

**ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION**  
**Regular Board Meeting, April 25, 2016**  
**Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson St.,**  
**Phoenix, AZ 85027**  
**SUMMARY OF BOARD ACTION**

<p><b>MEMBERS PRESENT:</b>  Vice President Ballantyne  Superintendent Douglas  Dr. Rottweiler (by phone)  Ms. Hamilton  Mr. Jacks  Mr. Carter  Mr. Taylor  Mr. Schmidt  Dr. Cheng</p>	<p><b>MEMBERS ABSENT:</b>   President Miller</p>
<p><b>CALL TO ORDER, NATIONAL ANTHEM, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, MOMENT OF SILENCE, AND ROLL CALL</b></p>	<p><b>Meeting called to order at 9:00 a.m. Color Guard presented by Central High School Junior Army ROTC. Zhaquise Anderson from Camelback High School played the National Anthem and a second song on his saxophone. Pledge of Allegiance, Moment of Silence and Roll Call; quorum confirmed.</b></p>
<p><b>1. BUSINESS REPORTS</b></p> <p><b>A. President’s Report</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>1. Introduction of Dr. Rita H. Cheng</b></li> <li><b>2. Scheduling of summer retreat</b></li> </ol>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/00:06:10)</p> <p><b>In President Miller’s absence, Vice President Ballantyne conducted the meeting.</b></p> <p><b>Vice President Ballantyne introduced new Board Member Dr. Rita Cheng, President of Northern Arizona University, who provided a summary of her background and qualifications.</b></p> <p><b>Vice President Ballantyne reported, and Director Schmidt confirmed, the Board’s annual retreat is scheduled for June 13<sup>th</sup> at the Flinn Foundation in Phoenix with a Board gathering to follow. Notice will be posted prior to the event.</b></p>
<p><b>B. Superintendent’s report</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>1. Ms. Cadi Angeli – Sonoran Trials Middle School, Cave Creek SD – State Counselor Award</b></li> <li><b>2. Ms. Katherine Pastor – Flagstaff SD – National Counselor Award</b></li> </ol>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/00:11:00)</p> <p><b>Superintendent Douglas presented awards to the listed recipients.</b></p>
<p><b>C. Board Member Reports</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>1. Academic Standards updates - Jared Taylor</b></li> </ol>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/00:18:12)</p> <p><b>Member Taylor provided an update on the Arizona Standards Development Committee. Member Taylor also noted that the Standards Committee has a vacancy for a member who is the parent of a high school student. The application will be open by the end of the week for all interested parties.</b></p>

ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Regular Board Meeting, April 25, 2016

Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson St.,

Phoenix, AZ 85027

SUMMARY OF BOARD ACTION

<p><b>D. Executive Director's Report</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Policy development updates</li><li>2. Investigative Unit updates</li><li>3. Education learning and accountability system quarterly reports</li><li>4. Updates regarding requests for video streaming of Board meetings</li></ol>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/00:23:30)</p> <p>Executive Director Schmidt introduced Pearl Chang Esau from Expect More Arizona, who provided information on the Progress Meter to the Board.</p> <p>Director Schmidt provided additional updates on policy developments, on the status/progress of the Investigative Unit, the education learning and accountability system quarterly reports and an update regarding requests for video streaming of Board meetings by the Superintendent.</p> <p>Member Rottweiler also requested an update on the Arizona Student Longitudinal Data System.</p>
<p><b>2. CONSENT AGENDA</b></p> <p>All items on the Consent Agenda will be considered by a single motion with no discussion, unless an item is removed and discussed as a regular agenda item upon the request of any Board member.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>A. Approval of additional monies for Teacher Compensation for the fiscal year 2016-2017</li><li>B. Approval to receive 2016 state aid and budget capacity due to the Capital Transportation Adjustment for Small School Districts</li><li>C. Approval of Move On When Ready qualification scores for the Arizona World History Spring 2016 administration</li><li>D. Approval of the permanent revocation of any and all educator certificates, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-550, held by:<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Ryan Robert Raths</li><li>2. Murat Ahmet Alev</li></ol></li></ol>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/00:46:21)</p> <p>Superintendent Douglas removed Item 2E2 and all of Item F from the Consent Agenda. Vice President Ballantyne stated the removed items will be revisited after the remainder of the agenda is heard.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>MOTION</u></b></p> <p><i>Member Jacks made a motion, seconded by Member Carter to approve the remaining items, 2A, 2B, 2C, 2D1,2, 2E1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 on the Consent Agenda</i></p> <p style="text-align: center;">Motion passed unanimously.</p> <p>Vice President Ballantyne opted to hear the remaining agenda items and return to the Consent Agenda item 2E2 and all of item 2F after General Session.</p>

**ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION**

Regular Board Meeting, April 25, 2016

Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson St.,

Phoenix, AZ 85027

**SUMMARY OF BOARD ACTION**

<p><b>E. Approval of the voluntary surrender of the educator certificates held by:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Alden Edward Young</li> <li>2. <del>Angel Roman Verdugo</del></li> <li>3. Grant L. Turley</li> <li>4. James McNamee</li> <li>5. Lilian Houston</li> <li>6. Humberto R. Gutierrez</li> <li>7. Steven M. Grant</li> <li>8. Douglas A. Cline</li> <li>9. Douglas Eugene Clapp</li> </ol> <p><del><b>F. Approval of negotiated settlement agreements held by:</b></del></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <del>Christopher M. Rice</del></li> <li>2. <del>Gordon Ray</del></li> <li>3. <del>Donna M. Colson</del></li> <li>4. <del>Catherine Mary Ballman</del></li> <li>5. <del>Brandon Brothers</del></li> </ol>	
<p><b>3. CALL TO THE PUBLIC</b>          This is the time for the public to comment. Members of the Board may not discuss items that are not specifically identified on the agenda. Therefore, pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.01(H), action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date.</p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/00:47:41)</p> <p><b>Merri Zohar submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.</b></p> <p><b>Kelley Murphy submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.</b></p> <p><b>Joe Geusic submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.</b></p>
<p><b>4. GENERAL SESSION</b></p> <p><b>A. Presentation and discussion regarding the Performance Audit of the Arizona Department of Education K-3 Reading Program.</b></p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/00:59:31)</p> <p><b>Mr. Jeff Grove, Performance Audit Manager, Arizona Auditor General’s Office, presented information to the Board.</b></p>
<p><b>B. Presentation, discussion and possible consideration to approve the request of Phoenix Elementary School District No. 1 to assume accounting responsibility, pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-914.01.</b></p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/01:15:40)</p> <p align="center"><b><u>MOTION</u></b></p> <p><b><i>Member Jacks made a motion, seconded by Member Carter to approve Phoenix Elementary School District No. 1 to assume accounting responsibility for the fiscal year beginning July 1, 2016.</i></b></p> <p align="center"><b>Motion passed unanimously.</b></p>

ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Regular Board Meeting, April 25, 2016

Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson St.,

Phoenix, AZ 85027

SUMMARY OF BOARD ACTION

<p><b>C. Presentation and discussion regarding legislative affairs. The Board may take action to support, oppose or remain neutral on specific legislative proposals.</b></p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part I/01:18:24)</p> <p><b>Brooke White from Axiom presented information and responded to questions regarding legislative matters affecting the State Board of Education.</b></p>
<p><b>D. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the retention status of third grade students who read significantly below grade level for the 2016-2017 school year as determined by scores on the third grade English Language Arts AzMERIT exam due to delayed receipt of AzMERIT scores.</b></p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part I/01:24:00)</p> <p><b>Carol Lippert presented information to the Board.</b></p> <p><b>Dr. Leila Williams presented information to the Board.</b></p> <p><b>Becky Hill, from Scottsdale Unified School District, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.</b></p> <p><b>Ed Sanchez, from Stand for Children, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.</b></p> <p><b>Dr. Suzie Deprez, Assistant Superintendent of Mesa Public Schools, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.</b></p> <p><b>Ildi Lascko-Kerr, from Arizona Carter Association, submitted a Call to the Public, Request to Speak Form and addressed the Board.</b></p> <p><b>Mark Joraanstad, Superintendent of Saddle Mountain USD #90, submitted a written Call to the Public and provided copies to the Board.</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>MOTION</u></b></p> <p><b>Member Rottweiler made a motion, seconded by Member Jacks that the Board move forward and approve option 1 to implement the retention practices as defined by A.R.S. §15-701 with no adjustments.</b></p> <p><i>Member Taylor is opposed to the motion as it stands.</i></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>AMENDMENT TO THE MOTION</u></b></p> <p><b>Member Taylor made a motion, seconded by Superintendent Douglas to provide direction to the Arizona Department of Education allowing an LEA to use all of the reading assessment data available in determining the</b></p>

ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Regular Board Meeting, April 25, 2016

Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson St.,

Phoenix, AZ 85027

SUMMARY OF BOARD ACTION

	<p><i>promotion or retention of a student, consistent with A.R.S. §15-521 and all current statutes relevant to promotions/retention are included.</i></p> <p>Amendment to the Motion passed 8-1. Member Carter voted no</p> <p><b><u>AMENDED MOTION</u></b></p> <p>The Board approves option 1 to implement retention practices as defined by A.R.S. § 15-701 with no adjustments and <i>provide direction to the Arizona Department of Education allowing an LEA to use all of the reading assessment data available in determining the promotion or retention of a student, consistent with A.R.S. §15-521 and all current statutes relevant to promotions/retention are included.</i></p> <p>Motion failed 2-7.</p> <p>Member Carter voted no and explained his vote. Member Cheng, Member Hamilton, Member Jacks, Member Rottweiler and Member Schmidt voted no. Vice President Ballantyne abstained.</p> <p><b><u>FINAL AMENDED MOTION</u></b></p> <p>Member Rottweiler made a motion, seconded by Member Carter to implement retention practices as defined by A.R.S. § 15-701 with no adjustments and encouraged Board staff to work with the office of the Attorney General to issue a letter to provide districts [with] guidance on current existing statutes.</p> <p>Motion passes 7-2. Superintendent Douglas and Member Taylor voted no.</p> <p>Member Rottweiler exited the meeting at 12:17 p.m.</p> <p>Vice President Ballantyne took a recess at 12:17 p.m. Meeting reconvened at 12:27 p.m.</p>
--	---

ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Regular Board Meeting, April 25, 2016

Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson St.,

Phoenix, AZ 85027

SUMMARY OF BOARD ACTION

<p><b>G. Presentation, discussion and possible action to accept the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to deny the application for certification of Allan Smith.</b></p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/03:17:50)</p> <p>There was a request by Allan Smith and his counsel, and Vice President Ballantyne agreed, to hear item 4G out of sequence.</p> <p>Eric Schwarz, Assistant Attorney General, presented information to the Board.</p> <p>Gary Wieser, attorney for Mr. Smith, presented information to the Board.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>MOTION</u></b></p> <p>Member Carter made a motion, seconded by Member Schmidt, that the Board accept the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the PPAC to deny the application for certification of Allan Smith, and that all states and territories be so notified.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Motion passed unanimously.</b></p>
<p><b>E. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding creation of a Career and Technical Education Task Force to develop policy recommendations on the Career and College Pathway and on career literacy.</b></p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/03:51:49)</p> <p>Director Schmidt presented information to the Board.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>MOTION</u></b></p> <p><i>Member Carter made a motion, seconded by Member Taylor, that the Board create a Career and Technical Education Task Force to develop policy recommendations for adoption on the Career and College Pathway and career literacy.</i></p> <p>Vice President Ballantyne announced that President Miller appointed himself, Mr. Carter and Mr. Jacks to a task force.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Motion passed 7-1.</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Superintendent Douglas voted no and explained her vote.</b></p>

**ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION**  
**Regular Board Meeting, April 25, 2016**  
**Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson St.,**  
**Phoenix, AZ 85027**  
**SUMMARY OF BOARD ACTION**

<p><b>F. Presentation, discussion and possible action to revise the Arizona Framework for Measuring Educator Effectiveness.</b></p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/03:57:19)</p> <p><b>Member Schmidt exited the meeting at 1:10 p.m.</b></p> <p><b>Member Hamilton presented information to the Board.</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>MOTION</u></b></p> <p><i>Member Hamilton made a motion, seconded by Member Carter that the Board revise the Arizona Framework for Measuring Educator Effectiveness as described [adding the following language to page 14 under 'Additional Instruction and Recommendations to LEAs' for the Arizona Framework for Measuring Educator Effectiveness effective for the 2016-17 school year: "LEAs shall include all students for whom valid and reliable data exists."].</i></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Motion passed unanimously.</b></p>
<p><b>H. Presentation, discussion and possible action to accept the findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommendation of the Professional Practices Advisory Committee to suspend the certification of Maria Giles.</b></p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/03:59:10)</p> <p><b>Eric Schwarz, Assistant Attorney General, presented information to the Board.</b></p> <p><b>Ms. Giles appeared by phone.</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>MOTION</u></b></p> <p><i>Member Taylor made a motion, seconded by Member Jacks, to adopt the recommendation of the PPAC and suspend any and all certificates held by Maria Giles, for three years, and that all states and territories be so notified.</i></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Motion passed 6-1.</b></p> <p><b>Superintendent Douglas explained her no vote.</b></p>





**ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION**

**Regular Board Meeting, April 25, 2016**

**Room 122, 1535 W. Jefferson St.,**

**Phoenix, AZ 85027**

**SUMMARY OF BOARD ACTION**

<p>vote to convene in executive session for discussion or consultation for legal advice on this item.</p>	
<p><b>6. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS, FUTURE MEETING DATES AND ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS.</b> The executive director, presiding officer or a member of the Board may present a brief summary of current events pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.02(K), and may discuss future meeting dates and direct staff to place matters on a future agenda. The Board will not discuss or take action on any current event summary.</p>	<p>Recorded comments are available (Part 1/04:36:34)</p> <p><b>Vice President Ballantyne thanks everyone for participating in and contributing to the process of the Board meetings, specifically item 4D in today's meeting.</b></p> <p><b>Superintendent Douglas requests that if the Study Session is going to be tabled and convened at a later date that the Board receive preliminary information prior to the Study Session, to base discussions on how to move forward.</b></p> <p><b>Superintendent Douglas suggests the Board discuss whether or not they are in favor of video broadcasting future meetings prior to acquiring cost information.</b></p> <p><b>Member Carter requests a Draft of the Retreat Agenda at the next meeting, as well.</b></p> <p><b>Member Taylors asks if it will be too early to get a Statewide summary of the AZMerit test scores at the next Board meeting. If so, he would request the information be made available at the June Board meeting.</b></p>
<p><b>ADJOURN</b></p>	<p><b>Meeting adjourned at 1:52 p.m.</b></p>