



## MEETING MINUTES

---

**Arizona State Board of Education  
Arizona State Board for Vocational and Technological Education**

**AMENDED**

**Agenda**

**NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona State Board of Education, the Arizona State Board for Vocational and Technological Education and to the general public that the Boards will hold a meeting, open to the public, on **Monday, February 24, 2020, at 10:00 A.M. at the Arizona Department of Education, Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson, Phoenix, AZ 85007.** A copy of the agenda for the meeting is attached. The Boards reserve the right to change the order of items on the agenda, with the exception of public hearings. One or more members of the Boards may participate telephonically. Agenda materials can be reviewed online at <http://azsbe.az.gov>

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02 (H), the Boards may discuss and take action concerning any matter listed on the agenda.


Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(2), the Boards may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3), the Boards may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consultation for legal advice concerning any item on this agenda.

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the State Board Office at (602) 542-5057. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

DATED AND POSTED this 20th day of February, 2020.

Arizona State Board of Education



By:

Alicia Williams

Executive Director

(602) 542-5057

10:00 a.m. CALL TO ORDER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND ROLL CALL

**Attendance**

---

Calvin Baker, Board Member  
Dr. Rita Cheng, Board Member  
Dr. Daniel Corr, Vice President  
Patricia Welborn, Board Member by phone  
Jill Broussard, Board Member  
Christine Burton, Board Member  
Michele Kaye, Board Member  
Janice Mak, Board Member  
Lucas Narducci, President  
Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Armando Ruiz, Board Member

**1. BUSINESS REPORTS**

**A. President's Report**

President Narducci recognized schools for their Achievement in Early Literacy.

**1. Recognition of Wildflower Elementary School, Lincoln Elementary School and Legacy Traditional School for their Achievement in Early Literacy**

**B. Superintendent's Report**

Superintendent Hoffman provided updates to the Board and then recognized the Arizona

History Teacher of the Year, awardees of the Presidential Award of Excellence in Math and Science Teaching, and ADE Employee. The Superintendent's report concluded with a report from the Student Advisory Council.

**1. Arizona History Teacher of the Year**

**2. Presidential Award of Excellence in Math and Science Teaching**

**3. ADE Employee Recognition**

**4. Student Advisory Council Report**

**C. Executive Director's Report**

President Narducci excused himself from the meeting for a short period starting at 10:15 a.m.

Executive Director Williams did not have any updates to report.

**2. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

**3. CONSENT AGENDA**

A motion was made to approve items 3A - 3E from the consent agenda.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Not Present

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**A. Approval of the addition of degrees to the degree matrix to meet the Subject Matter Expert certificate degree requirement and subject knowledge exam waiver**

**B. Approval of the Acceptance of a Donation by the Lifetime Foundation**

**C. UPDATED - Approval of the Move on When Reading (MOWR) local education agency (LEA) and charter school literacy plans for release of K-3 Reading Base - UPDATED**

**D. Approval of the appointment of Emily Anne Gullickson to the the Accountability Technical Advisory Committee**

**E. Approval of appointments to the Professional Practices Advisory Committee**

#### **4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Mark Joraanstad, representing the Arizona School Administrators, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Jonathan Rohloff, representing the Fowler School District/ATAC, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

#### **5. GENERAL SESSION**

##### **A. Presentation from the Center for the Future of Arizona on the Beat the Odds School Leadership Academy**

President Narducci re-entered the meeting at 10:43 a.m.

Amanda Burk, representing the Center for the Future of Arizona, presented information to the Board.

Superintendent Dr. Jo Etta Gonzales, representing Casa Grande Elementary, presented information to the Board.

Principal Eric Atuahene, representing Quentin STEM Academy, presented information to the Board.

##### **B. Presentation from the Murphy Elementary School District on the district's progress towards exiting financial receivership**

Dr. Cheng exited at 11:13 a.m.

Keith Kenny, representing Simon Consulting, presented information to the Board.

Superintendent Goodwin, representing Murphy Elementary School District, presented the Board.

