

MEETING MINUTES

Arizona State Board of Education
K-3 Early Literacy Ad Hoc Subcommittee

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education, the K-3 Early Literacy Ad Hoc Subcommittee and to the general public that the Subcommittee will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Wednesday, November 13, 2024, at 9:00 A.M.**

Please note the location of the **Wednesday, November 13, 2024, K-3 Early Literacy Ad Hoc Subcommittee** meeting: 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, 3rd Floor Boardroom, Phoenix, AZ 85007. The public will have physical access to the meeting location 30 minutes before the Board meeting, at 8:30 A.M.

A copy of the meeting agenda is attached. The subcommittee reserves the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the subcommittee may participate telephonically or virtually.

Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the subcommittee may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.

Persons with a disability may request reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter or narrator by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

The **Wednesday, November 13, 2024**, K-3 Early Literacy Ad Hoc Subcommittee meeting will be a hybrid-access meeting. This means the public has the opportunity to participate in-person or virtually. Please see below on how to access the meeting and provide public comment on agenda items.

Accessing the K-3 Early Literacy Ad Hoc Subcommittee Meeting Virtually

To watch the K-3 Early Literacy Ad Hoc Subcommittee meeting via computer or a smartphone with a data plan/Wi-Fi:

- Open a web browser on your device (Safari, Google Chrome, Internet Explorer, Firefox)

- Visit [azsbe.az.gov](https://www.azsbe.gov)
- Upper right hand of the page, click on the YouTube icon
- A pop-up may open, stating you are leaving the official website, click “ok”
- When the meeting starts, you will see a “live” video. If you do not see this, and the meeting’s start time has passed, you may need to hit the refresh button on your browser

Direct Link: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCsNwAaD9tyciKskyp0R2e5A/>

If you do not have internet access to watch the meeting, please contact the Board’s office at (602) 542-5057 and a staff member will assist you.

Procedure for Submitting a Public Comment (Please read through each option carefully):

Written Comment:

Written comments for the meeting will be accepted by:

- email inbox@azsbe.az.gov
- fax to (602) 542-3046
- USPS to 1700 W. Washington St., Executive Tower, Suite 300, Phoenix, Arizona 85007

The deadline to submit a written comment will be **Friday, November 8, 2024, at 12:00 PM.**

Written comments received after the deadline, including those that are mailed but not received by staff, will not be posted and will not be provided to members.

Written comments will not be read into the record; however, staff will post all written comments received by the deadline on the Subcommittee's agenda by **Monday, November 11, 2024, at 12:00 PM.**

DATED AND POSTED this 4th day of November 2024.

By:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Sean Ross". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Sean" and the last name "Ross" clearly distinguishable.

Sean Ross

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

1. Presentation and discussion of the new LitHub AZ resource for schools, educators, students, and families

Committee Meeting called to order at 9:05 am

Attendees:

Jessica Buttles, Subcommittee Member - Present
Dr. Angelina Canto, Subcommittee Member - Present
Chair Terri Clark, Subcommittee Member - Present
Dr. Felicia Durden, Subcommittee Member - Present (virtual)
Katherine Haley, Subcommittee Member - Present (virtual)
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson, Subcommittee Member - Present
Heather Overton, Subcommittee Member - Present
Janice Palmer, Subcommittee Member - Present (virtual)
Tianna Sanchez, Subcommittee Member - Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard, Subcommittee Member - Present
Rachel Vaughn, Subcommittee Member - Present (virtual), *joined at 9:11am*

Executive Director Ross took attendance. The Committee has a quorum.

Presentation and discussion the new LitHub AZ resource for schools, educators, students, and families

Chair Clark presented on this agenda item.

Subcommittee Members had discussion on this agenda item.

Member Rachel Vaughn joined the meeting at 9:11 am.

2. Presentation and discussion of data related to educator preparation programs and the Foundations of Reading Exam

Chair Clark introduced this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross presented on this agenda item.

Subcommittee Members, Executive Director Ross, and Co-Facilitator Clark had discussion and addressed questions throughout the presentation of this agenda item.

3. Presentation and discussion of the previously approved recommendations by the K-3 Subcommittee

Chair Clark introduced this agenda item.

Executive Director Ross made comments on this agenda item.

Subcommittee members had discussion on this agenda item.

4. Presentation, discussion, and possible action to approve the recommendations to be brought before the State Board related to early literacy and English language learners, early childhood, and family engagement, as well as recommendations related to chronic absenteeism and the necessary conditions for raising the Move On When Reading cut-score for promotion from third grade

Chair Clark introduced this agenda item.

D1. The Subcommittee recommends that ADE, in collaboration with other appropriate partners, develop and provide training, guidance, and resources related to ways that LEAs can efficiently meet the instructional reading requirements of both the Language Development Approach for ELLs and the requirements for MOWR. (ADE Guidance)

Motion made by: Vice Chair Meyerson

Motion seconded by: Member Canto

Members had discussion on this recommendation.

