Discover U, 3D1 Mission Heights Preparatory High School, 3E3 South Pointe High School, and 3E4 West Phoenix High School.

Member Kaye requested to pull agenda items 3E2 Accelerated Learning Academy, 3E6 Linda Abril Educational Academy, and 3E7 Bostrom Alternative Center for Education.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendations and rationale for appeals 3A1-3A5, 3B2, 3C1, 3C2, 3C6, 3C9-3C11, 3D2, 3E1, 3E5, 3F4, and 3F6-3F8 to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Kaye

Second: Member Burton

Recommendations passed unanimously.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendations for appeals 3B5 Desert Mirage Preparatory Academy DBA Discover U, 3D1 Mission Heights Preparatory High School, 3E3 South Pointe High School, and 3E4 West Phoenix High School to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Burton

Recommendations passed unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda items 3E2 Accelerated Learning Academy, 3E6 Linda Abril Educational Academy, and 3E7 Bostrom Alternative Center for Education.

A motion was made to recommend approval for appeals 3E2 Accelerated Learning Academy, 3E6 Linda Abril Educational Academy, and 3E7 Bostrom Alternative Center for Education to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Kaye

Second: Member Broussard

Recommendations passed unanimously.

Deputy Director Baden asked the Committee which items they would like to pull from the agenda for discussion.

Member Kaye requested to pull agenda item 2A1 Toltec Elementary School and 2G11 Tortolita Middle School.

Member Broussard requested to pull agenda items 2C7 Desert Star Academy and 2F2 Nosotros Academy.

Member Burton sought clarification on the staff recommendation for 2A4 P.T. Coe Elementary.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendations and rationale for appeals 2A2-2A4, 2B1, 2C1-2C6, 2C8, 2D1-2D5, 2E1-2E10, 2F1, 2F3-2F9, 2G1-2G10, 2G12-2G13 to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Burton

Second: Member Broussard

Recommendations passed unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda items 2A1 Toltec Elementary School.

A motion was made to recommend the approval for appeal 2A1 Toltec Elementary School to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Burton

Recommendation passed 2-1.

The Committee held discussion on agenda items 2C7 Desert Star Academy.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendation and rationale for appeal for 2C7 Desert Star Academy to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Burton

Second: Member Broussard

Recommendation passed unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda items 2F2 Nosotros Academy.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendation and rationale, the approval to letter grade "B", for appeal 2F2 Nosotros Academy to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendation passed unanimously.

Deputy Director Baden asked the Committee which items they would like to pull from the agenda for discussion.

Member Burton requested to pull 2B1 Rhodes Junior High, 2B4 Eliseo C Felix, 3C4 Aim Higher College Prep Academy, 3C5 NFL YET College Prep Academy, and 3C7 Michael Anderson School.

Member Kaye requested to pull 3C8 San Carlos High School.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3C8 San Carlos High School.

A motion was made to recommend approval for letter grade "C" for appeal 3C8 San Carlos High School with the condition that in future years an appeal with similar grounds due to the entity ID number misunderstanding and changing of data may not be considered to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Kaye

Second: Member Broussard

Recommendation passed unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 2B1 Rhodes Junior High.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendation and rationale for appeal 2B1 Rhodes Junior High to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Kaye

Second: Member Burton

Recommendation passed 2-1.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 2B4 Eliseo C Felix.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendation and rationale for appeal 2B4 Eliseo C Felix to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendation passed 2-1.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3C4 Aim Higher College Prep Academy.

A motion was made to recommend approval for "NR" letter grade for appeal 3C4 Aim Higher College Prep Academy, with the condition that the school complete the merger on the schedule outlined in the appeal, and that if they do not for whatever reason, the Board won't consider that as grounds for an appeal in the future, to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Burton

Second: Member Broussard

Recommendation passed unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3C5 NFL YET College Prep Academy.
A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendation and rationale for appeal 3C5 NFL YET College Prep Academy to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendation passed unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3C7 Michael Anderson School.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendation and rationale for appeal 3C7 Michael Anderson School to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Kaye

Second: Member Broussard

Recommendation passed 2-1.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendations and rationale for appeals 3B3, 3C3, and 3C14 to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendations passed unanimously.

The Committee took a break from 3:39 P.M. to 3:44 P.M. Upon return from the break, the Committee discussed recommendations for agenda items 2 and 3.

Deputy Director Baden asked the Committee which items they would like to pull from the agenda for discussion.

Member Broussard requested to pull items 3D3, 3D5, 3C12, 3F3, and 3F5.

Member Kaye requested to pull item 3F9.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendations and rationale for appeals 3D6, 3D4, 3D7, 3D8, 3D9, 3C13, 3F1, and 3F10 to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendations passed unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3D3 George Gervin Prep Academy.

A motion was made to recommend approval to "NR" letter grade for appeal 3D3 George Gervin Prep Academy, with the condition of the school to work to remedy the issues and that if they do not for whatever reason, the Board won't consider that as grounds for an appeal in the future, to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendation unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3D5 Tolleson Union High School.

A motion was made to recommend approval to "B" letter grade for appeal 3D5 Tolleson Union High School, with the condition of the school to work to remedy the issues and that if they do not for whatever reason, the Board won't consider that as grounds for an appeal in the future, to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendation unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3C12 Creighton School.

A motion was made to recommend approval to "NR" letter grade for appeal 3C12 Creighton School to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendation unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3F3 TIA West.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendation and rationale for appeal 3F3 TIA West to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendation unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3F5 Copper Rim Elementary School.

A motion was made to recommend approval to retain the "D" letter grade for appeal 3F5 Copper Rim Elementary School to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Kaye

Second: Member Broussard

Recommendation unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 3F9 Baboquivari High School.

A motion was made to recommend approval to retain the "D" letter grade for appeal 3F9 Baboquivari High School, pending School Improvement's review that they have sufficient or more evidence of the steps completed in the Integrated Action Plan, to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Kaye

Recommendation unanimously.

The Committee elected to review the earlier motion for 2G4 Alta E. Butler following the motion for 3F5 Copper Rim Elementary School. That earlier motion was to recommend the staff recommendation of denial for the appeal for 2G4 Alta E. Butler.

A motion was made to amend the recommendation in order to recommend approval to retain the "D" letter grade for appeal 2G4 Alta E. Butler to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Broussard

Second: Member Burton

Recommendation passed unanimously.

The Committee held discussion on agenda item 2G11 Tortolita Middle School.

A motion was made to recommend the staff recommendation and rationale for appeal 2G11 Tortolita Middle School to the Board for consideration.

Motion: Member Kaye

Second: Member Burton

Recommendation passed unanimously.

The Committee made comments about the A-F system and how the Committee could consider appeals in the future.

Committee's recommendations to be forwarded for final action at the December 13th Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 4:51 P.M.