##### **C. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Accountability System business rules for school year 2018-2019**

Wendy Davy, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board approve the 2018-2019 A-F Accountability Business Rules as attached.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**D. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the 2019-2020 and the 2020-2021 A-F Accountability System for traditional schools (K-8, 9-12)**

*The Board recessed at 11:24 a.m. and reconvened at 11:33 a.m.*

K-8 Acceleration/Readiness 8th Grade Math

A motion was made by Member Baker, seconded by Member Mak, to approve a 60% threshold for increasing highly proficient and 10% as a threshold for decreasing minimally proficient for the school years 2019-2020 and 2020-2021.

Motion passed 10-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Dr. Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

SPED Bonus Points

A motion was made that the State Board of Education approve Staggered Model A for Special Education Bonus Points for the SY19-20 and 20-21 and that the State Board of Education direct the Department of Education and State Board staff to look into the significant disparities of Special Education identification from one county to the next and bring the Board information on that including a breakdown by category of how those identifications are different.

Motion passed 6-4.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - No

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - No

Janice Mak - No

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - No

#### **E. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the A-F Accountability System for Arizona Online Instruction**

It is recommended the Board direct AOIs to report CCRI data to ADE and monitor and correct their A-F data as directed by ADE in order to allow for modeling in the Fall of 2020 and the presentation of an AOI A-F Accountability Model for adoption for the 2020-2021 school year.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**F. UPDATED - Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Article 10 and Article 11 School District Procurement - UPDATED**

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. Article 10 and Article 11 School District Procurement and file the rules with the Secretary of State pending approval from the Office of the Auditor General.

Motion made by: Dr. Daniel Corr

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**G. Presentation, discussion and possible action to close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-615.01, Special Education Endorsement**

It is recommended the Board close rulemaking procedures on A.A.C. R7-2-615.01, Special Education Endorsement

Motion made by: Christine Burton

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Not Present

Dr. Daniel Corr - Yes

Patricia Welborn - Yes

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**H. Update on rulemaking procedures A.A.C. R7-2-604, R7-2-604.03, R7-2-604.05, Alternative Educator Preparation Program Approval Process**

Executive Director Williams presented information to the Board.

**I. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals**

Dr. Cheng re-entered the meeting at 12:13 p.m.

Deputy Director Baden presented information to the Board.

**J. EXECUTIVE SESSION - Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Statewide Menu of Assessment Request For Proposal (RFP) Approval of Third-Party Evaluators in the 2020-2021 school year. Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(2), the Board may vote to convene in executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion or consideration of records exempt by law from public inspection.**

Dr. Corr made a motion, seconded by Dr. Mak, to move into to Executive Session. Motion passed.

Dr. Corr exited meeting at 12:22 p.m.

The Board met in Executive Session at 12:19 p.m. and reconvened at 12:26 p.m.

Member Welborn exited meeting at 12:26 p.m.

A motion was made to approve the qualifying third-party evaluator as presented in Executive Session.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Janice Mak

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**6. Arizona State Board of Education convening/acting as the Arizona State Board for Vocational and Technological Education for Items 6A only**

The Board convened as the Arizona State Board for Vocational and Technological Education.



**A. Approval of Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21st Century Act (Perkins V) State Plan**

Cathie Raymond, representing the Arizona Department of Education, presented information to the Board.

It is recommended that the Board approve the State Plan for Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the Twenty First Century Act (Perkins V).

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Dr. Rita Cheng

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**7. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

No Request to Speak forms were submitted.

**8. CONSENT AGENDA - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

President Narducci acknowledged that item 8A8 was removed prior to the meeting.

A motion was made to approve item 8A1 - 8A7.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Jill Broussard

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**A. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:**

**1. Samantha Brewer, Case no. C-2019-760**

**a. Samantha Brewer, Case no. C-2019-760 - Supporting Documents**

**2. Derrick Chipres, Case no. C-2019-774**

**a. Derrick Chipres, Case no. C-2019-774 - Supporting Documents**

**3. Earl Edwards, Case no. C-2019-765**

**a. Earl Edwards, Case no. C-2019-765 - Supporting Documents**

**4. Julie Humble, Case no. C-2018-129**

**a. Julie Humble, Case no. C-2018-129 - Supporting Documents**

**5. AMENDED - Merryl Joyce Lopido, Case no. C-2019-162 - AMENDED**

**a. Merryl Joyce Lopido, Case no. C-2019-162- Supporting Documents**

**6. Melinda Porter, Case no. C-2019-701**

**a. Melinda Porter, Case no. C-2019-701 - Supporting Documents**

**7. Stephanie Thiel, Case no. C-2018-614**

**a. Stephanie Thiel, Case no. C-2018-614 - Supporting Documents**

**8. REMOVED - Jeniel Towne, Case no. C-2020-000008 - REMOVED**

**9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Bill Holder, representing Kelly Milani, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Kelly Milani, representing herself , submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