Motion passes: 10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes

Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

D2. The Subcommittee recommends that ADE, in collaboration with other appropriate partners, examine and refine the alignment between the expectations on the AZELLA exam and the ELA/ELP standards. (ADE Guidance)

- i. Example: The standards start with “With prompting and support...”, but AZELLA has kids perform without these elements.

Motion made by: Vice Chair Meyerson

Motion seconded by: Member Sheppard

Members had discussion on this recommendation.

Motion passes: 10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

D3. The Subcommittee recommends that ADE, in collaboration with other appropriate partners, produce/compile guidance and resources for LEAs on how to leverage grants, such as the 21st Century Grant, and funding to build meaningful relationships with community partners. (ADE Guidance)

Motion made by: Member Buttles

Motion seconded by: Member Overton

Motion passes: 10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes

Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

D4. AS AMENDED The Subcommittee recommends that ADE, in collaboration with other appropriate partners, produce guidance on how schools can use/braid funding to hire home liaisons to support family engagement and school attendance. (ADE Guidance)

Members had discussion on this recommendation.

Motion made by: Member Overton

Motion seconded by: Member Buttles

Motion passes: 10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

D5. The Subcommittee recommends that ADE, in collaboration with other appropriate partners, increase the family engagement elements embedded in Move On When Reading beyond the provision of letters to parents.

Motion made by: Member Buttles

Motion seconded by: Member Canto

Members had discussion on this recommendation

Motion passes: 10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes

Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

D6. The Subcommittee recommends that ADE, in collaboration with other appropriate partners, develop and provide trainings, resources, and supports regarding key education transitions, such as the move from preschool to kindergarten, kindergarten to first grade, etc.

Motion made by: Member Buttles

Motion seconded by: Member Overton

Members had discussion on this recommendation.

Motion passes: 10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

D7. The Subcommittee recommends that ADE, in collaboration with other appropriate partners, produce guidance on the braiding of multiple funding sources to support early literacy in the P-3 space.

Motion made by: Member Canto

Motion seconded by: Member Sheppard

Members had discussion on this recommendation.

Motion passes: 10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent

Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

E1. AS AMENDED The Subcommittee recommends that the Board adopt the Framework of Necessary Conditions for Raising the Move On When Reading cut score for promotion from third grade. These conditions include:

1. High-quality professional learning in literacy provided to and completed by all K-5 teachers and administrators
2. At least one highly-trained literacy coach to support teacher learning and the effective implementation of evidence-based reading practices in every school with K-3 students
3. Vetted, high-quality literacy instructional materials in use for grades K-3 in all schools
4. All elementary and special education teacher candidates receive high-quality coursework in evidence-based reading instruction and earn a passing grade on the Foundations of Reading exam
5. Legislation and state policies that support early literacy
6. A clear, transparent communication plan to build stakeholder buy-in on the rationale for raising the cut score
7. Literacy data to support the potential impact of a change to the cut score on student achievement

Members and Co-Facilitator Clark had discussion on this recommendation.

Motion made by: Member Canto

Motion seconded by: Member Buttles

Members and Co-Facilitator Clark had discussion on this recommendation.

Motion passes:10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

E2. The Subcommittee recommends that the Board adopt the Arizona Chronic Absenteeism Task Force’s recommendations to improve chronic absenteeism rates in Arizona.

Motion made by: Member Buttles

Motion seconded by: Member Clark

Members had discussion on this recommendation.

Motion passes: 10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

F1. AS AMENDED The Subcommittee recommends that the legislature increase funding for statewide training for P-3 educators in evidence-based reading practices for English language learners

Members had discussion on this recommendation.

Motion made by: Member Overton

Motion seconded by: Member Canto

Motion passes:10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

The Subcommittee members had discussion about potentially creating a recommendation regarding statewide funding for full-day Kindergarten.

F2. The Subcommittee recommends that the Board make the call for increased supports for early literacy in Pre-K to 3rd grade, including full-day Kindergarten, a focus of its legislative priorities.

Motion made by: Member Buttles

Motion seconded by: Member Sheppard

Motion passes:10-0

Subcommittee Member	Vote
Jessica Buttles	Yes
Dr. Angelina Canto	Yes
Chair Terri Clark	Yes
Dr. Felicia Durden	Yes
Katherine Haley	Yes
Vice Chair Julia Meyerson	Yes
Heather Overton	Yes
Janice Palmer	Yes
Tianna Sanchez	Absent
Dr. Duane Sheppard	Yes
Rachel Vaughn	Yes

Executive Director Ross presented on this agenda item.

Vice Chair Meyerson presented on this agenda item.

5. Summary of current events, future meeting dates and items for future agendas

Executive Director Ross presented on this agenda item.

Chair Clark adjourned the meeting at 10:48 am.