Roger Frazier, representing Jose Jimenez, submitted a Call to the Public Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board

**10. GENERAL SESSION - CERTIFICATION ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS**

**A. Presentation, discussion and possible action to approve the Negotiated Settlement Agreements for:**

A motion was made to approve 10A1 - 10A9.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**1. Claudia Flores Bertoldo, Case no. C-2019-669**

a. Claudia Flores Bertoldo, Case no. C-2019-669 - Supporting Documents

**2. Glenn Eversole, Case no. C-2019-598**

a. Glenn Eversole, Case no. C-2019-598-Supporting Documents

**3. Robin Farrin, Case no. C-2019-693**

a. Robin Farrin, Case no. C-2019-693 - Supporting Documents

**4. Trisha Martinez, Case no. C-2019-667**

a. Trisha Martinez, Case no. C-2019-667 - Supporting Documents

**5. Kelly Milani, Case no. C-2018-363**

a. Kelly Milani, Case no. C-2018-363 - Supporting Documents

**6. Nicole Minerrose, Case no. C-2019-407**

a. Nicole Minerrose, Case no. C-2019-407 - Supporting Documents

**7. Gary Petersen, Case no. C-2019-136**

a. Gary Petersen, Case no. C-2019-136 - Supporting Documents

8. Brian Sargus, Case no. C-2019-169

a. Brian Sargus, Case no. C-2019-169 - Supporting Documents

9. Douglas Taylor, Case no. C-2019-688

a. Douglas Taylor, Case no. C-2019-688 - Supporting Documents

**B. Presentation discussion and possible action on the finding of fact, conclusion of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee for:**

**1. Presentation discussion and possible action on the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Luis Alvarez for a period of five years, Case No. C-2019-296**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to Revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Luis V. Alvarez, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

a. Luis Vidal Alvarez, Case No. C-2019-296 - Supporting Documents

**2. Presentation discussion and possible action on the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Jose Luis Jimenez for a period of five years, Case No. C-2019-164**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to Revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Jose Luis Jimenez, for a period of five years, and that all states and

territories be so notified.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Jill Broussard

Motion seconded by: Calvin Baker

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**a. Jose Luis Jimenez, Case No. C-2019-164 - Supporting Documents**

**3. Presentation, discussion and possible action on the Finding of Facts, Conclusions of Law and Recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Kildare Salazar for a period of five years, Case no. C-2019-626**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to Revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Kildare Salazar, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Michele Kaye

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**a. Kildare Salazar, Case No. C-2019-626 - Supporting Documents**

**4. Presentation discussion and possible action on the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to revoke the teaching certificate(s) of Joshua Snyder for a period of five years, Case no. C-2018-422, C-2018-367, C-2018-367-2**

It is recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and the Recommendation of the PPAC to Revoke any and all certificate(s) held by Joshua Snyder, for a period of five years, and that all states and territories be so notified.

Motion passed 9-0.

Motion made by: Calvin Baker

Motion seconded by: Janice Mak

Voting:

Calvin Baker - Yes

Dr. Rita Cheng - Yes

Dr. Daniel Corr - Not Present

Patricia Welborn - Not Present

Jill Broussard - Yes

Christine Burton - Yes

Michele Kaye - Yes

Janice Mak - Yes

Lucas Narducci - Yes

Kathy Hoffman - Yes

Armando Ruiz - Yes

**a. Joshua Snyder, Case No. C-2018-422, C-2018-367, C-2018-367-2- Supporting Documents**

**11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**

The next Board meeting is scheduled for March 23, 2020.

Meeting adjourned at 12:48 p.m.